

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission  
Architectural Review Committee  
Meeting Minutes

Date: January 17<sup>th</sup>, 2023

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, LA, 70112.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Members present: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent: Beth Jacob

---

I. AGENDA

1. Minutes of the December 20<sup>th</sup>, 2022, meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 1313-1329 Jackson Ave

Application: Ratify ARC recommendations due to lack of quorum for the installation of new mechanical equipment on a street facing elevation of a designated Landmark.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

The ARC agreed that moving the electrical box to the far left of the window was not possible, due to the location of the existing stair. The ARC stated that plantings should be kept in front of the new electrical box.

By: John Klingman

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed.

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 623 Orange St.

Application: Ratify ARC recommendations due to lack of quorum for the renovation and new addition at a Landmark, two-story, commercial building.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC stated the windows in the new building should be casements and the bathroom window can be fixed. The brick wall should have a detailed termination point.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed.

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 1500 Henry Clay Ave.

Application: Renovation of a Non-Contributing garage building on a Landmark site.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC stated that the band board on the east/west elevations should be removed and the secondary fascia on the north/south elevations should be removed.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed.

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 1206 Magazine St.

Application: New construction of a 3890 SF two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer the application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- The front porch stairs should align with the front door.
- Dimensions should be taken on the neighboring two story property for accurate exterior massing.
- The floor-to-floor height should be noted and appropriate for the block face.
- Exterior staircases are not approvable on new construction.
- The gable on the front hipped roof should be removed.
- The rear terrace should be less visible and concealed with parapet wall that reads as roofing.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 1133 N Villere St.

Application: Renovation and camelback addition of existing building and new construction of a 980 SF second primary structure at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to conceptually approve the massing for this application. The ARC agreed that:

- The sides of the addition should be weatherboards to visually tie it to the shotgun. The camelback with the balcony and terrace to remain stucco.
- The terrace rail, and recessed balcony side materiality can be lighter in nature with the suggestion of screening.
- Once materiality is explored the application should be placed on the ARC agenda.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 1240 Seventh St.

Application: New construction of 5,200 SF two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC voted to conceptually approve this application with final details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- Due to the width of the building, the first-floor floor-to-ceiling height appears low and squat at 11'-0" and should be increased slightly to better relate these proportions to the adjacent one-story building.
- The porch beam condition shown as Option 2 was preferred, but this must also be detailed to relate proportionally to the surrounding historic context.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 1139-1141 Ursulines Ave.

Application: Renovation of Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building including change of openings and addition of dormers.

Motion: The ARC voted to approve the application. The ARC agreed that:

- The dormer on Henriette Delille should be removed from the scope.
- Two single window dormers are appropriate at the rear of the building only.

By: John Klingman

Second:

Result:

Motion:

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result:

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 516-518 Fourth St.

Application: Renovation and rear addition at a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC stated that the front window on the right-side elevation should be retained and that a vertical trim should be added to delineate the new addition from the original. The ARC stated that the chimneys are to be retained above the roofline, per the Guidelines. Removal of chimneys requires Commission appeal.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 2234 Chartres St.

Application: Review of installation of new covered rear porch (after-the-fact) at an existing Contributing rated one-story, two-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: The ARC agreed a new rear covered porch was appropriate for the building, however, its overall form and detailing should be adjusted to relate to the existing historic building and surrounding historic context. The ARC also agreed that:

- The porch roof should be made discontinuous from the main building roof, so it appears more as a new and subordinate additive element. This can be achieved by reducing the height of the existing porch structure down approximately 1'-0" or by shifting the existing roof to the left such that the ridgeline is centered above the new rear door opening, or a combination of both.
- The last bay of the roof is too low and creates an awkward condition where the roof appears to die into the ground. The applicant should consider eliminating this portion of roof covering, replacing the solid material at this location with a transparent roofing material, or decreasing the pitch of the roof at this location, so it appears more like a typical porch roof from the street.
- The porch columns appear diminutive in size relative to their height and the applicant should consider increasing their size/dimensions. This could potentially be achieved by boxing out the existing columns, for example.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 5537 Chartres St.

Application: This application was withdrawn.

11. 634 Lesseps St.

Application: Renovation and installation of second story balcony and awning at a two-story commercial warehouse and installation of a storefront at the rear facade of adjacent one-story single shotgun commercial building.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer your application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- Exploring different options for the balcony shape, depth, and roofing configurations could provide a solution to the proposed low horizontal roof.
- Detail balcony stair in such a way that is not treated as just an egress. Providing screening at that location might be appropriate.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 3615 St Charles Ave.

Application: After-the-fact review of change in roof pitch at a Non-Contributing rated two-story, commercial building.

Motion: The ARC agreed that although the sloped roof is inappropriate for the mid-century-style building; however, due to the non-contributing classification 3615 St. Charles, the ARC recommended conceptual approval of the roof slope change.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 627-629 Lizardi St.

Application: New construction of a 2710 SF two-story, two-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

The ARC advised that:

- The driveway should be either permeable pavers or parking strips.
- The porch columns should be rectangular, and the dimensions should be enlarged (to 10"x8")
- The home may be raised to 4' instead of 3'

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 2525 N Rampart St.

Application: Demolition of existing non-original rear lean-to addition and construction of new camelback addition at existing Contributing rated one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the final details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed the proposed camelback addition shown in the updated drawings during the meeting is an appropriate addition to the existing historic building.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

15. 521 Pacific Ave.

Application: Renovation and new construction of side porch at a Contributing two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the first porch column should be pulled back to the corner of the existing building in between the door and window.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

16. Application: Approval of Thermory wood products for decking and cladding.

Result: Passed

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.