

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission  
Architectural Review Committee  
Meeting Minutes

Date: February 23, 2021

Location: Zoom Teleconference

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Members present: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent:

---

## I. AGENDA

1. Minutes of the January 19, 2021 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Beth Jacobs

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed: None

Comments:

2. 3401 St. Charles Ave.

Application: New construction of a 115-unit mixed-use development with ground floor commercial space fronting St. Charles and Louisiana Avenue.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval of the proposed massing with the details to be worked out at the ARC level and the proviso that an approximately 40' by 40' ground-floor garden space be included and that if the BZA height waiver is denied then the project will return for additional ARC review of the massing. The ARC also agreed that:

- The proposed footprint fills out the site with building and parking and appears monolithic from the surrounding streets without the interplay of public and garden spaces typical of large scale buildings found along St. Charles Avenue. The ARC reiterated that there should be more green space on the block and the proposed perimeter treatment was not sufficient.
- The ARC recommended including an area approximately 40' by 40' at the ground level for exterior garden space that steps up at the rear to a more private area. The garden space should be visually accessible from the sidewalk but does not need to be physically accessible.

- Images of the previous historic retail condition at the sidewalk along Louisiana Avenue could be helpful for further discussion.

By: John Klingman

Second: Cynthia Dubberly

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed: None

Comments:

3. 1738 N. Rampart St.

Application: New construction of a rear one-story, multi-unit hotel building to match previously existing residential structure demolished to grade in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Beth Jacobs

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 3500 St. Claude Ave.

Application: Removal of an existing window opening and installation of a new exterior door on a Landmark building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval of the proposal with final details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 901 Elmira Ave.

Application: New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer this application for additional review so that the applicant may provide the requested context drawing and attend the meeting. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The applicant needs to provide a context elevation drawing showing the relationship of the proposed new construction to the existing buildings on the block.
- On the front elevation, the windows should be centered in their respective bays.
- More windows need to be added to the side elevations, particularly the right side facing the cross street.
- The window trim is drawn very narrow. If this is meant to be a non-standard window trim, a detail should be provided.

- The header heights of all door and window openings need to align.
- More details are needed on the porch columns.
- The continuous chainwall should only be used to wrap around the base of the front porch. Wood slat screening or faux piers can be used on the sides and rear of the building.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 4219 Royal St.

Application: New construction of a two-story single family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer this application for additional review and made the following comments:

- The entablature piece requires additional exploration. Submit different options for how far the entablature extends down the side of the building. The introduction of louvres is not successful. Weatherboards should extend up to the top of the parapet.
- The height of the building does not fit contextually. Reduce the overall building height by reducing the ceiling heights.
- Submit 3-dimensional views for ARC discussion.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 1524 Piety St.

Application: New construction of a 2,100 SF, two-story, two family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend the Commission approve the application with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC made the following comments:

- The columns should be rectangular in plan with the wider dimension facing the street.
- The both side elevations need more windows.
- The left side elevation window sill height is too high. The windows should be consistent with the taller windows on the right-side elevation.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 3420 Burgundy St.

Application: Structural renovation to an existing single family residential building to include a camelback addition.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer this application for additional review and made the following comments:

- There should only be one side entry and the design should be less prominent than the primary entry.
- Submit 3-dimensional views of the building from the street to determine if the massing of the large rear addition is appropriately scaled.
- 2-D context elevation must be submitted for ARC review.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 606 Frenchmen St.

Application: Facade restoration of existing contributing two-story commercial building including installation of new gallery at previously existing location.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC noted that the second-floor windows were probably closer to 9'-0" tall rather than the proposed 7'-8" openings based on their proportion to the parapet above and recommended the applicant continue with interior exploratory demolition to verify if evidence of the original window header heights exist. The ARC also recommended that the gallery have three bays of posts rather than the proposed two so that the vertical supports fall more in rhythm with the existing first-floor façade.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Cynthia Dubberly

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 1516-18 Louisa St.

Application: Renovation of existing contributing one-story, two-family residential building (after-the-fact).

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Beth Jacobs

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 2377 Rousseau St.

Application: New construction of a three-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Cynthia Dubberly made a motion to recommend the Commission approve the application with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC made the following comments:

- The parking stripes should be moved so that they are 3'-0" from the property line and the parking should be 18'-0" from the front wall of the house towards the rear.
- Window openings should be added to the side elevations.
- The roof at the front façade should be increased in slope so that it becomes taller than the roof terrace railing.
- The railing at the roof terrace should be as minimal as possible. The ARC suggested using a handrail with cables.

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 1012 Richard St.

Application: Construction of a camelback addition at a one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend the Commission approve the application with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC made the following comments:

- Exploratory demolition should be performed at the primary façade for any evidence of front doors.
- If front doors are not installed and the side entrances remain, the new stairs should be flipped so that they face the street. The wood gates should be replaced with a more transparent option, like metal, to create some connection to the street.

Second: Beth Jacobs

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 3228 Laurel St.

Application: Remove existing steps and construct new porch landing at front facade.

Motion: Amanda Rivera made a motion to recommend approval of the application with the details to be worked out at staff level. The ARC made the following comments:

- The new landing should be moved further to the right, closer to the corner board.
- The porch decking should be concrete. The vents should be removed from the new landing.

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 933 Terpsichore St.

Application: New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to defer to the next meeting. The ARC made the following comments:

- A full streetscape should be included for the next meeting.
- The eave at the front façade is too high compared to the context. ARC suggested sloping the roof from back to front so that the lower end is at the front façade.
- The garage opening should be updated to a more transparent material such as slats or a metal gate.
- The projection at the front façade is acontextual and instead should be recessed to create a porch condition. The ARC also recommended that the front façade composition should be simpler and that the window configuration needs further study.
- Other items included adding material differences and trim details to the drawings, the tinted glass is not appropriate, and the historic lantern should be more contemporary.

Second: Cynthia Dubberly

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

15. 430 Eighth St.

Application: New construction of a two-story addition at the rear of an existing two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to defer to the next meeting. The ARC made the following comments:

- The rear addition should be detailed to differentiate from the historic house and camelback. The ARC suggested using smaller exposure siding or vertical siding and a metal roof.
- The changes, including the brackets and roofline, to the front façade are not appropriate. The ARC suggested a shed roof awning with a metal roof.

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

16. 939-41 Thalia St.

Application: After-the-fact new construction of side addition and awning of a one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: John Klingman made a motion to recommend the Commission approve the application with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC made the following comments:

- Remove the gable roof at the addition to simplify the form and help minimize the new addition.

- Cut back the awning from the front wall of the house and lower it as much as possible to minimize the visibility. The corrugated plastic on the awning should be replaced with a more durable and appropriate material.

Second: Beth Jacobs

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

There being no further matters to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.