

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission  
Architectural Review Committee  
Meeting Minutes

Date: April 19, 2022

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, LA, 70112.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Members present: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent: John Klingman

---

## I. AGENDA

1. Minutes of the March 22 and March 29, 2022 meetings

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 3500 St Charles Ave

Application: Dynasty Properties LLC, owner; Final detail review of previously approved new construction of a 30,000 SF five-story hotel building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the final details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that any plaster/stucco control joints necessary on the façade must be integrated into the overall design.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 2850 Annunciation St

Application: Renovate and construct new second-floor addition at existing two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Defer the application for further study. The ARC stated that the new two-story massing should be the same width as the existing one-story addition. The ARC agreed that the new windows should be 6-over-6, rather than 9-over-9, and that the existing 9-over-9 windows should not be relocated to the right elevation of the historic building.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 1220 Kerlerrec St

Application: New construction of a three-story, two-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at staff level.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 1243-45 N Robertson St

Application: New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at staff level. The ARC noted that there were quite a few drawing errors that needed to be resolved for the final drawings including the entablature not matching on either side, offset transom at front door, railings going through columns and needing a bottom rail, etc. The ARC stated that the rear massing should be inset 6" on either side of the main front massing and have corner boards at the transition. The ARC agreed that two separate, narrower dormers would be more appropriate. The shutter at the front door should be louvered rather than board and batten and the window and door cornices should be enlarged and further articulated. The ARC also suggested recessing the front door to give it more prominence.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 805 Louisa St

Application: New construction of 270 SF gallery at right side elevation of two-story, mixed-use building.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the following changes should be made:

- Include hips at the sides of the balcony to read as a hipped roof.

- Shorten the length of the balcony at the right/rear portion so that it does not extend over the window in that location.
- Balcony posts should be respaced to accommodate the change in length.
- The left/front side of the balcony should be moved slightly to the right to move it away from the existing first window shutter.
- Balcony columns are to be trimmed with more profile and size.
- The overall depth of the balcony to be narrower than the proposed 5'.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 830 Piety St

Application: New construction of a two-story, multi-unit residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Defer the application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the following changes should be made:

- Remove railing at left side building opening and create a true entrance at the street level that reads as such. Steps for this entryway might need to be recessed.
- Have the corridor separating the building read as a hyphen with the pedestrian gate at that location.
- Revise the vehicular gate to be solid at the lower portion and open at the top.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 619 St Roch Ave- Apt 2A

Application: Construction of new 1,000 SF full second-floor addition at an existing non-contributing one-story commercial building.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval of Option #2 with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- A building with height at this location is an appropriate strategy but the proposed height may be too tall as the overall addition still looks top-heavy.
- Option #2 presented at the meeting showing the existing first-floor CMU building walls being raised, while maintaining the total height of the building, could help to reduce the top-heavy appearance and relate the massing of the addition more closely to the existing building.
- The zone and detailing of the proposed canopy should be reconsidered so that it is more integrated with the overall design and helps to further break up the verticality of the massing. The canopy should have a slightly increased pitch and may be supported from below.
- The proposed

- siding panels should be reconsidered such that they are deeper with smaller shutter boards so that they appear more like shutters rather than as siding.
- The project may return for additional ARC review if Staff feels the updated height, awnings and louver siding strategy are not successful

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 1027 Louisiana Ave

Application: Renovate existing one-story, single-family residential building including enclosing the existing screened-in porch.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at staff level. The ARC agreed that the new windows should be casements that match the existing screens in size and that the existing trim and pilaster be retained.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 621-23 Kerlerec St

Application: Renovation of a two-story, two-family residential building, including removal of non-historic porch enclosures at front facade and restoration of porches.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- The header heights of the second-floor façade doors and windows appear to be too low and should be raised up to a similar proportion as the first-floor doors and windows. Some interior exploratory demolition at the second floor might be useful to verify if any evidence of the original framing for these openings is still visible. For example, transoms were likely present over the previous door openings with taller windows adjacent.
- The porch handrails shown as dying into the turned-wood columns appears to be inappropriate. The applicant should consider an alternative handrail design that is aligned with the top of the concrete pilasters with a vertical handrail extension above to fill in the space between the columns. This would allow the columns and handrail to read as separate elements with the handrails being a more recent and subordinate alteration. The proposed railings could also be free standing with no attachment to the existing columns.
- The newel posts at the second-floor balcony should be taller and the top bar of the handrail should die into the post and not the top trim as shown.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 734 St Ferdinand St

Application: New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- There should be better alignment of the first and second floor windows at the rear elevation.
- The proposed handrails at the front elevation can either be wood or metal but all must have bottom horizontal rails and more substantial intermediary members.
- The proposed side porch should be more subdued and subordinate to the main building with simple square wood posts rather than the decorative turned wood-type shown.
- An additional 1 to 2 windows should be added to the left and right-side elevations, particularly toward the front of the second-floor left elevation.
- The front porch should have a minimum depth of 5'-0" or larger and the applicant should consider shifting the building massing back to allow for a deeper entry porch with a re-worked access stair that is more prominent and closer to the front door.
- The sill height of the second floor façade windows should be raised to a more typical height and if the porch depth and stair are re-worked, this may also allow for the introduction of more typical floor-to-ceiling windows at the first-floor level.
- The applicant should further study and refine the proportions of the proposed hip-on-gable roof at the front elevation as the hip portion appears to be too tall or too large.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 714 Alvar St

Application: New construction of a 2,300 SF one and two story single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the following items should be changed:

- The minimum front porch depth to be 5'.
- The two windows at the second story of the front-facing façade should be reconfigured to line up with the door and window at the first story below.
- Provide a small window at the second story front-facing façade at the left portion to break up the area of siding.
- Provide windows at the side elevations of the one-story portion of the building closest to the front wall.

- The front door should be shorter with a transom to match the full height windows with a pane over panel configuration.
- The steps at the Alvar Street entries should be widened.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 718-20 Alvar St

Application: New construction of a 2,300 SF one and two story single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the following items should be changed:

- The minimum front porch depth to be 5'.
- The two windows at the second story of the front-facing façade should be reconfigured to line up with the door and window at the first story below.
- Provide a small window at the second story front-facing façade at the left portion to break up the area of siding.
- Provide windows at the side elevations of the one-story portion of the building closest to the front wall.
- The front door should be shorter with a transom to match the full height windows with a pane over panel configuration.
- The steps at the Alvar Street entry should be widened.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 3500 St Claude Ave

Application: Installation of faux greenery to provide additional screening of cooling tower.

Motion: Defer the application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the proposed material is not an HDLC approvable material, and a green screen or manufactured screen that better covers the equipment is preferable.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

15. 1129-31 Montegut St

Application: Construction of two-story addition at right-side elevation of an existing two-story single-family residential building.

Motion: Defer the application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the following changes be made to reduce the overall impact on the existing structure:

- Pushing the addition back from Montegut Street might reduce the impact of the overall size.
- If possible, move the ridge of the new roof to a lower position from where it extends from the existing roof.
- Create a hyphen where the addition reads as its own pavilion away from the main mass of the existing building.
- Potentially reduce the overall depth that extends into the right-side yard area.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

16. 417 Tricou St

Application: Renovation and addition at a one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level, with the proviso that the front elevation window header heights align.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

17. 3145 Urquhart St

Application: New construction of a 2,050 SF two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Defer the application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the following changes should be made:

- Extend the left side of the cantilevered second story wall down to the first floor to break up the massing on the front façade.
- Remove the Juliet balcony and make it either a true balcony or a deeply recessed window.
- At the side hall area at the first-floor entry, extend the vertical pickets up to give the impression of an enclosed space. Allow the pickets to frame the space like a gate.
- Add more operable windows throughout

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

18. 413-15 Homer St

Application: New construction of a 1,900 SF two-story single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed the following changes should be made:

- Railings should be either wood or metal and not a combination of both.
- The floor to ceiling height should be raised from 10' to 11' to match the neighboring building to the right.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

19. 422-24 Homer St

Application: New construction of a 1,900 SF two-story single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC noted that metal or wood railings should be used and not a combination of the two

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

20. 734-36 Belleville St

Application: New construction of a 3,400 SF two-story single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC noted that a two over two muntin pattern should be added to the last window at the second story right side elevation, and that panels on the garage door are to be simpler rather than articulated

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

21. 729 Gallier St

Application: Renovation and addition at existing one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC noted that the parapet wall should be metal, and the height come down as far as possible

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed



In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

22. 244 Olivier St

Application: Modifications to existing doors and windows at a multi-family residential building.

Motion: Conceptually approve the proposed window and door changes at the Pelican Avenue side elevation. The ARC noted that the six over six windows at the second story could be replicated at the first story and should match operation and configuration of existing and align in placement. The ARC denied the full-height window installation at the front façade of the building. Before issuing an HDLC Certificate of Appropriateness for the work, a window detail for the proposed replacement windows will need to be submitted for review and approval prior to purchase and installation.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

23. 5504 St Charles Ave

Application: Final detail review of proposed new metal perimeter fencing.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the low masonry chain wall proposed at the left side of the property should be pushed back to align with the front face of the porch and that enlarged elevations and details of the gate and fencing should be submitted to Staff for the final review.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments: