

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Meeting Minutes

Date: November 2, 2022

Location: 21st Floor Conference Room, 1340 Poydras Street

Called to order: 2:50 p.m.

Commissioners present: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Commissioners absent: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Ayo Love

I. Roll Call

II. Minutes of the October 4, 2022, meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments:

III. Reinstatement of the HDLC Rules, Policies and Procedures Section II.G.4

Motion: Approve the reinstatement of the requirement.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments:

IV. Landmark Nomination of 2230 Seventh Street

Motion: Nominate 2230 Seventh Street as a landmark.

By: Jason King

Second: Jennifer Greene

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments: Susan Johnson spoke in favor of the nomination.

V. Landmark Nomination of 1100 N Broad Street, 2661 Ursulines Avenue

Motion: Nominate 1100 N. Broad Street as a landmark.

By: Jason King

Second: Annie Clark

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments:

VI. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda

By: Jason King

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments:

VII. Old Business Retention Applications

A. 709 Milan St

Application: Retention of demolition of more than 50% of the exterior walls of an existing Contributing rated two-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of partial exterior wall demolition without a Certificate of Appropriateness and to levy a fine of \$3,000 for the unpermitted work.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments:

VIII. New Business Work Applications

A. 2121 Chartres St

Application: Appeal of ARC denial of updated arch-top opening details of previously approved renovation of existing Contributing rated 1-1/2 story commercial building and Non-Contributing rated two-story commercial building for conversion to hotel use.

Motion: Approve the ARC appeal request and allow for the proposed arch-top window changes.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Greg Hackenberg

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed: Jennifer Greene

Result: At the time the Commission was unable to reach a majority decision, resulting in no action being taken on this application. The Commission's lack of action is considered a de-facto denial.

Comments: Jennifer Greene expressed concern that HDLC was being forced by SHPO to approve the proposed changes despite the Architectural Review Committee's previous reviews and recommendations for denial of the proposed changes.

- B. 2105 Chartres St
Application: This application was withdrawn and was not heard by the Commission.

IX. Old Business Demolition Applications

- A. 530 S Scott St
Application: This application was withdrawn and was not heard by the Commission.
- B. 3807 Perrier St
Application: Demolition and obscuration of more than 25% of the primary facade of an existing Contributing rated two-story, single-family residential building.
Motion: Approve the application for partial facade demolition.
By: Anne Redd
Second: Annie Clarke
Result: Passed
In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman
Opposed:
Comments:

X. New Business Demolition Applications

- A. 2206 Adams St
Application: This application was withdrawn and was not heard by the Commission.
- B. 2320 Tulane Ave
Application: Demolition to grade of a contributing two-story commercial building.
Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting at the applicant's request.
By: Annie Clark
Second: Jennifer Greene
Result: Passed
In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman
Opposed:
Comments:
- C. 311 Calhoun St
Application: Demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade of an existing Non-Contributing rated one-story, single-family residential building to reorganize door and window openings.
Motion: Approve the application for partial facade demolition.
By: Greg Hackenberg
Second: Heather Szapary
Result: Passed
In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman
Opposed:
Comments:
- D. 6112 Laurel
Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof of an existing Contributing rated one-story, single-family residential building for a renovation and camelback addition.
Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 420 S Galvez St

Application: This item was withdrawn and was not heard by the Commission.

F. 740 Jena St

Application: This application was withdrawn and was not heard by the Commission.

G. 2601 Iberville St

Application: This application was withdrawn and was not heard by the Commission.

XI. New Business Retention Applications

A. 302 Oliver St

Application: This application was withdrawn and was not heard by the Commission.

B. 5807 Royal St

Application: Retention of failed final inspection items including installation of visually prominent tankless hot water heater, installation of inappropriate porch decking, flush-mounted gable vent, window pediment trim, and change of size and location of window openings at new construction of an 1,800 SF one-story, single-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting due to the applicant not attending the meeting.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 1119-1121 Bartholomew St

Application: Retention of inappropriate brackets, brick, parking pad, stained wood, and visible HVAC equipment at a Non-rated, one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the retention of the inappropriate brick and concrete parking pad with the proviso that the following items will be corrected:

- Paint the inappropriately stained exterior wood at foundation screening and porch soffits.
- Install gutters and downspouts at the building.
- Remove inappropriate wood brackets at the front and recessed entries.
- Work with Staff to study a less visible location for visually prominent roof HVAC equipment.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor:
Opposed:
Comments:

D. 1232-1234 Louisa St

Application: Retention of two-story, two-family residential building constructed without permits.

Motion: Approve the retention of the two-story, two-family residential building with the proviso that the building incorporate the Architectural Review Committee's recommendations.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 1509-1511 Louisa St

Application: Retention of removal of existing windows and installation of inappropriate windows, installation of inappropriate doors, installation of wood grain Hardie plank, installation of inappropriate security bars, removal of existing transoms, installation of inappropriate window trim, and removal of gable window and installation of inappropriate gable vent at a Contributing rated, one-story, residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the retention of the inappropriate side and rear elevation flush-mounted vinyl windows – if in the future they are replaced, windows must be an HDLC approved window, front-facing gable vent, wood-grained Hardie Plank weatherboards – if in the future the siding is replaced it must be HDLC approved, and transoms at front façade doors – if framing for transoms remains, contact Staff before proceeding with transom replacement. With the proviso that the following items will be corrected:

- Inappropriate front façade doors be replaced with HDLC approved doors.
- Inappropriate two (2) front façade windows be replaced with HDLC approved wood windows.
- Removal of existing decorative security bars.
- Replace front-facing gable vent with appropriate wood louvered gable vent as per HDLC detail

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments:

F. 3000 S Carrollton Ave

Application: Retention of construction of canopy, painting previously unpainted brick, and installation of painted signage at a Contributing rated, one-story commercial building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Defer at applicant's request.

By: Anne Redd

Second: Annie Clark

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments:

G. 1437 St. Andrew St

Application: Retention of tile cladding on front stairs on a Contributing rated, raised basement, multi-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so the applicant may attend the meeting.

By: Jason King

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments:

H. 709 Touro St

Application: Retention of installation of inappropriate metal handrails, gates, and shutter dogs at existing Contributing rated two-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny the request for retention of shutter dog hardware and ornate metal handrails installed at the entry stairs without a CofA as these elements are not compatible with the type and age of the historic building. The Commission also voted to approve the retention of the ornate metal gates installed at the left and right-side alleys with the proviso that the applicant must work with Staff on a strategy for reducing the ornamental infill as much as possible. The Commission also noted a maximum 90-day timeframe for the applicant to complete these modifications.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Anne Redd

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments:

XII. Ratification of Architectural Review Committee and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, October 4, 2022, Meeting.

Motion: Approve the ratification of the ARC and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, October 4, 2022, meeting.

By: Jason King

Second: Annie Clark

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman

Opposed:

Comments: