## New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes

Date: September 6<sup>th</sup>, 2023

Location: City Council chamber, 1300 Perdido Street

Called to order: 1:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Jennie Cannon West, Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Annie Clark, Shawanda Poree, Anne Redd

Commissioners absent:

#### I. Roll Call

# II. Minutes of the August 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2023, meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes. By: Lee Bressler Second: Jason King Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen Opposed:

#### III. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the Consent agenda. By: Lee Bressler Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen Opposed: Comments: Maryanne Miller spoke on Item C, 1220-1222 Columbus St.

#### **IV. New Business Work Applications**

A. <u>ACRE</u>

Application: Review of new ACRE brand composite building trim, siding and decking for consideration of Staff-level approval where consistent with the HDLC Guidelines for alternative materials.
Motion: Approve the materials for staff-level approval.
By: Jennifer Greene
Second: Greg Hackenberg
Result: Passed
In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark
Opposed:
Comments: Commissioner Clark arrived for this motion.

B. 436 Seventh St.

Application: Request to install mini-split and tankless water heater at left side elevation and replace existing wood stairs at front porch with brick at a Landmark, two-story, single-family residential building. Motion: Grant approval of the wall mounted equipment, with the proviso that all conduits be run on the interior of the building. Deny the request to replace the existing wood steps at the front porch with new brick steps. By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed: Comments: Commissioners Poree and Redd arrived for this motion.

#### C. 5005 Saint Charles Ave.

Application: Request to install new HVAC units in the front yard of a Significant rated, three-story, commercial building. Motion: Grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level. By: Lee Bressler Second: Greg Hackenberg Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed:

#### D. 2624 Burgundy St.

Application: Request to remove existing slate roof and ridge tiles for replacement with new asphalt shingles and standing seam metal roofing at an existing Contributing rated church building and associated Non-Contributing rated office building.

Motion: Approve the request for removal of slate roofing at the Non-Contributing rated rear office building for replacement with new asphalt shingles with the existing ridge tiles and vents to remain. The Commission also voted to deny the request for new standing seam metal roofing at the primary church building based on the HDLC Guidelines which note that metal roofing may not be an appropriate option at roofs with high visibility from the surrounding public right of way or where the original roof material was likely slate. The Commission recommended the applicant instead consider new asphalt shingle roofing at this area because this material can appropriately replicate the appearance of slate and will allow for the retention of the historic roof elements such as ridge tiles and vents.

By: Ross Karsen

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree

Opposed:

E. 300 Pelican Ave.

Application: Request to install decorative French doors at corner entry, installation of gas lantern at side entry, and retention of removal of stucco at foundation wall in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness at a Contributing rated, two-story residential building.

Motion: Defer action on the application until the next Commission meeting to provide an opportunity for the applicant to work with Staff to better understand the previously existing condition of the stuccoed brick foundation wall and provide the applicant with time to produce additional information (including framing drawings) for the proposed door installation. Dimensions of the existing opening and proposed doors should be provided. Elevation drawings and/or photo simulations should be provided so that the proposed doors can be reviewed in the context of the historic building.

By: Shawanda Poree Second: Annie Clark Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed:

F. 1808 Rampart St.

Application: Request to remove existing slate roof for replacement with new asphalt shingle roof at an existing Contributing rated one-story, two-family residential building. Motion: Approve the request for removal of the existing slate roof for replacement with new architectural grade asphalt/fiberglass roof shingles with the existing roof ridge tiles and cap vents to remain. By: Tim Lupin Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed: Comments: Gerry Birnbach and Corey Gallagher spoke in favor of this application.

#### V. New Business Demolition Applications

A. 2437 Ursulines Ave.

Application: Demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade at a Contributing rated, one-story, mixed-use building.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that further research can be done on the building history.

- By: Lee Bressler
- Second: Jason King
- Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree

Opposed:

Comments: Ron Loesel spoke on this application.

B. <u>4052 Ulloa St.</u>

Application: Demolition of a Non-Contributing rated, one-story, commercial building to grade. Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade. By: Annie Clark Second: Ross Karsen Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree

Opposed:

C. 4041 Tulane Ave.

Application: Demolition of a Non-Contributing rated, two-story, commercial building to grade. Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade. By: Annie Clark Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed:

D. 4051 Tulane Ave.

Application: Demolition of a Non-Contributing rated, single-story, commercial building to grade. Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade. By: Annie Clark Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed:

#### E. 219 N Johnson St.

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building to grade. Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade. By: Annie Clark Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree

Opposed:

#### F. 2312 Valence St.

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof and 25% of the primary facade at a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Tim Lupin

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree

Opposed:

## G. <u>828 Teche St.</u>

Application: Demolition of a Non-Contributing rated, one-story, commercial building to grade. Motion: Approve demolition to grade with the proviso that redevelopment plans be submitted prior to the issuance of a demolition permit.

By: Shawanda Poree Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed:

## H. <u>1220 Monroe St.</u>

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building to grade. Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that further research can be done on the building history.

By: Lee Bressler Second: Jennifer Greene Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed:

Comments: Susan Johnson spoke against this application.

I. <u>1641-1645 Foucher St., 3530 Carondelet St.</u>

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, raised-basement, two-family building through raising the building.

Motion: Deny the application for the demolition of a Contributing rated, raised-basement, two-family building through raising the building.

By: Tim Lupin Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree

Opposed:

J. <u>8823 Willow St.</u>

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, two family, single story residential building through raising the building. Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade. By: Lee Bressler Second: Shawanda Poree Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed:

# VI. New Business Retention Applications

A. 714 Seventh St.

Application: Retention of demolition through reframing of more than 50% of the exterior wall structure and more than 25% of the primary facade at a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building in deviation of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so the applicant may attend the meeting. The Commission will make a decision at the next meeting.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed:

B. 1547 Leda St.

Application: Retention of the demolition of a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of demolition without a Certificate of Appropriateness and to levy a fine of \$42,465.00 for the unpermitted demolition.

By: Jennifer Greene

Second: Tim Lupin

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree

Opposed:

Comments: Susan Johnson spoke against this application.

C. 4016 Saint Claude Ave.

Application: Retention of the removal of openings and installation of inappropriate siding material at a Contributing rated, one-story commercial building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness. Motion: Deny retention of the fiber cement paneling at the front façade of the storefront building, the left-side elevation, and the right-side elevation to the first downspout. The Commission approved retention of the paneling at the right-side elevation beyond the first downspout at that elevation. The Commission approved the retention of the removal of openings at the right-side elevation with the proviso that exterior trim be added to match existing to indicate original openings.

By: Ross Karsen Second: Greg Hackenberg Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed:

D. 342 Olivier St.

Application: Retention of the installation of inappropriate handrails at a Contributing rated, two-story, building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny retention of the as installed condition of the wood, square post balustrade at the porch, including newel posts, deny the combination of wood and metal handrails at the right-side elevation ramp, and deny the fencing at the right-side yard. The Commission noted that the wood, square post balustrade could be installed at the main porch if it matches HDLC detailing. Staff can furnish you with the appropriate detailing for handrails, footrails, and fencing.

By: Shawanda Poree

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree

Opposed:

## E. <u>927 Saint Ferdinand St.</u>

Application: Retention of installation of inappropriate wood grained Hardie weatherboards at left and right sides of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of inappropriate wood grained Hardie weatherboards installed at the left and right sides of the building with a proviso that the siding must be replaced with wood or smooth finish Hardie if replacement is requested in the future so that this inappropriate siding material does not become a permitted non-conformity.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree

Opposed:

# F. 2408 Saint Claude Ave.

Application: Retention of removal of one masonry chimney at rear roof of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the request for retention of removal of one masonry chimney due to the level of care and attention the applicant put forth in the overall renovation of the previously severely deteriorated building, because the chimney removed was far back on the roof with limited visibility from the street, and because the other three chimneys were appropriately repaired and remain.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jennifer Greene

**Result: Passed** 

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed:

### G. 922 Elysian Fields Ave.

Application: Retention of removal of English-V ridge tiles from rear roof of a Contributing rated, two-story, multi-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness. Motion: Deny the request for retention of removal of the previously existing English-V roof ridge tiles based on the HDLC Design Guidelines which note these important roof elements should be maintained, because this area of the rear roof is highly visible from the street, and because the area of tile replacement is limited, and new or salvaged tiles are readily available for purchase and installation. By: Tim Lupin Second: Jason King Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed:

# VII. Ratification of Architectural Review Committee and Staff Actions since the August 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2023, Meeting.

Motion: Approve the ratification of the ARC and Staff Actions since the August 2<sup>nd</sup>, 2023, meeting. By: Jennifer Greene Second: Greg Hackenberg Result: Passed In favor: Jennifer Greene, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ross Karsen, Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree Opposed:

#### VIII. HDLC Reports and Communications

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.