New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes

Date: June 1, 2022

Location: City Council Chamber, 1300 Perdido Street

Called to order: 1:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg,

Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Stephanie Bruno, Jason King

Commissioners absent: Emilie Bahr, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman

I. Minutes of the May 4, 2022 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Jennie West Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love,

Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

II. CLG Review of 1812 LB Landry Boulevard Nomination to the National Register of Historic Places

Motion: By: Ayo Love

Second: Jennie West Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather

Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

III. Consent Agenda

A. Motion: Suspend the rules and remove item D, 328-30 Newton St, from the consent agenda.

By: Heather Szapary Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather

Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

B. Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed In favor: Lee Bressler, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather

Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

C. <u>328-30 Newt</u>on St

Motion: Grant conceptual approval with the ARC's recommendations. The exterior stair at the rear of the proposed building must be removed and windows are to be added at side elevations.

By: Heather Szapary Second: Jennie West Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love,

Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand Comments: JoAnn Minor in favor of application

IV. New Business Work Applications

A. 2815 St Claude Ave

Application: Request to install new standing seam metal roof at an existing significant rated one-story, single-family raised basement residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for installation of new standing seam metal roofing due to the original roofing material likely being slate, the Significant rating of the building, and the high visibility of the roof slopes from the surrounding public right of way.

By: Jennie West Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather

Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand

Comments:

B. 2815 St Claude Ave

Application: Request to remove existing wood weatherboards at side and rear elevations for replacement with new smooth finish Hardie weatherboards and installation of wood shingle siding at dormer cheek walls at an existing significant rated one-story, single-family raised basement residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for replacement of existing wood weatherboards with new smooth finish.

Motion: Approve the application for replacement of existing wood weatherboards with new smooth finish Hardie weatherboards with the proviso that replacement be limited to the building sides indicated on the submitted replacement diagram. The commission also voted to deny the request to remove existing wood weatherboards from the dormer cheek walls for installation of new wood shingles as that material is historically inappropriate to that location. If the wood weatherboards are deteriorated in that location, a proposal to replace in kind could be approved at the staff level.

By: Jennie West Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

C. 2340 Chartres St

Application: Request to remove one (1) non-historic masonry chimney and to modify existing first-floor wood doors at existing significant rated two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for removal of one (1) non-historic masonry chimney from the roof and to approve the proposed door modification of two (2) wood door panels to glazing as recommended by the Architectural Review Committee.

By: Jennie West Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

D. 2109 Annunciation St

Application: Application to remove existing slate roof and replace with metal roofing at a one-story single family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for the installation of metal roofing due to the high visibility at this location. The Commission voted to approve the removal of the existing slate roof for replacement with slate to match existing, or architectural grade asphalt fiberglass shingles to replicate the appearance of slate. Ridge tiles are to be retained and re-installed with the new roofing material.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

E. 511 Red Allen Way

Application: Installation of metal balustrade at front porch of a contributing single-family camelback residential building. Retention of visible HVAC equipment, inappropriate boxed eaves at front gables of shotgun and camelback, missing columns and handrails at front porch, and front stairs not constructed as approved.

Motion: Deny the application for the installation of a metal balustrade. The Commission also voted to partially deny the application for retention of the HVAC equipment location, the boxed eaves at gable ends, and the removal of columns and balustrade. The Commission did approve the retention of the incorrectly constructed front stairs.

By: Heather Szapary Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

F. <u>127 Lavergne St</u>

Application: Removal of existing ridge tiles and finials for the installation of a standing seam metal roof at a two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for removal of existing ridge tiles and finials for the installation of a standing seam metal roof.

By: Heather Szapary Second: Greg Hackenberg Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King,

Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments: Betty DiGiovanni spoke in favor of the application.

G. 319 Alix St

Application: Removal of existing ridge tiles for the installation of a standing seam metal roof at a one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for the removal of existing ridge tiles for the installation of a standing seam metal roof.

By: Heather Szapary Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather

Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Rashida Ferdinand

Comments:

H. 712 Belleville St

Application: Installation of decorative iron fencing at front of a two-story, single-family residential building. Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting to provide the chance for the applicant to work with HDLC Staff and HDLC Architectural Review Committee to determine if the proposed iron fencing is appropriate.

By: Heather Szapary Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Onnosed:

Comments: Christine Jordan spoke in favor of the application.

I. 623 Eighth St

Application: Proposal to install a wood alternative fiberglass door at a one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for a wood alternative door at this location. It was suggested that a high quality wood door be obtained and properly fitted into the opening in order to minimize swelling.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

V. Old Business Demolition Applications

A. 1917 Soniat St

Application: Demolition of existing contributing one-story, two-family residential building to grade. Motion: Deny the application for demolition to grade based on the age of the building, its contributing rating, the condition of the structure today, and because much of the original character-defining exterior architectural details remain and the building continues to contribute its type, style, massing and roof form to the surrounding local historic district.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King,

Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

B. 7314 Zimple St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof and more than 25% of the primary facade of an existing non-contributing one-story, single-family residential building for a renovation and full second-floor addition.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof and façade demolition.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love,

Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Stephanie Bruno, Jason King

Comments: Robert Turner and Susan Johnson spoke in opposition to the application.

C. 7330 Cohn St

Application: Demolition of existing contributing one-story commercial building to grade (for review & comment only).

Motion: Deny the application for demolition to grade based on the age of the building, its contributing rating, the condition of the structure today and because much of the original character-defining exterior architectural details remain and the building continues to contribute its type, style, massing, and roof form to the surrounding local historic district.

By: Jennie West

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments: Susan Johnson spoke in opposition to the application.

D. 1823 Lowerline St

Application: Demolition of existing non-contributing one-story commercial building to grade (for review & comment only).

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade based on the age of the building and it's non-contributing rating. The Commission also recommended that S&WBNO continue their outreach to the adjacent property owners concerning the proposed demolition and redevelopment.

By: Lee Bressler Second: Jennie West Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

VI. New Business Demolition Applications

A. 634 Bartholomew St

Application: Demolition to grade of a one-story non-contributing commercial building.

Motion: Approve the demolition application with the proviso that the demolition permit not be issued until redevelopment plans are submitted for the property.

By: Jennie West

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King,

Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

B. 2436 Robert St

Application: Demolition of existing contributing (but altered) one-story, single-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition to grade based on the age of the building, its contributing rating, the amount of extant original exterior character-defining architectural details remaining and because the building continues to contribute its type, style, scale, massing, roof form and siting on the corner lot to the surrounding local historic district.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Jennie West Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King,

Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

C. 927 Arabella St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof of an existing contributing one-story, single-family residential building for a new addition and change in roof form.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King,

Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments: David Barrett, Cathryn Foley, John Millar, Christopher Simmons, and Hoolyse Davatian spoke

against the application.

VII. Old Business Retention Applications

A. 1532 St Philip St

Application: Retention to keep A/C unit at right gable installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny the retention of the A/C unit at the right gable.

By: Ayo Love

Second: Jennie West Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King,

Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

VIII. New Business Retention Applications

A. 3321 Prytania St

Application: Retention of construction of new rear accessory building at existing contributing two-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of construction of a new rear accessory structure without a Certificate of Appropriateness with the proviso that all new proposed exterior door, window, light fixture and garage door specifications are submitted to Staff for review and approval prior to purchase and installation.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather

Szapary, Jennie West Opposed: Jason King

Comments:

B. 339-341 Pelican Ave

Application: Retention of items in deviation of Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny the application for retention of perforated Hardie soffit, boxed in eaves at rear gable, rear porch balustrade and steps, area of existing and new fascia, and gable vent installation as the applicant is willing to work with Staff to correct this work. The Commission voted to approve the incorrect construction of the box beam at the rear porch with the proviso that trim be added on the rear and Bermuda Street elevations.

By: Heather Szapary Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

C. 3229-31 St Claude Ave

Application: Retention of concrete parking pad, stucco on board at porches, missing trim at porches, inappropriate gutters at front facade, and uncapped fencing in deviation of CofA at a two-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Deny retention of the missing trim at porches, inappropriate gutters at front façade, and uncapped fencing as the items will be corrected. The Commission approved the retention of the concrete parking pad as constructed. The Commission also approved the stucco on board at porches with the proviso that vegetation be planted at these locations.

By: Jennie West Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King,

Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

D. <u>1025 Bartholomew St</u>

Application: Retention of demolition beyond the approved scope of work at a contributing, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the retention of demolition beyond the approved scope of work and levy a fine of

By: Jennie West Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King,

Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed:

\$5000.00.

Comments: Susan Johnson spoke on the application.

E. 4827 Camp St

Application: Retention of excess façade and exterior wall demolition at existing contributing, one-story, single-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of excess façade and exterior wall demolition in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness and to levy a fine of \$10,000 for the unpermitted demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Ayo Love,

Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments: Greg Hackenberg recused himself from the application. David Rubinstein and Susan Johnson spoke in opposition to the application.

F. 7108 Coliseum St

Application: Retention of excess roof demolition at existing contributing, one-story, single-family raised-basement residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of excess roof demolition in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness and to levy a fine of \$10,000 for the unpermitted demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Jennie West Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Heather

Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments: Susan Johnson spoke on the application.

G. 3017 Annunciation St

Application: Retention for the installation of inappropriate surface mounted windows and removal of entablature without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny the request for retention of the removal of entablature and stated that it should be reinstalled within a period of four years.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc,

Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

H. Ratification of Architectural Committee and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, May 4 Meeting.

Motion: Ratify the ARC and staff actions since the Wednesday, May 4 meeting.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Stephanie Bruno, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed: Comments:

A. 1100 N Broad St

Application: Appeal of ARC ratification of Staff demolition review calculations and issuance of a Certificate of Review.

Motion: The Commission was unable to reach a majority decision, resulting in no action being taken on this application.

By: Lee Bressler Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Rashida Ferdinand, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc,

Heather Szapary, Jennie West Opposed: Stephanie Bruno

Comments: Katherine Harmon spoke in opposition of the appeal. Susan Johnson spoke in favor of the

appeal.