

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Meeting Minutes

Date: March 19, 2015

Location: City Council Chamber, 1300 Perdido Street, New Orleans, LA

Called to order: 1:15 p.m.

Adjourned: 5:23

Commissioners present: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Tony French, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Commissioners absent: Calvin Alexander

I. Minutes

A. Minutes of the February 12, 2015 meeting

Motion: Approve the meeting minutes.

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

II. CONSENT AGENDA

- A. 4508 St Claude Ave: Ron Martinez, applicant; Joseph O Billeaud, owner; Construction of new two story single family residential building.
- B. 704 Josephine St: Walter Antin III, applicant/owner; Construction of new single family residential building (massing).
- C. 2530 Chartres St: Adam Perschall, applicant; April D Blevins, owner; Demolish 740 sf at rear of existing building and construct a new, two-story addition.
- D. 1425 Laharpe St: Courtney Ordone, applicant; Erin Nichole Dudley, owner; Extensive renovation of single family residential building.
- E. 1203 Bartholomew St: Joseph Bellande, applicant; Armstrong Partners LLC, owner; Construction of new single family residential building.
- F. 3925 Burgundy St: Kristine Shull, applicant; Shea R Embry, owner; Renovation of existing vacant building to multi-family residential building.
- G. 602 Independence St: Kirk Fabacher, applicant; J Alcebo Trust Rene, owner; Construct new two story addition at the rear of an existing residential building.
- H. 1204 Pauline St: Certified Construction Professionals LLC, applicant; Rajesh Dash, owner; Reconstruction of a single family residential building.

- I. 1510 Governor Nicholls St: Andrell Smith, applicant/owner; Construction of a new 2-story single family residence.
- J. 5017 Dauphine St: Neal Manalla, applicant/owner; Construction of a single family residential building.
- K. 2301, 2317, 2327, 2329 Burgundy St: Tracie Ashe, applicant; Peter And Paul LLC, Oddo Of Marigny LLC, owner; General renovation of four buildings, including installation of dormers with skylights or skylights at 2301 Burgundy St.
- L. 421 Harmony St: Justin Mills, applicant; Hector Cabrera, owner; Construct camelback addition.
- M. 2042 Prytania St: Chris Loudon, applicant; Joseph P Zara, 2042 Prytania LLC, owner; Alteration to front façade of an existing grocery store.
- N. 2232 Constance St: Rachel Davis, applicant; Rudolph Francis Heiny, owner; Construction of a two-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: John Deveney

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French, Katy Fayard, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comments:

III. OLD BUSINESS LANDMARK NOMINATION

A. 210 State Street

Application: Landmark Nomination

Motion: Nominate the entire site excluding the six buildings at the Henry Clay Avenue side of the site labeled 10-15 as per Exhibit B, Master Site Plan, for study as a landmark.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Katy Fayard

Amendment to original motion to include the Henry Clay Avenue brick wall as excluded from the nomination.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Seconde: Katy Fayard

Result: Passed

In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French, Katy Fayard, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan

Opposed:

Comment: John Deveney recused himself. Several speakers spoke for and against the proposal.

IV. NEW BUSINESS LANDMARK DESIGNATION

A. 340 S. Olympia Street

Application: Landmark Designation
Motion: Against designation.
By: Ed de Montluzin
Seconded:None
Result: Motion failed due to lack of a second.

Motion: Designate building.
By: Jeanne Nathan
Seconded: John Deveney
Result: No action
For: John Deveney, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan
Against: Renee Lapeyroterie, Marlene Jaffe, Dwight Norton, Ed de Montluzin, Tony French, Greg Hackenberg

Motion: Defer action 30 days.
By: Marlene Jaffe
Seconded: Renee Lapeyroterie
Result: Passed
For: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Renee Lapeyroterie, Anthony French, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan
Opposed: Ed de Montluzin

At this time, Jeanne Nathan left the meeting.

V. OLD BUSINESS WORK APPLICATIONS

A. 1016 DelarondeStreet

Application: Installation of solar panels on highly visible roof slope.
Motion: Approve application.
By: Heather Szapary
Seconded: Dwight Norton
Result: Passed
In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyroterie, Anthony French, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary, Jeanne Nathan
Opposed:

VI. NEW BUSINESS WORK APPLICATIONS

Add this time, the Commission added an item to the agenda.

A. 1200 St. Andrew Street

Motion: Approve application.
By: Greg Hackenberg
Seconded: Ed Montluzin
Result: Passed
In favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyroterie, Anthony French, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary
Opposed:

A. 1500 St. Charles Avenue

Application: Installation of a temporary fence around a temporary corner parking lot.

Motion: Grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level for a period of time not to exceed two years.

By: Ed de Montluzin

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary

Opposed:

B. 2322 St. Thomas Street

Application: Demolition and selective salvage of existing building, and construction of new, two-story, 4267 sf, two-family residence.

Motion: Grant conceptual approval of the proposal with the recommendations of the ARC and the details to be worked out at the Staff level, on the condition the site is appropriately fenced until the new construction is commenced.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary

Opposed:

C. 924-926 Gallier Street

Application: Removing slate roof and installing architectural-grade shingles.

Motion: Grant approval of the removal of the existing slate roof and installation of HDLC approved asphalt shingle roofing.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary

Opposed:

D. 2434 St. Charles Avenue

Application: Installation of expansion joints.

Motion: Defer matter 30 days.

By: Ed de Montluzin

Seconded: Renee Laperolerie

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary

Opposed:

VII. NEW BUSINESS DEMOLITION APPLICATIONS

A. 801 Verret Street

Application: Demolition of building.

Motion: This application was withdrawn.

B. 1206 Jackson Avenue

Application: Demolition of building.

Motion: Approve application.

By: Renee Laperolerie

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary

Opposed:

C. 2352 St. Thomas St, 515-523 First St, 534-546 Soraparu St

Application: Demolition of building.

Motion: Approve application.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Ed de Montluzin

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary

Opposed:

D. 1700 Louisiana Avenue

Application: Demolition of building.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition, provided a \$10,000.00 bond is posted to the Historic District Landmarks Commission assuring new construction plans be submitted within 18 months and construction started within 2 years.

By: Ed de Montluzin

Seconded: John Deveney

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary

Opposed:

E. 824 N. Prieur Street

Application: Demolish to grade under the CNO FEMA funded demolition program.

Motion: Approve application

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Seconded: Tony French

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French, Katye Fayard, Heather Szapary

Opposed:

At this time Katye Fayard left the meeting.

F. 3114 Urquhart Street

Application: Demolish to grade under the CNO FEMA funded demolition program.

Motion: Approve application.

By: Tony French

Seconded: Ed de Montluzin

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French, Heather Szapary

Opposed:

VIII. OLD BUSINESS RETENTION APPLICATIONS

A. 1129 N. Robertson Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate windows installed without CofA.

Motion: Grant retention of the windows provided the trim is reworked so that the windows appear to be more recess mounted. The HDLC has requested that the windows be removed and mounted on opposite sides of the building as where they are currently located. The windows on the left side would be more appropriate if mounted on the right side and vice versa.

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French, Heather Szapary

Opposed:

At this time, Heather Szapary left the meeting.

B. 1317 Henriette Delille Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate front porch modifications.

Motion: Deny the retention and allow 12 months to make corrections.

By: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Seconded: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French

Opposed:

Comment:

IX. NEW BUSINESS RETENTION APPLICATIONS

A. 2101 Prytania Street

Application: Retention of dormer windows installed in deviation of approved plans.

Motion: Deny retention.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Dwight Norton

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French

Opposed:

Comment:

B. 813 Poland Avenue

Application: Retention of inappropriate windows installed in deviation of approved plans.

Motion: Approve the retention of the windows provided a seven foot tall capped wood vertical board or horizontal seven-board fence is installed along the side property lines and across the front in line with the front elevation of the building.

By: Tony French

Seconded: John Deveney

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French

Opposed:

Comment:

C. 1911 Magazine Street

Application: Retention of metal fencing and gates installed in deviation of approved plans.

Motion: This item was withdrawn.

D. 1127 Bartholomew Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate windows and doors installed without CofA.

Motion: Grant the retention of the windows and door on side elevation provided that the wood fence recently installed is outfitted with a wood cap and deny the retention of the window on the front elevation and allow 12 months for the window to be corrected.

By: Tony French

Seconded: John Deveney

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French

Opposed:

Comment:

E. 718 8th Street

Application: Retention of front porch built in deviation of approved drawings.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of the porch constructed in deviation, provided that corrections have been made to the previous violations

By: Greg Hackenberg

Seconded: Dwight Norton

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French

Opposed:

Comment:

At this time, Greg Hackenberg left the meeting.

F. 1430 Royal Street

Application: Retention of front porch built in deviation of approved drawings.

Motion: Deny the application for retention of the guardrails, handrail, and gates as built, but allow seven (7) months for the applicant to make corrections that comply with the Guidelines with details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: John Deveney

Seconded: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French

Opposed:

Comment:

G. 616 Philip Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate door installed without CofA.

Motion: Defer action 30 days.

By: Ed de Montluzin

Seconded: Renee Lapeyrolerie

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French

Opposed:

H. 939-41 6th Street

Application: Retention of highly visible a/c unit installed on a roof and side canopy without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of the a/c units mounted on the roof provided a screen is installed and retention of the side canopy with corrections to be made to meet HDLC requirements, with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Ed de Montluzin

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In Favor: Marlene Jaffe, Dwight Norton, Heather Szapary, Jesse LeBlanc, John Deveney, Ed deMontluzin, Renee Lapeyrolerie, Anthony French

Opposed:

Comment:

At thistime the Commission lost quorum.