

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: February 15, 2022

Location: Zoom Teleconference

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Members present: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent:

I. AGENDA

1. Minutes of the January 18, 2022 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 500 Piety St

Application: New construction of a six-story mixed-use building on a vacant lot. Massing and design changes to previously-approved five-story mixed-use commercial building proposal.

Motion: Defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- The use of brick and overall articulation presented a deviation from a clean industrial appearance to a decorative overly stylized building. Utilize more contemporary uses of brick for precedent.
- Use a more cohesive design approach for the prominence of the site itself. Overall, the building might be too massive for the site.
- Potentially move the building away from the bridge and locate parking on either side to give space between the existing bridge and the proposed building.
- The penthouse no longer reads as such and presents as an additional two stories on the box form of the main building. The flush glazing at this area should be pulled back 6-8' from the exterior wall.
- The change in size of side elevation windows, diminishing the ratio between glass and brick, is an unfavorable revision.
- Lessening the amount of covered outdoor space is viewed as a negative.

By: John Klingman

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 2230 Magazine St

Application: New construction of a 15,000 SF, three-story, mixed-use building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Conceptual approval of the massing with the details to be worked out at the ARC level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The parapet wall on the two-story portions should be lowered and a railing installed behind to lower the overall height of the massing.
- The roof overhang on the third-floor portion should be removed at the front façade.
- The car entrance at the front façade should have further detailing that creates more visual interest. The ARC noted that plantings, a designed metal mesh screen, or using more of the storefront materials would be appropriate.
- The balcony on the left, front façade should be the full length of the openings.
- Include operable glazing on the second-floor front façade.
- Awnings or overhangs that align with the balconies should be added to the second-floor.
- The shadow lines that give the façade depth should be maintained when the detail drawings are submitted.

By: John Klingman

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 1240 Seventh St

Application: New construction of a 3,300 SF two-story, single-family residential building with off-street parking including demolition of an existing non-contributing two-story, single-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- The revised articulation of the front façade is not successful as shown because the desired off-street parking space is still creating an atypical and narrow building massing that is not compatible with the proposed 3-bay double-gallery Greek Revival style building. The ARC also agreed the precedent examples provided were not successfully replicated in the proposed design because the proportions are so altered.
- The applicant should consider other architectural treatments for the front façade that may be more compatible with the narrow proportions of the lot and the proposed massing. The ARC recommended the applicant study the design, detailing and proportions of 1376 Camp and 1131 Terpsichore Streets, particularly their use of a covered porch rather than a double gallery.

- Shutters would be a welcome addition to the front elevation; however, they are not required and would likely not fit on the façade given the current proposed window sizes and locations.
- The window placement on the left and right-side elevations should be further studied including the addition of at least two windows on each side.

By: Cynthia Dubberly

Second: Beth Jacobs

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 1244 Seventh St

Application: New construction of a 3,300 SF two-story, single-family residential building with off-street parking including demolition of an existing non-contributing two-story, single-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- There is still a lack of coherence in the fenestration patterns at the side walls of the building, particularly on the highly visible Chestnut Street side. The pattern of window openings and alignments between the 1st and 2nd floors should be further studied including the addition of at least two windows on each side.

By: Beth Jacobs

Second: Cynthia Dubberly

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 1519 Basin St

Application: New construction of a 5,000 SF, four-story, multi-family building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Defer the application for further study. The ARC requested 3D renderings that include the context, as well as a larger context drawing that shows more of the neighboring buildings. The ARC agreed that wall to opening ration was not appropriate and that more windows should be added, especially on the front façade. The balconies should be extended further to the left to align with the pergola on the first-floor. The ARC stated that the fourth-floor massing should be set back from the front wall of the building. Verify the front property line setback with Zoning.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 420 Alix St

Application: Modifications to previously approved plans at front facade of two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Conceptual approval with details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- The proposed dentils are not appropriate for the building.
- The proposed front façade gallery columns are too ornate.
- “Cleaning up” the masonry piers with proposed work is acceptable.
- Adding the left column is acceptable.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 819 Belleville St

Application: Construction of a 1,000 SF two-story addition at rear of two-family residential building.

Motion: Conceptual approval with details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC agreed that the addition should be stepped in on each side 10-12” to show it is an addition to the existing structure and that the applicant work with staff to make sure window sizes and selection is appropriate.

By: John Klingman

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 920 Congress St

Application: Renovation of existing one-story, single-family residential building and new construction of two-story rear addition.

Motion: Conceptual approval with consideration of gable roof for hyphen piece to be considered and details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC asked that the connecting piece follow the roof line and include the gable where the square box is at the roof line now.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 417 Tricou St

Application: Renovation and camelback addition at an existing one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- A three-dimensional elevation and a context drawing are needed to assess visibility concerns.

- The height of the camelback needs to be lowered.
- The extension of the camelback both upward and to the sides of the existing house is too overwhelming for the size of a single shotgun. Massing should be adjusted.
- The ARC suggested only adding the second-story camelback that is the same width as the existing house or adding a one-story addition that bumps out to the side, not both.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed: None

Comments:

11. 3432-34 Magazine St

Application: Relocation of existing one-story, commercial building and construction of new camelback addition.

Motion: Conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at staff level.

By: John Klingman

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 3416-18 Dauphine St

Application: New construction of a 3,500 SF, two-story two-family residential building.

Motion: Conceptual approval with notes and adjustments to be worked out at Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- Building height needs to be increased, possibly to 12' at first floor, to meet height of neighboring two-story buildings.
- Adding a transom over the front façade entry door and raising window header heights might be required to accommodate the change in first floor height.
- Second story window at recessed area on right-side elevation should be changed from slip-head window to another window type.
- Move the entry door at the recessed area to be more centered at this portion.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 1507 Esplanade Ave

Application: New construction of a 4,361 SF, two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Defer the application for further study. The ARC agreed that the ADA ramp that is required for the building type should be worked out along with the secondary porch. The ARC stated that removing the secondary porch and continuing with a single-bump out would provide more room for the ADA ramp and allow the ramp to meet at the side of the front porch rather than the side entrance. The ARC also agreed that the finished floor height of the first floor should be no taller than 3', which will allow the ADA ramp to be shorter. The ARC noted that the windows throughout the proposed building should be simplified including using less window types, aligning windows vertically, and adding more windows near the front. The windows on the second-floor façade should be taller with square tops and the header heights should align with the door. The door at the side entrance should face the street.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 906 Philip St

Application: Renovation and camelback addition at existing one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Conceptual approval of the massing with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

15. 702 Washington Ave

Application: Renovation and camelback addition at existing one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at staff level. The ARC agreed that a shed awning over the new door on the left side of the house was more appropriate than the hipped awnings.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

16. 2820-22 St Thomas St

Application: Renovation and camelback addition at existing one-story, two-family residential building, including the demolition of the existing rear addition and camelback.

Motion: Conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at staff level. The ARC agreed that continuing the roof and moving the new HVAC to the rear was the more appropriate option. The ARC recommended lowering the floor-to-ceiling height of the second floor to lower the overall massing. The windows at the front of the camelback should be 2-over-2 to match the front façade.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

17. 3229 St Thomas St

Application: New construction of a 2,042 SF, two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at staff level. The ARC stated that the floor-to-ceiling heights on both floors should be raised to 11' to be more in line with the neighboring building. The ARC agreed that the windows at the front façade should be taller and that the front door needs a transom. The diamond shaped windows should be centered between the window and the wall.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

18. 611 Pleasant St

Application: New construction of a 1,850 SF, two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Defer the application for further study. The ARC stated that the cutout porch was not contextual within the neighborhood. The ARC agreed that the proposed new construction at 3229 St Thomas was more successful in the treatment of the porch and front façade elements and recommended that 611 Pleasant be similar.

By: John Klingman

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

19. 3517 Chartres, Lot K2A

Application: New construction of three-story, single-family commercial short term rental building.

Motion: Defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- Roof terrace is not successful in proposed configuration. A larger parapet or cornice could accommodate this detail but cannot be roofing getting cut off.
- Proportions of the front façade double gallery need further study.
- Perhaps accommodations for the required program are better suited for a more modern approach rather than traditional vocabulary throughout. A little more freedom to experiment in this area of Chartres Street.
- Transoms above windows is not a typical condition and should be eliminated. Uneven sashes for windows do not work for the style.

- Particular attention should be paid to the right-side corner property elevation and what is visible from the public right-of-way.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

20. 3517 Chartres, Lot K2B

Application: New construction of three-story, single-family commercial short term rental building.

Motion: Defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- Roof terrace is not successful in proposed configuration. A larger parapet or cornice could accommodate this detail but cannot be roofing getting cut off.
- Proportions of the front façade double gallery need further study.
- Perhaps accommodations for the required program are better suited for a more modern approach rather than traditional vocabulary throughout. A little more freedom to experiment in this area of Chartres Street.
- Transoms above windows is not a typical condition and should be eliminated. Uneven sashes for windows do not work for the style.
- Particular attention should be paid to the right-side corner property elevation and what is visible from the public right-of-way.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

21. 3517 Chartres, Lot K2C

Application: New construction of three-story, single-family commercial short term rental building.

Motion: Defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- Roof terrace is not successful in proposed configuration. A larger parapet or cornice could accommodate this detail but cannot be roofing getting cut off.
- Proportions of the front façade double gallery need further study.
- Perhaps accommodations for the required program are better suited for a more modern approach rather than traditional vocabulary throughout. A little more freedom to experiment in this area of Chartres Street.
- Transoms above windows is not a typical condition and should be eliminated. Uneven sashes for windows do not work for the style.
- Particular attention should be paid to the right-side corner property elevation and what is visible from the public right-of-way.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

22. 1220 Louisa St

Application: Renovation and construction of 1,500 SF addition at rear of one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- Alter the proposed roof form to break up the long low pitch. Having the area read as a hyphen rather than a singular roof form might be helpful.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

23. 1378-80 Magazine St

Application: Renovation and camelback addition at existing one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Conceptual approval with details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: John Klingman

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: : Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed: None

Comments:

24. 510 Spain St

Application: New construction of 2,660 SF, two-story, single-family residential building on a sub-standard size vacant lot.

Motion: Conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- The overall massing appears top-heavy without street-facing windows in the camelback and the ARC recommend at least one window be installed at this location.
- The first floor appears to be too short, and the floor-to-ceiling height should be increased by a minimum of 1'-0".

By: Cynthia Dubberly

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

25. 805 Louisa St

Application: New construction of 270 SF gallery at right side elevation of two-story, mixed-use building.
Motion: Defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the balcony as presented was not a condition that is typically approved. A covered balcony with a low-pitched metal roof or cantilevered condition rather than something with columns extending to the ground is preferable.

By: John Klingman

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

26. 4551 Burgundy St

Application: New construction of two-story, 4,500 SF commercial building on a vacant lot.
Motion: Conceptual approval with details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the window above the double entry doors at the front façade is too close to the roof structure and should be revised. If mechanical equipment is visible at roof location, screening should be provided.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

27. 1032 Montegut St

Application: New construction of one-story, two-family residential building.
Motion: Conceptual approval with comments discussed and details to be worked out at Staff level and details can be worked out with ARC if necessary. The ARC agreed that:

- The face of the front porch, with the proposed five (5) steps, should be eight (8) feet back from the sidewalk rather than the proposed 15 feet.
- Side elevation windows would be better if one-over-one and must have even sash heights.
- Windows at front façade elevation should either extend to the floor or be raised up but not in between.
- Casings and trim should meet at the transom.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: