

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission  
Architectural Review Committee  
Meeting Minutes

Date: June 15, 2021

Location: Zoom Teleconference

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Members present: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent:

---

**I. AGENDA**

1. Minutes of the May 18, 2021 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Beth Jacobs

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 3715 Marais St

Application: Renovation of existing contributing one-story, single-family residential building including construction of new 790 SF side addition.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the window on the front façade should be a wood material, sized to fit the existing historic opening and should have a 2-over-2 muntin configuration with equally sized upper and lower sashes. The ARC also agreed that the header heights of the façade window and the recessed porch window to the right should align.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacobs

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 5718 St Charles Ave

Application: New construction of a two-story side addition and new rear porch on an existing significant rated two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the proposed change at the left roof gable for a new elevator overrun at the interior was acceptable as presented. The ARC also agreed that Alternate 1 was much improved over the previous iteration and is the preferred option. The ARC declined to recommend Alternate 2 as an option because of the proposed column replacement and recommended that the new columns at the port cochere replicate the design and detailing of the historic turned-wood porch columns.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 1232 St Bernard Ave

Application: New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building with a third-floor roof deck.

Motion: Conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at staff level.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: For both properties at 1232 and 1238 St. Bernard, the ARC recommended verifying that the parking is 18' from the front wall of the building and that the front porches are solid and not open underneath. For 1232 St. Bernard, the ARC recommended moving the third floor stair well massing to the left side of the building and pushing it back from the parapet wall so that the massing sits on the two-story portion of the building and makes less of a visual impact. The weatherboards at the front, more traditional massing of the building, should be a different size than the weatherboards at the three-story portion of the building to better differentiate the massing's.

5. 1238 St Bernard Ave

Application: New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at staff level.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: For both properties at 1232 and 1238 St. Bernard, the ARC recommended verifying that the parking is 18' from the front wall of the building and that the front porches are solid and not open underneath.

6. 1359-61 Columbus St

Application: New construction of a two-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Defer the application.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: The ARC requested a streetscape elevation for the next meeting. The ARC recommended simplifying the style of the building or using a more contextual style for the neighborhood. The ARC suggested going in a more Italianate direction with a front porch with box columns and second floor balcony with a deep overhang and brackets. The ARC recommended making the porch deeper and using more appropriate window types and railings for the style of the building. The ARC also requested that the amount of paving at the front yard be verified with Zoning.

7. 826-28 N Robertson St

Application: Renovate existing two-family cottage and construct new two-story addition at rear.

Motion: Defer the application.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: The ARC recommended raising the floor to ceiling heights in the new addition to 8' and raising the new crickets to the same ridge level as the existing dormers. The windows at the new addition should be more traditional in size and proportion and the existing windows should be retained in their existing locations. The ARC stated that a catch basin or downspout should be added at the eave where the addition meets the existing building. The front door proportions should be reevaluated to be more traditional.

8. 935 Third St

Application: Renovation and addition to an existing one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Conceptual approval of the application with the details to be worked out at staff level

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 911 Jackson Ave

Application: Renovation and two-story addition of a one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Defer the application.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: The ARC agreed that the proposed addition overwhelmed the existing one-story building and asked that the massing, style, connection to the existing building, and connection to the street be further reviewed. The ARC suggested making the new addition narrower and longer so that it could be moved further away from the existing building and have less massing facing the street. They also recommended connecting the addition to the existing building with a minimal one-story connection piece that is set back from the street.

10. 709-11 Lizardi St

Application: New construction of 1,450 SF one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC recommended that all the windows have a 2-over-2 muntin configuration rather than the 4-over-4 as shown to emphasize their verticality. The ARC also agreed that the HVAC must be minimally visible from all surrounding public rights of way and that a square 6" x 6" column at the side porch was appropriate.

By: Beth Jacobs

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 942 Washington Ave

Application: Renovation and addition of an existing one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Defer the application.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: The ARC requested that further research and/or exploratory demolition be done to find the historic openings at the commercial unit of the property. The ARC recommended that a trim board be added between the existing building and the new addition.

12. 3149 St Thomas St

Application: New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Defer the application.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: The ARC agreed that the style, massing, and scale of the proposed building were not appropriate to the immediate context or the neighborhood. The surrounding context is quite modest in style and scale and a high-style Greek Revival center hall is out of context.

13. 312 Seguin St

Application: Renovation of one-story residential building, including installation of two new dormers at front elevation and one shed-roofed dormer at rear elevation and modification of roofline at side addition.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with their recommendations and the final details to be reviewed at the staff level.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: The ARC determined that the siding on the side walls of the new front dormers should be wood to match the existing siding on the front façade.

14. 1023 Opelousas Ave

Application: Renovation of one-story residential building, including installation of two new dormers at front elevation and one shed-roofed dormer at rear elevation and modification of roofline at side addition.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with their recommendations and the final details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: The ARC agreed that the detailing of the window on the front façade is awkward. The transom above the window should be eliminated and the porch deck should be brought up so there is less of a gap between the porch and the sills.

15. 338 Opelousas Ave

Application: Renovation of existing one-story commercial building.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with their recommendations and the final details to be reviewed at the staff level.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

16. 900 Philip St

Application: After-the-fact renovation of a contributing accessory building, including the installation of plastic corrugated siding at left elevation.

Motion: Conceptual approval of the plastic and metal corrugated siding with the final approval to be determined by the HDLC Commission.

By: Beth Jacobs

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Beth Jacob, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: The ARC could not make a recommendation on the windows, as the installed windows are against the HDLC Guidelines.