

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: January 19,2021

Location: Zoom Teleconference

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Members present: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent:

I. AGENDA

1. Minutes of the December 15 ,2020 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 3401 St. Charles Ave.

Application: 115-unit mixed-use development with ground floor commercial space fronting St. Charles and Louisiana Avenue.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer action on this application until the ARC's next regularly scheduled meeting. At that time the ARC made the following comments and recommendations:

- The building type does not correspond with large scale residential buildings found along St. Charles Ave. Large scale buildings are typically U-shaped with ground level open space fronting the Avenue. This is exemplified by the building at the corner of St. Charles Ave and Toledano St.
- Add canopies above the transom level at all storefront conditions.
- Consider recessing the single story portions of the building along Louisiana Avenue to allow for publicly accessible open space that could be used for exterior seating for the adjacent commercial uses.
- The architectural language of the 4 story portion of the building is more successful than that of the 5 story portion. In particular, the openings at the 5th floor are too close to the cornice. Consider setting back the 5th floor so that the building reads as a 4 story building.

- The large scale arches are not appropriate outside of the Central Business District.

Additionally, the ARC advised consulting with the Board of Zoning Adjustments to ensure that the two reviews are moving forward in a mutually beneficial manner. I will reach out in the coming days to facilitate this meeting.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 901 Poland Ave.

Application: Structural renovation of an existing single family residential building to include the infill of an existing side porch.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend the Commission approve the application with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC made the following comments:

- Maintain the existing columns on the side porch and add intermediate supports for mounting screen as necessary.
- Incorporate appropriate detailing for water to drain from screened porch.
- New windows to be 6 over 6 to match existing windows.
- Alter the design such that the proposal better reflects the existing historic window to wall ratio as well as window spacing and rhythm. Consider mirroring the bathroom layout such that the windows would open to the porch side of the building.

Second: Beth Jacobs

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 1301 Montegut St.

Application: New construction of a two-family residential building and an accessory structure on a vacant lot.

Motion: Beth Jacobs made a motion to recommend the Commission approve the application with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC made the following comments:

- Increase the window-to-wall ratio of the proposal by adding windows to the side elevations.
- Building appears to have inconsistent proportions to the context. Increase building height by raising the roof of the structure and maintaining the proposed pitch.

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 1307 Montegut St.

Application: New construction of a two-family residential building and an accessory structure on a vacant lot.

Motion: Beth Jacobs made a motion to recommend the Commission approve the application with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC made the following comments:

- Increase the window-to-wall ratio of the proposal by adding windows to the side elevations.

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 1309-11 Montegut St.

Application: New construction of a single-family residential building.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to Defer the application for additional ARC review. The ARC made the following comments:

- The proportion of the garage door on the front elevation appears too low. Increase the height of that garage door.
- Create a covering for the roof deck such that it ties in with the other roof angles on the building.

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 538 Soraparu St.

Application: New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Beth Jacobs made the motion to recommend the Commission approve the application with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC made the following comments:

- The floor to floor ceiling height should be 11'-0" at the first and second floor, the head heights of the windows should be adjusted accordingly.
- The front door should be centered on the steps.
- You may reconsider the height of the full-height windows to coincide with the height of the windows on the side elevation, if you decide to keep the full height windows then a railing will be required.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Approve

In favor Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 2350 Rousseau St.

Application: Installation of new roof deck on three-story, residential building.

Motion: Amanda Rivera made the motion to recommend the Commission approve the application with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Approve

In favor Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 933 Terpsichore St.

Application: New construction of a two-story residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: John Klingman made the motion to defer this application for additional review. There were some fundamental issues with the proposed design that the ARC could not support. The building design was not cohesive and did not respond to the surrounding context. A single building style should be pursued, and the massing should be simplified. The garage door opening at the front elevation is acontextual and will need to be further studied. The ARC requested that 3D perspective drawings of the building in its context would be required for the next review.

Second: Cynthia Dubberly

Result: Defer

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 714 Alvar St.

Application: New construction of a two-story, single family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Tracie Ashe made a motion to recommend the Commission approve the application with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC made the following comments:

- The setback is not appropriate for the context. Move the proposed building towards the street such that the steps begin at the front property line.
- Front porch should be a minimum of 6'-0" in depth.
- Add windows to the side elevations.
- The mechanical units should be relocated to the ground such that they are not visible from the public right of way.
- Window and door headers are to align throughout the proposal.

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 1215 Feliciana St.

Application: New construction of a one-story, two family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to recommend the Commission approve the application with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC made the following comments:

- All windows throughout should reflect the same proportions of the 2 over 2 windows on the front portion of the building.
- Add a window to the left side elevation near the front wall of the building

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 717 Teche St.

Application: New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Beth Jacobs made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with final details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that most of the recommendations from the previous review have been addressed; however, the style of the building is still out of context, as double-gallery buildings with entablatures are uncommon in this neighborhood. The entablature is also too large and ornamental compared to the modest, relatively simple buildings in the surrounding area. The ARC suggested that removing the entablature entirely in favor of a hipped roof would make the building more appropriate to its context in both respects. The entablature may be acceptable if the detailing were simplified and the size reduced. In addition, the ARC found the columns to be too wide from the front and too skinny from the side and suggested an 8x6 columns size. The roof over the side porch should be a standing seam or 5V-crimp metal instead of asphalt shingles.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 719 Teche St.

Application: New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Beth Jacobs made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with final details to be worked out at the Staff level. The style of the building is out of context, as double-gallery buildings with entablatures are uncommon in this neighborhood. The entablature is also too large and ornamental compared to the modest, relatively simple buildings in the surrounding area. The ARC suggested that removing the entablature entirely in favor of a hipped roof would make the building more appropriate to its context in both respects. The entablature may be acceptable if the detailing were simplified and the size reduced. In addition, the ARC found the columns to be too wide from the front and too skinny from the side and suggested an 8x6 columns size. The roof over the side porch should be a standing seam or 5V-crimp metal instead of asphalt shingles.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 244 Elmira Ave.

Application: New construction of a three-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberley made a motion to defer the application for further review. The ARC noted that the proposed design does not relate enough to the context. The scale and massing of the building, including the steep pitch of the roof, is not sensitive to the one- and two-story buildings that are predominant in the neighborhood. The design needs to be revised so that it is more contextual and relates more to the general patterns and conditions in the surrounding area, rather than picking out specific instances from individual buildings to support the current design. Additionally, the building currently reads more as a collection of separate elements than one integrated design. The design should be further studied to develop a more cohesive approach in both the relationship of the individual volumes and the use of materials and detailing throughout. The ARC felt that the building also needs to be rendered in three-dimensions in order to better understand how the building will look and how the different elements of the building come together. They requested that 3D-renderings be submitted for the next review.

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

15. 302 Olivier St.

Application: Renovation of a two-story residential building including window modifications and addition of new side porch.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to defer further review until the SHPO review comments have been received. The ARC agreed that the restoration of the original doorways and columns was appropriate and supported by the historic photograph; however, the addition of the windows on the front façade was not appropriate as there is no evidence of historic windows in those locations and they give the building a more residential character than it had originally. Smaller, simpler windows may be acceptable as they would read more as a later addition and not an original element of the building. The railing at the first floor should also be eliminated if not required for code, as it implies a historic condition that did not originally exist.

Regarding the side porch, the ARC recommended that the width be reduced so that it is the same width as one-bay of the existing gallery. It would also help if the porch were set further back from the front façade, as the projection of the roof ends up almost flush with that wall. Additionally, the porch columns look wide; the dimensions of those columns should be reduced. The ARC noted that as a tax credit project, the SHPO is likely to have requirements regarding the modifications to the building, particularly non-original elements like the window openings at the front façade and the new porch. those comments have been received.

Second: Beth Jacobs

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

16. 910 St. Roch Ave.

Application: Replace two (2) non-original facade windows and three (3) non-original right-side elevation windows with new double-hung 6/6 recess-mounted TDL wood windows installed into new larger openings. Windows on facade to be re-centered. Work includes installation of new operable front door transom and new operable wood louvered window and door shutters.

Motion: Beth Jacobs made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level with a proviso that if evidence of different sized windows is discovered from the interior then the application should return for additional Staff review. The ARC also agreed that the proposed elevations are a great improvement over the current condition.

Second: Cynthia Duberly

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

17. 2359 St. Claude Ave.

Application: Request to modify storefront of existing non-contributing one-story commercial building due to hurricane damage.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberly made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC also agreed that the brick veneer proposed for the façade was more interesting than the previous stucco condition.

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

18. 511 Slidell St.

Application: Renovation including construction of new camelback addition.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with final details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC found the massing of the proposed camelback to be appropriate to the historic building. They agreed that squaring off the camelback, rather than maintaining the cut-out found in the existing floor plan, would also be appropriate. They suggested adding windows to the front façade of the camelback as there is currently a lot of blank wall space. Two windows, one on each side, would be preferable, but one window at the bedroom would also work. The trim band below the camelback's gable should be eliminated and the siding should extend all the way up.

Second: Beth Jacobs

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:
Comments: