

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: March 29, 2022

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, LA, 70112.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Members present: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting: Beth Jacob

Members absent:

I. AGENDA

1. 4551 Burgundy St.

Application: New construction of two-story, 4,074 SF mixed use building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level with agreeance that overall paving be minimized and windows in sleeping spaces be operable.

By: John Klingman

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 2033 Burgundy St.

Application: Request to install new GAF Timberline solar shingles on existing contributing one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level with agreeance that:

- The 2-3" tall vertical conduit lines and junction boxes are problematic because they are visually awkward and contrast with the surrounding panels and become visually obtrusive where traditional panel arrays allow for their concealment below the arrays.
- The overall product appears to be less reflective than the previously reviewed Tesla Solar Shingles but is less articulated and less integrated with the surrounding existing roof.
- There is some concern about legibility in that the product may not be easily recognizable as a modern solar power product and may be confused as an alternative roofing material.

- The product may not meet the Guidelines for solar panels which require low contrast between panels and frames and between the array and the surrounding roof. This could be mitigated if the vertical conduit lines and junction boxes were made the same color as the panels.
- This property's roof is highly visible from the corner of Frenchmen Street, however, the ARC agreed that it would be acceptable for the array to be retained if the first panel closest to the front building wall and all junction boxes at the ridge are removed.
- The proposed solar shingle product could be reviewed and approved at the Staff level if the proposed layout complies with the Guidelines and junction boxes are not installed.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 2850 Annunciation St.

Application: Renovation and construction of a new second-floor addition at a two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Defer the application for further study, requesting that 3D views from the public right-of-way be submitted with the next set of drawings, stating:

- The front door, window, and stairs be retained and recommended consolidating the amount of different window types used in the new proposal and that the elevations of the existing building should accurately reflect the existing windows.
- Siding and punched windows were not appropriate at the enclosed second-floor side gallery and suggested cladding it with new louvered shutters or paneling to maintain the character gallery.
- Shutters should be installed at all typical windows at side elevations and camelback.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 621-23 Ninth St.

Application: Renovation and construction of a two-story addition at rear of a one-story, single-family residential building, including construction of a new screened porch.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at staff level.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 901-03 Louisiana Ave, 3341-43 Laurel St.

Application: Renovation and construction of a new two-story addition at rear of a one-story commercial building, including demolition of the existing rear addition.

Motion: Conceptual approving of the massing with the details to be worked out at ARC level. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The front pitch at the new addition should match the pitch of the existing roof
- The screening at the new addition should be wood
- The inset balcony should have wood cladding
- The metal siding on the addition should be simplified
- The new clerestory transom windows should align with the existing
- The small window next to the inset balcony should be more typical in size and proportion

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 1220 Kerlerec St.

Application: New construction of a three-story, two-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Defer the application for further study. The ARC stated that the proposed building should more accurately reflect a raised basement condition including lowering the foundation height to the minimum BFE and lowering the ceiling height at the first-floor porch and garage. The ARC recommended inseting the garage doors into the garage and using carriage doors rather than a roll-up door. Windows should be added at the side elevations near the front of the house in the foyer and library and windows should align vertically.

By: John Klingman

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 1243 N Robertson St.

Application: New construction of a two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Defer the application to allow the applicant to meet with the HDLC staff prior to the next meeting. The ARC made the following recommendations:

- The height of the foundation should be brought down to the minimum BFE
- The foundation at the side elevation should be open piers rather than solid with vents
- Full height windows should be used on the front façade in lieu of the French doors
- The dormer needs further study and should be narrower in proportion. Consider two, narrower, traditional dormers rather than one wide one.
- The proportions of the entablature need further study
- The roof pitch, height and configuration need further study

- The side porch needs a return soffit

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 3067 Dauphine St.

Application: Installation of metal asphalt shingle roof material at a one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Denial of the application.

By: John Klingman

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 830 Piety St.

Application: New construction of a two-story, multi-unit residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Defer application for additional review. The ARC agreed that the following changes be made:

- Provide an accessible and designated front entrance at the front façade of the building on the left.
- The proposed double garage-like door should be reworked into a single carriage-style gate for vehicular access with a pedestrian gate as well.
- Reconfigure the massing to bring the building on the right side to the front property line.
- Consider a massing strategy that includes two town house structures, one of which includes a carriageway that provides access to the rear parking.

By: John Klingman

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 4429 N Rampart St.

Application: Modifications to windows and doors at rear of a one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the center door/entry could be shifted to the left and the existing window at that area replace the door, shifting the window to the right.

By: John Klingman

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 619 St Roch Ave

Application: Construction of a new 1,000 SF full second-floor addition at a non-contributing, one-story commercial building including change of roof form and installation of dormers.

Motion: Defer application for additional review, with agreeance that:

- The proposed proportions, massing and roof form don't appear to adequately replicate the previous building condition in the submitted historic photo. In particular, the first-floor front elevation appears to be too squat, and the first-floor ceiling height should be increased.
- The proposed massing of the dormered side gable roof addition is larger than the original building and it appears to be top-heavy. The applicant should reconsider the overall massing and it may be more appropriate in this case to have a full second-floor addition rather than to introduce such a large new roof form.
- Alternatively, the location of the roof ridge could be shifted further back to allow for a change in the roof pitches and to allow for more appropriately proportioned dormers. For example, the dormers could become more vertical in their orientation or become more of an integrated element of the façade.
- The roof overhang at the front elevation is awkward and should be eliminated. If an overhang at this location is desired, then a simpler and more additive element would be more appropriate.
- A ground-level perspective view of the proposal should be included in the resubmitted materials for the next meeting review.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 3150 Urquhart St

Application: New construction of a two-story addition to rear of a two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the depth of the overhang at the gable should be pulled back.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 625 Flood St

Application: New construction of a single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- The roof height and pitch are too steep and should be reduced.
- There are too many different types of windows; windows should also be aligned with each other.
- The front door sizes should be consistent with one another.
- The building needs gutters and downspouts.
- The trim band on the side of the building should continue across the front façade

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Tracy Ash

Result: Passed

In favor: Cynthia Dubberley, John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed: None

Comments: