

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: April 28, 2015

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th Floor New Orleans, Louisiana.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:30 p.m.

Members present: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members Absent:

I. AGENDA

1. Approval of the minutes of the March 31, 2015 ARC Meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Wayne Troyer

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 1581 Magazine Street

Application: New construction of a mixed use building.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the revised proposal responded well to previous recommendations and the scale and configuration is now more in keeping with its context. The simplicity and massing is elegant and proportions of bays, windows and canopies are successful. The contrast of the two distinct building forms provides visual interest to the proposal.

However, it was recommended that the residential windows be operable either as awning or single leaf casement windows with shutters in order to give more life to the building. The storefront at the ground floor should have more variety which could be accomplished through varied planes or treatment of glazing. The vertical band that articulates the masonry of the building should be removed above the garage opening. The extrusion of masonry around window openings should be eliminated. Signage and lighting should be planned as part of the overall design strategy. The canopies should not shed water to the sidewalk but should be designed to collect rain water and funnel it into the storm sewer system or for use on-site. Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments: Kathy Singleton, Curtis Pierre and Myron Tuman spoke in opposition to the proposed design.

3. 1476 Magazine Street

Application: Construction of a new multi-story, mixed use building.

Motion: The ARC agreed that "Option B" presented is the more appropriate contextual response. The variety of widths of balconies helps to emphasize the apparent verticality desired. There is some concern that the perpendicular shutters could be problematic at the ground floor extending low and over the public right of way. The structure of the balconies should be exposed and the front edges rendered in metal. Wayne Troyer made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 3614 N. Rampart Street

Application: Construction of single family house on vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC agreed that the revised proposal responded well to previous recommendations. However, the roof pitch should be raised to a minimum of 7:12. The window on the left of the front elevation should be moved somewhat towards the center, enough to eventually receive shutters. The narrow windows on the two story element of the building should be wider as a predominant condition. The small overhang should be eliminated throughout. The sill height of the building should respond to B.F.E and the height of the second floor could possibly be reduced. The columns on the side gallery should be nominally 6x8. John Klingman made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the massing of the proposal.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 1717 Coliseum St

Application: Construction of a rooftop addition on an existing single family residential building.

Motion: Wayne Troyer made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the massing of the proposal. Materials of the rooftop addition should be of a color that approximates that of the surrounding roof so as to mitigate visibility from the public right-of-way.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:
Comments:

6. 2119 Decatur Street

Application: Install standing seam metal roof over existing gallery.

Motion: The ARC agreed that a covered gallery is inappropriate for this building because the proportions of the second floor and cornice are not designed to allow for an appropriately detailed gallery at the second floor without attaching to the decorative brick cornice, which is a characteristic architectural feature. Specifically, the pitch of the roof is too shallow when correctly located below the cornice, and the floor to roof height at the edge of the gallery is too short to allow for an appropriately scaled decorative frieze and brackets that accompany the decorative vertical panels that are used to support a gallery roof at a second floor. The ARC also questioned how the posts would be located and detailed if the Gothic arch guardrail is noted as existing to remain. Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend against conceptual approval of the proposal.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 3220-22 Laurel Street

Application: Demolition of existing building and construction of a new, 2500 sf, two-story, single-family residence.

Motion: The ARC agreed the front corners of the porch at the roof need further study. The depth of the wall between the roof eave and columns is inappropriately deep and appears heavy; this element should read as a beam and not a wall. The previous proposal needed further study, but the design's strength was that it read as a steel frame holding the porch. Furthermore, the gutter disrupts the clean lines of the design; the ARC recommended a concealed, integrated gutter. The ARC agreed the rear, two-story portions of the building are much improved. However, the residual window panels shown in the elevations at all parts of the building are not appropriate; the elevations should reflect the windows in the rendering. Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer further review of the project pending incorporation of the ARC recommendations.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments: Mary White-Hereford, Thomas Martin, Paula Estrada de Martin, Angela Odom, Daniel Campbell, and James Setchim spoke against the design of the new construction.

8. 2414 St. Claude Avenue

Application: Converting a vacant commercial building into a single family dwelling.

Motion: Due to the lack of representation, the ARC did not review the project.

9. 2533 Tchoupitoulas Street

Application: Construct a 1,966 sq. ft. addition and renovate an existing office and warehouse building.

Motion: Beth Jacob made a motion to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommends that the Tchoupitoulas Street elevation of the warehouse building should be articulated to break up the façade. The free standing lighting should be reduced in height to reach a maximum of 15'0". The applicant should explore different options to buffer the surrounding residential neighbors from the parking lot, including landscape buffers on the Rousseau Street and Third Street sides. The ARC suggests further research into the existing office structure, to help guide the restoration of the building.

Seconded: Elliott Perkins

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 428 6th Street

Application: New construction of a 1-story 6,024 sq. ft. warehouse.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. ARC recommends installing a goose-neck lamp over the pedestrian entrance.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 938 Belleville Street

Application: This item was withdrawn

12. 1447 N Villere Street

Application: Renovate existing building and construct 1-story addition.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommends preserving the original window openings. The applicant should install appropriately sized doors and transoms to fit the original openings. Board and batten shutters would not be appropriate for a Greek Revival building, ARC recommends the use of paneled or louvered shutters. Small brackets would be appropriate for the style of the house.

Seconded: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 2223 Carondelet Street

Application: New construction of a 16 unit condominium.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that, as proposed, the project seems overly massive and detailed in a manner that is incompatible to the surrounding historic district. They recommended the applicant redesign the building taking into consideration the HDLC *Guidelines for New Construction* and the adjacent historic context.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

In favor:

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 1341 Independence Street

Application: Construction of a two family, two- story residential building.

Motion: The ARC agreed that there should be two sets of front steps, one for each front door. Windows and doors should be centered within bays on the front elevation. The entire building should be moved forward to the average of the block face. The massing of the building should be more responsive to that of the building to the left than to the later buildings on the block as the building to the left represents the predominant character of the district. As such, the first floor ceiling height should be raised to match that of this existing building. The building should be supported on exposed masonry piers with a continuous chainwall at the front elevation that extends down sides the depth of the porch. The porch should be made deeper, preferably to a 6'-0" depth. The roof form over the front porch should be modified to a simple shed roof, perhaps with a standing seam metal roof. The door sills should be lowered to porch level. The front porch columns should be 6"x8" rectangular wood box columns. Windows should predominantly be 3'-0"x6'-0". The gable vent should be lowered. Roof shingles to be as per HDLC approved materials list. Siding should be wood or smooth finish Hardieplank with 5" reveal with 5/4"x5 cornerboards. Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend conceptual approval of the massing of the proposal with the ARC recommendations and the details to be worked out at the staff level.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

15. 1240 Bartholomew Street

Application: This item was withdrawn.

16. 2127 Prytania Street

Application: Retention of masonry wall, modification of inappropriate metal gate, and modification to bar front installed between piers. All work done without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend denial of the proposal for retention as presented.

The ARC agreed enclosing the area under the front porch could be appropriate if done with fixed, louvered shutters that fill the entire opening and are located at the back side of the piers, and the existing French doors are removed and replaced with the same shutters. Having operable shutters at the ground floor diminishes the architectural character of the raised center hall and is not appropriate. The ARC suggested openings could be added to the existing interior masonry wall to provide access to this area and/or a temporary table or cart could be set up in the courtyard during events.

The ARC agreed the concept of a masonry wall is appropriate, but the wall must be detailed correctly and should be painted a single, consistent color. The decorative molding at the top and bottom of the wall is not appropriate.

The ARC agreed the gates do not meet the Guidelines and are not appropriate.

The ARC agreed a lattice enclosure could be appropriate if it is appropriately designed and detailed, and the height is reduced to at least 6'-6".

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

17.809-15 Frenchmen

Application: General renovation, including addition of a garage door and inset balconies to front facade.

Motion: The ARC agreed the scale of the building positively benefits from changes to the infill between the buildings. Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommend that the Commission grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the following recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level:

- The proportions of the third floor windows should be increased vertically by a factor of 1.5, retaining the sill height. The ARC suggested a stacked pair of awning windows to distinguish that these are not historic windows openings.
- The guardrails at the balconies should be studied further. The ARC suggested they be more contemporary and expressive.
- The exterior wall along the back of the 2nd floor balcony should be set back to make this a more inhabitable space and so that the wall does not interfere with the window to Bedroom 2.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

18.816 Alix Street

Application: New construction of a single family residence with pool on the vacant lot.
Motion: Elliott Perkins made a motion defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that alternate #3 was the best option for infill, with changes to be made to the fenestration to bring the structure more in line with the Arts and Crafts style. The existing overhangs should be decreased to a maximum of 6". The ARC believes a 3D model would help to visualize the proposed size in relation to the neighbors.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result: Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

19.2417 Dauphine Street

Application: Construction of two, two-story multi-family buildings on existing vacant lot.

Motion:

Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommended that the Commission grant conceptual approval of both proposals with the following recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level:

- The front porches should be a minimum of 5'-0" deep.
- The front doors should not be recessed.
- The columns should be 8"x10" and have traditional proportions.
- The required height of the guardrails should be investigated further and lowered to 36" if allowed by code.
- The planters at the front porches should be eliminated.
- Small, square windows should be added to either side of the gable windows to create a tripartite window appropriate to the scale of a five-bay building.

Seconded: Crystal Mitchell

Result:Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

20.2413 Dauphine Street

Application: Construction of two, two-story multi-family buildings on existing vacant lot.

Motion:

Elliott Perkins made a motion to recommended that the Commission grant conceptual approval of both proposals with the following recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level:

- The front porches should be a minimum of 5'-0" deep.
- The front doors should not be recessed.
- The columns should be 8"x10" and have traditional proportions.
- The required height of the guardrails should be investigated further and lowered to 36" if allowed by code.
- The planters at the front porches should be eliminated.

- Small, square windows should be added to either side of the gable windows to create a tripartite window appropriate to the scale of a five-bay building.

Seconded: Beth Jacob

Result:Passed

In favor: Elliott Perkins, Beth Jacob, Wayne Troyer, Crystal Mitchell, John Klingman

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, there being no further business to attend to, the meeting was adjourned.