

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: December 20th, 2022

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, LA, 70112.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Members present: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera

I. AGENDA

1. Minutes of the November 15th, 2022, meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 840 Spain St.

Application: Request to remove existing cantilevered balcony for installation of new column-supported balcony at a Non-Contributing rated, two-story, multi-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. Please submit one set of stamped/final detailed drawings reflecting the recommendations of the Architectural Review Committee.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed.

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 3401 St. Charles Ave.

Application: Change of massing and final detail review of previously approved new construction of a 114-unit mixed-use development with ground floor commercial space fronting St. Charles and Louisiana Avenues.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the final details to be worked out at the Staff level and for the Delachaise Street building to return for additional ARC review if Staff determines this is necessary.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed.

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 1313-1329 Jackson Ave.

Application: Installation of new mechanical equipment on a street facing elevation of a designated Landmark.

Motion: Due to lack of quorum the ARC could not make a recommendation to the Commission. The following recommendations will be ratified at the next ARC meeting. The ARC stated that the electrical box should move to the far-left corner by the side entrance and that the back flow box should be painted to match the landscaping.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed.

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments: Beth Jacob recused herself.

4. 623 Orange St:

Application: Renovation and new addition at a Landmark, two-story, commercial building.

Motion: Due to lack of quorum the ARC could not make a recommendation to the Commission. The following recommendations will be ratified at the next ARC meeting. The ARC stated the windows in the new building should be casements and the bathroom window can be fixed. The brick wall should have a detailed termination point.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second:

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments: Beth Jacob recused herself.

5. 1500 Henry Clay Ave.

Application: Renovation of a Non-Contributing garage building on a Landmark site

Motion: The ARC voted to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the 8/12 roof pitch was more appropriate and requested more views of the alternate pitch in relation to the rear of the main building. The ARC stated the decorative pilasters at the front of the garage should just be typical trim with the addition of sconces on either side of the garage door.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 1501 Tchoupitoulas St.

Application: Changes to previously approved renovation of individually Landmarked commercial building including new wraparound gallery, window replacement, and new courtyard gate.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer this application until such time that the applicant can confirm the location of utilities for location of the gallery posts. The ARC stated the new windows in the courtyard should be casement windows.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 5718 St Charles Ave.

Application: Request to remove existing wood front entry stairs for replacement with new brick entry stairs and modified handrail at existing Significant rated two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC acknowledged the Guidelines prohibit the replacement of existing wood stairs with brick, and so this portion of the request cannot be recommended for approval unless there is other historic documentation available indicating the original steps were brick. The ARC also agreed that the proposed handrail changes are appropriate regardless of whether the stairs are rebuilt in wood or brick. The ARC also noted that as much of the original wood handrails should be reused as possible.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 2239 Bayou Rd.

Application: Renovation and addition to a Contributing rated, two-story, two-family residential building

Motion: The ARC voted to defer your application for additional review. The ARC agreed that

- The addition of a front porch and craftsman elements give a false impression of the history of the building.
- Despite being altered, the building alterations were completed early enough in the building's history and that they are contributing to the history of the building.
- The proposed changes alter the building in such a way that it's unrecognizable.
- Further study could be undertaken with interior exploration demolition to understand the history of early renovations.
- A more sympathetic renovation would be more appropriate for the context of the building and neighborhood.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 506 Jackson Ave.

Application: New construction of a 3,577 SF, single-family, residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

The ARC stated the stairs at the front porch should be enclosed.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 1022 Erato St.

Application: New construction of a 3,005 SF three-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer the application for additional review. The ARC agreed that

- The 3-story massing is inappropriate in the context of the mixed use industrial and residential neighborhood.
- A shift of the 2-story massing from the rear of the building to the front may be more appropriate.
- The "postage stamp" lot seems to require a more modest building.
- The building should have a more industrial quality in materiality and a lower pitched roof.
- A perspective from Magazine Street is needed to understand the building in the context of the neighborhood.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments: Tina Scott and Geoffery Meeker spoke against this application

11. 3301 Chippewa St.

Application: Detail review of the renovation and addition to a Contributing rated, 1-1/2 story, commercial building.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level, provided that the locations of the existing utilities are investigated prior to construction and do not affect the proposed placement of the posts for the new awning. The ARC stated that the underside of the awning should be open.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 3801-3803 Dauphine St.

Application: Renovation and new construction of a camelback addition at a Contributing rated, two-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that

- The second story camelback windows should be two over two double hung not the proposed four over four.
- Asbestos siding should be replaced with Hardie Plank siding with a 5" reveal.
- Retain repair/replace existing six over six windows at existing building.
- Vertical trim board should be installed to delineate the camelback from the existing building.
- No apron sills should be installed at windows.
- Foundation screening should be provided at the camelback foundation to screen piers. Can be horizontal or lattice screening.
- The Pauline Street side entry elevation should be corrected to better understand the installation of the proposed awning.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 637-639 Lizardi St.

Application: New construction of a 2710 SF two-story, two-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC voted to approve your application. The ARC agreed that

- Verification of window details match between the elevation sheets and window detail sheets.
- 2 windows still need to be added to the Royal Street side at the front of the building.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 1133 N Villere St.

Application: Renovation and camelback addition of existing building and new construction of a 980 SF second primary structure at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building

Motion: The ARC voted to defer your application for additional review. The ARC agreed that

- The first scheme presented is preferable to the two standalone buildings.
- Renovating a single story, single bay shotgun to a 3-story building is overwhelming.
- Multiple building/addition massing iterations should be explored to address neighboring buildings.
- A meeting with the applicant and HDLC Staff should occur prior to the next ARC submission.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

15. 1463 Henriette Delille St.

Application: This application was withdrawn.

16. 3419 Annunciation St.

Application: Construction of a 620 SF garage at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

17. 3252 St. Thomas St.

Application: Renovation and construction of a camelback addition at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

The ARC stated that the windows at the existing building should remain 6/6 lites.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

18. 1240 Seventh St.

Application: New construction of 5,200 SF two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC moved to defer this application for additional review. The ARC agreed that

- The proposed building type, form and massing appear appropriate and contextual with the surrounding area; however, these details must relate in scale and proportion to the existing surrounding historic context. The applicant must investigate and verify existing adjacent building dimensions to update and correct any discrepancies or inaccuracies in the context drawing to avoid the issues experienced at 1464 Camp Street.
- The first-floor floor-to-ceiling height could potentially be increased slightly to better relate to the adjacent one-story structure once its existing dimensions are verified.
- Additional building details should be provided for the next review including a complete section through the porch and entablature.
- The applicant should coordinate with the Garden District Association for input on the proposed new construction in advance of the next meeting.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

19. 3513 Chartres St.

Application: Exterior siding change from brick to vertical board and batten at a new construction of three-story, single-family commercial short term rental building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the recessed portion of the front façade should remain as vertical siding and board and batten at the front façade should be removed. Board and batten should be horizontal siding to match the side elevations. Revised drawings should be submitted for HDLC review and approval prior to siding installation.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

20. 3517 Chartres St.

Application: Exterior siding change from brick to vertical board and batten at a new construction of three-story, single-family commercial short term rental building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the recessed portion of the front façade should remain as vertical siding and board and batten at the front façade should be removed. Board and batten should be horizontal siding to match the side elevations. Revised drawings should be submitted for HDLC review and approval prior to siding installation.

By: Cynthia Dubberley
Second: Tracie Ashe
Result: Passed
In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe
Opposed:
Comments:

21. 3521 Chartres St.

Application: Exterior siding change from brick to vertical board and batten at a new construction of three-story, single-family commercial short term rental building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the recessed portion of the front façade should remain as vertical siding and board and batten at the front façade should be removed. Board and batten should be horizontal siding to match the side elevations. Revised drawings should be submitted for HDLC review and approval prior to siding installation.

By: Cynthia Dubberley
Second: Tracie Ashe
Result: Passed
In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe
Opposed:
Comments:

22. 842 Teche St.

Application: This application was deferred and not heard by the committee.

23. 1517 Louisa St.

Application: New construction of 500 SF camelback addition to a Contributing rated, one-story, multi-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that windows should be installed at the front façade of the camelback as well as the left and right-side elevations. This item has been placed on the consent agenda of the next New Orleans HDLC Commission meeting to be held on Wednesday, January 4, 2023, in the City Council Chamber, City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, beginning at 1:30 p.m.

By: Beth Jacob
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe
Opposed:
Comments:

24. 3141 N Rampart St.

Application: Construction of a 230 SF addition at the left-side rear elevation of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the left-side addition wall should be inset 8-12" at the location of the proposed half bath. The ARC also agreed that the hipped roof proposed in option three should be selected. This item has been placed on the consent agenda of the next New Orleans HDLC Commission meeting to be held on Wednesday, January 4, 2023, in the City Council Chamber, City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, beginning at 1:30 p.m.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

25. 916 Teche St.

Application: New construction of a 3,300 SF two-story, two-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that more windows should be added at the right-side elevation closer to the front wall. This item has been placed on the consent agenda of the next New Orleans HDLC Commission meeting to be held on Wednesday, January 4, 2023, in the City Council Chamber, City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, beginning at 1:30 p.m. It is strongly recommended that you attend this meeting to answer any questions or concerns the Commission might have.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

26. 305 Vallette St.

Application: Construction of roof top addition at a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the roof top addition should be setback 6" from the rear corner of the existing building at the Pelican Street elevation. This item has been placed on the consent agenda of the next New Orleans HDLC Commission meeting to be held on Wednesday, January 4, 2023, in the City Council Chamber, City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, beginning at 1:30 p.m.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

27. 928 Felicity St.

Application: Construction of roof top addition at a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer the application, and agreed that

- Exploration of alternate location(s) for the new ADA ramp(s) to be explored to best serve the congregation.
- The second smaller gable on the shed roof addition to be eliminated to allow larger gable to prominently display new entry.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

28. 1578 Magazine St.

Application: Renovation and storefront changes to a Significant and Contributing rated, mixed-use buildings.

Motion: The ARC voted to approve this application and agreed that the dental molding at non-contributing commercial structure parapet give a false historical impression and should be simplified.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

29. 3101 Esplanade Ave.

Application: Renovation of a Non-Contributing rated, one-story commercial building.

Motion: The ARC voted to approve this application and agreed that

- The fence design at front planters seems aggressive and greenery should be added as part of design.
- The physical separation caused by parking in front of patio should be remedied by exploring patio/green space layouts. Extending the patio toward Esplanade and removing some of the patio on the N. Lopez side was the preferred solution.
- Fencing should be placed as required on Ponce de Leon side of the building to conceal any mechanical equipment.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

30. 1500 Esplanade Ave.

Application: Construction of a rear canopy at a Contributing rated, two-story, commercial building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. This item has been placed on the consent agenda of the next New Orleans HDLC Commission meeting to be held on Wednesday, January 4, 2023, in the City Council Chamber, City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, beginning at 1:30 p.m.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

31. 827 Marigny St.

Application: Construction of new 90SF bathroom and porch addition at front of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC agreed the updated proposal successfully responds to the previous recommendations and is appropriate for the existing historic building. The ARC also agreed that additional landscape screening should be planted to further reduce the visibility of the addition from the street.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

32. 633 St Roch.

Application: Construction of new accessory pergola structure at rear yard of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC agreed the proposed green screen should be pulled away from the rear face of the building a minimum of 1'-0". The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe

Opposed:

Comments:

33. 725 Mandeville St.

Application: This application was incomplete, and therefore not heard by the ARC.

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.