# New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes

Date: December 7<sup>th</sup>, 2022

Location: City Council chamber, 1300 Perdido Street

Called to order: 1:35 p.m.

Commissioners present: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie Cannon West, Ayo Love, Stephanie Bruno, Lee Bressler

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene

Commissioners absent: Rashida Ferdinand

## I. Roll Call

II. Minutes of the November 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2022, meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes. By: Lee Bressler Second: Jason King Result: Passed In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Stephanie Bruno, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

## III. Landmark Nomination of 914 Dante St.

Motion: Nominate 914 Dante St. as a landmark. By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Result: Motion failed due to lack of a second In favor: Opposed: Comments: Susan Johnson spoke in favor of the nomination; Sonny Shields spoke against the nomination.

## IV. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda By: Donna Wakeman Second: Jason King Result: Passed In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Stephanie Bruno, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

## V. New Business Work Applications

A. 2508-2510 Laurel St.

Application: Retention of demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, single family residential building to grade without a Certificate of Appropriateness and conceptual approval of new construction of a 2,800 SF two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Grant the application for retention of demolition, without fines. Grant conceptual approval of the new construction with the details to be worked out at the staff level. By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene Opposed: Stephanie Bruno Comments: Susan Johnson spoke against this application.

# B. 2105 Chartres St.

Application: This application was withdrawn and was not heard by the Commission.

C. <u>840 Spain St.</u>

Application: Request to install new visually prominent roof-mounted solar panels at a Non-Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building. Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting due to the applicant not attending. By: Donna Wakeman Second: Jason King Result: Passed In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Stephanie Bruno, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

D. <u>612 Bouny St.</u>

Application: Remove existing wood window screens and install aluminum screens at windows at a Contributing rated, two-story, two-family residential building. Motion: Deny the application for the removal of wood window screens and the installation of aluminum screens. By: Heather Szapary Second: Greg Hackenberg Result: Passed In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Stephanie Bruno, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

E. 722 Washington Ave.

Application: Request to remove one chimney from a Contributing rated, two-story, residential building. Motion: Grant approval of the removal of one chimney. By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Stephanie Bruno, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

# F. <u>2217-2219 Dauphine St.</u>

Application: Request to install new galvalume standing seam metal roofing at a Contributing rated, twostory, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for standing seam metal roofing due to the visibility of the roof from the public right of way as seen from the direction of travel along Dauphine Street, and because the building's original roof material was likely slate. This material is not appropriate for this type and style building unless it is

minimal or non-visible. By: Donna Wakeman Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie Cannon West, Ayo Love, Stephanie Bruno, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

G. 2275 Bayou Rd.

Application: Request to replace slate roof with synthetic slate tiles at a Landmark, one-story, commercial building.

Motion: Grant approval of the removal of the existing slate and replacement with synthetic slate tiles. By: Annie Clark

Second: Lee Bressler

**Result: Passed** 

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie Cannon West, Ayo Love, Stephanie Bruno, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

H. 5718 St Charles Ave.

Application: Request to remove existing wood front entry stairs for replacement with new brick entry stairs and modified handrail at a Significant rated, two-story, single-family residential building. Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting, per applicant's request.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie Cannon West, Ayo Love, Stephanie Bruno, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

Comments: Brian Gille and David Stiebel spoke on this application.

# VI. Old Business Demolition Applications

A. 2320 Tulane Ave.

Application: This application was withdrawn.

# VII. New Business Demolition Applications

A. <u>420 S. Galvez St.</u>

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, raised, two-story, two-family residential building to grade. Motion: Defer action on this application for 60 days (two meetings) to allow the applicant to explore different design options for incorporating the existing building rather than demolition.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Lee Bressler

**Result: Passed** 

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Stephanie Bruno, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene

Opposed:

Comments: Michael Merideth and Nicole Webre spoke in favor of this application; Susan Johnson spoke against it.

B. <u>740 Jena St.</u>

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Approve the application. By: Stephanie Bruno Result: Failed due to lack of a second. Motion: Deny the application for demolition to grade based on the condition of the structure today and because it retains some of its original character-defining exterior architectural details and continues to contribute its type, style, scale, massing, and roof form to the surrounding local historic district. By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Jennifer Greene Result: Passed In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene Opposed: Stephanie Bruno Comments: Patrick Fess and Adrienne Catalano spoke in favor of this application; Susan Johnson spoke against it.

# C. 815 Third St.

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building to grade. Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting to allow time for the HDLC inspector to be granted access for an interior inspection.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene

Opposed:

Comments: Brenda Keane spoke in favor of this application, and Joe Demetz spoke against it.

D. 3301 Magazine St.

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof of a Non-Contributing rated, one-story commercial building.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting to encourage the applicant to meet with neighbors and adjacent property owners about the proposed work.

By: Anne Red

Second: Lee Bressler

**Result: Passed** 

In favor: Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman. Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Stephanie Bruno, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene

Opposed:

Comments: Allain F. Hardin, Shelley Landrieu, and Larry Schmidt spoke against this application.

E. 629 Webster St.

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building for a camelback addition. Motion: Defer the application By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Jason King Result: Failed In favor: Ayo Love, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark Opposed: Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition. By: Donna Wakeman Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Stephanie Bruno, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene

## VIII. Old Business Retention Applications

#### A. 5807 Royal St.

Application: Retention of failed final inspection items including installation of visually prominent tankless hot water heater, installation of inappropriate porch decking, flush-mounted gable vent, window pediment trim, and change of size and location of window openings at new construction of an 1,800 SF one-story, single-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny the request to retain the tankless water heater, porch floor decking, gable vent and pediment door/window trim as installed and required these items be appropriately corrected. The Commission also voted to approve the request to retain the window changes completed at the left and right-side elevations. By: Lee Bressler

Second: Heather Szapary

**Result:** Passed

In favor: Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Stephanie Bruno, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

#### IX. New Business Retention Applications

#### A. <u>3240 Laurel St.</u>

Application: Retention of removal of three chimneys at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building in deviation of the Certificate of Appropriateness. Motion: Grant the application for retention. By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Annie Clark Result: Passed In favor: Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Stephanie Bruno, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

## B. <u>3424 St Claude Ave.</u>

Application: Retention of visually prominent roof mounted solar equipment at a Contributing rated, raised, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of the visually prominent roof-mounted solar collector equipment at the left-side roof slope as it adheres to the HDLC guidelines.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

**Result: Passed** 

In favor: Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Stephanie Bruno, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene

Opposed:

## C. 1515 Euterpe St.

Application: Retention of roofline alteration, construction of rear addition, installation of CMU foundation piers, and the installation of visible mechanical equipment at a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the retention of the removal of clay tile roof parapet and roofline alteration with the proviso that English-V style ridge tiles be installed at roof ridges. Approve the retention of the new construction of a rear addition. Approve the installation of the mechanical equipment at the right-side elevation and associated venting with the proviso that the venting be painted to match the existing siding.

Approve the retention of new CMU piers at the foundation with the proviso that the piers be parge coated to match existing piers. By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed In favor: Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Stephanie Bruno, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

# D. <u>1517 Euterpe St.</u>

Application: Retention of removal of left and right-side rear balconies, removal of second story additions, and removal of existing windows and installation of inappropriate windows at rear of building at a Contributing rated, two-story, two-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Motion: Defer action on the application for 60 days (2 meetings) to allow the applicant to tent the building for termite remediation as well as securely board windows and doors.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Stephanie Bruno, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

## E. 1527 Euterpe St.

Application: Retention of removal of existing windows and installation of inappropriate flush-mounted vinyl windows at a Contributing rated, two-story multi-residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the retention of ten (10) inappropriate vinyl windows at the rear of the building past the side-facing gable with the proviso that ten (10) inappropriate vinyl windows closer to Euterpe Street be removed and replaced with HDLC approved windows.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Heather Szapary

**Result: Passed** 

In favor: Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Stephanie Bruno, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

# F. <u>1531 Euterpe St.</u>

Application: Retention of removal of existing windows and installation of inappropriate windows, removal of existing door and sections of balcony at side gallery, and partial removal of balcony at rear of building and demolition of rear structure at a Contributing rated, two-story, multi-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the retention of the removal of rear second story door and associated balcony and balustrade. Deny the retention of the removal of four (4) existing wood windows and installation of inappropriate vinyl windows at right-side elevation. HDLC-approved windows should be submitted to HDLC Staff for review and approval prior to installation.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Stephanie Bruno, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

G. <u>3000 S Carrollton Ave.</u>

Application: This application was withdrawn.

H. 2255 St Claude Ave.

Application: Retention of demolition of Non-Contributing rated, rear accessory structure over 1,000 SF to grade without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Motion: Approve the application for retention of demolition of the Non-Contributing rear accessory without a Certificate of Appropriateness. By: Donna Wakeman Second: Jennifer Greene Result: Passed In favor: Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Stephanie Bruno, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene Opposed: Comments: David Stiebel and Brian Gille spoke in favor of this application.

I. <u>1437 St Andrew St.</u>

Application: This application was withdrawn and not heard by the Commission.

## J. 3704 Coliseum St.

Application: Retention of demolition of Contributing rated, one-story accessory structure to grade in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness. Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting, per applicant's request. By: Lee Bressler Second: Jason King Result: Passed In favor: Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Stephanie Bruno, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene Opposed:

# X. Ratification of Architectural Review Committee and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, November 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2022, Meeting.

Motion: Approve the ratification of the ARC and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, November 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2022, meeting. By: Jason King Second: Greg Hackenberg Result: Passed In favor: Jason King, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love, Lee Bressler, Annie Clark, Stephanie Bruno, Greg Hackenberg, Jennifer Greene Opposed: