

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: June 14, 2022

Location: City Hall, 1300 Perdido Street, 8th Floor Homeland Security Conference Room, New Orleans, LA, 70112.

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Members present: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Amanda Rivera

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting: Amanda Rivera

Members absent: John Klingman

I. AGENDA

1. Minutes of the May 17, 2022 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 2121 Chartres St

Application: Renovation of existing contributing 1-1/2 story commercial building and facade demolition of existing non-contributing two-story commercial building for conversion to hotel use.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- The light fixtures in the façade channels should be less visible and more integrated, such as embedded at the base of the channel. The ARC also recommended the applicant consider any future ambient or security lighting that may be necessary so these fixtures can be integrated into the minimal and clean-lined design along Elysian Fields Avenue.
- The windows units in the façade channels should be darker in color and more integrated into the channel reveal.
- A subtle distinction between the proposed new brick portion of exterior wall above the existing first-floor portion to remain is appropriate, however, the break line between the two should occur at the lower edge of the brick band on the existing adjacent masonry building. Any required structural members necessary to carry the load of the new masonry needs to be included in architectural elevations and structural drawings. This element will inevitably be visible so it must be appropriately detailed and reviewed.

By: Cynthia Dubberley
Second: Beth Jacob
Result: Passed
In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:

3. 621 Celeste St

Application: Renovation of existing three-story, multi-family building and construction of an adjoining three-story multi-family addition.

Motion: Conceptually approve the massing with the details to be reviewed at the ARC. The ARC recommended the following:

- Windows in the residential units should be operable and suggested varying the windows with the bedrooms having a single window and the living spaces having two.
- A larger arrival point at the rear of access door and suggested using a canopy.
- Lighting should be integral to the design and recommended lighting along the sidewalk.

By: Amanda Rivera
Second: Tracie Ashe
Result: Passed
In favor: Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob, Amanda Rivera
Opposed:
Comments: Cynthia Dubberley recused herself from this item.

4. 3145 Urquhart St

Application: New construction of a 2,050 SF two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to return to the ARC for review. The ARC agreed that all header heights of windows and doors should align.

By: Beth Jacob
Second: Cynthia Dubberley
Result: Passed
In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:

5. 3500 St Claude Ave

Application: Retention of modifications to cooling tower in deviation of CofA.

Motion: Defer the application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- A U-shaped green wall would best achieve the necessary screening for the equipment. However, staff continues to be concerned that this solution is dependent upon a commitment by the property owner to maintain the greenery in perpetuity. This would be very difficult for the HDLC to enforce.
 - The live wall screening should be more of an intentional approach with a dedicated structural component. Other examples throughout the city might provide guidance.
 - Providing raised planters at different levels could help screen the equipment quicker.

By: Cynthia Dubberley
Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments: Eric Wall, Christopher Williams, and Jill Stoll spoke on this item.

6. 1240 Seventh St

Application: New construction of a 3,850 SF two-story, single-family residential building with off-street parking on a vacant lot.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- The second floor appears to be a bit short, and the floor to ceiling height should be increased from 10'-0 to 11'-0".
- The proposed eave brackets are not necessary with the decorative entablature above.
- There should be better alignment of the first and second-floor windows, particularly on the left side elevation. The frontmost first-floor window should shift back on the wall to align with the second-floor window opening above.
- A porch across the front of the first floor was not necessary with the balcony above and recessed entry alcove and stair stoop provided.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 1620 Dumaine St

Application: New construction of a two-story, commercial building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Defer the application for further study of the massing. The ARC stated that Option B1 was the most successful, with smooth stucco on the middle massing, shiplap at the front of the two "main" massings and smooth finish Hardie siding used at the sides and rear. The ARC requested that the left side portion of the building be moved forward towards the property line and the middle portion with the car gate be moved back. The middle portion should be somewhat recessed from the adjacent massing so that it reads independently as a hyphen. The ARC recommended further study of the roof pitch of the middle portion and suggested using a low-sloped roof or a roof that pitches towards the rear. Other recommendations included making the car gate the full width of the middle portion, windows on the sides should be more vertical with 3'x7' on the first-floor and 3'x6' on the second-floor, and there should be less vents on the side elevations.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 2022 Magazine St

Application: Facade renovations to an existing two-story, commercial building.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 5250 St Charles Ave

Application: Renovation of existing contributing two-story, single-family residential building including installation of new side porch, rear carport, and removal of one window opening from right side elevation.

Motion: Grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the ARC. The ARC stated that Option 1, with wood columns would be the most appropriate configuration of the new side porch. The ARC requested further details of the side porch, including enlarged, detailed elevations of the front and side.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: Terry Miller spoke on this item.

10. 730 St Ferdinand St

Application: New construction of a 2,100 SF two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Defer the application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- The use of historic language and elements in a non-traditional manner with the proposed massing appears discordant.
- The building appears to be very wide, and the overall massing should be reconsidered. For example, the camelback walls could be shifted in at the left side to align with the first-floor walls below. This would create a more traditional massing with an increased side yard area that could accommodate an exterior porch or additional garden space. The camelback could also be shifted forward such that the portion of side-gable roofing is removed.
- Traditional camelbacks typically do not have gable shingles or eave overhangs and are generally more limited in their exterior detailing, so they are subordinate to the main building.
- The street-facing clerestory windows proposed for the camelback appear inappropriate and the size and type should be reconsidered.
- The recessed front entry alcove condition and stairs as proposed are odd and should be reconsidered. For example, the entry door could be relocated to the right side with the stairs rotated 90 degrees to allow access to an entry porch.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 225-27 Pacific Ave

Application: New construction of a two-story, two-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- Parking strips must be used rather than the proposed parking pad.
- The slope of the main roof should be changed to 7/12 or a slope less steep than the proposed 10/12.
- The slope of the recessed entry porch roof should be reduced to 4/12.
- Windows should be added at side elevations, especially where absent closer to the front of the building. Windows should have a dedicated sill and three (3) sides of trim.
- A square post balustrade should be installed at the front façade porches rather than the proposed metal. The height of the balustrade is to be 36".
- The header heights of the doors and windows at the front façade should align. This change might include providing floor to ceiling windows and/or transoms over front façade doors.
- A chain wall at the front façade porch should be constructed and turn the corners back to the front wall of the building. Vents should be installed in this chain wall.
- Adding an awning over the second story rear façade door might reduce water issues because it is absent of a roof overhang.
- Constructing a rear porch at the first story would provide a more complete appearance and provide access from the main bedroom on the first floor.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: Barbara Longworth and David Walker spoke in opposition of this item.

12. 530-32 Louisa St

Application: Modifications to existing roof form for the installation of a roof deck at a two-story, mixed-use building.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the height of the handrail at the roof deck should be changed from 42" to 36" if possible.

By: Tracie Ashe

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 1522 Camp St

Application: Renovation and addition to an existing two-story single-family residence.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

14. 2501 Constance St, 1004 Second St

Application: Removal of existing deteriorated wood balcony, re-structuring of support joists and construction of new balcony.

Motion: Defer the application for additional review. The ARC requested for the applicant to look at examples of recent new balconies that have the same or comparable joist dimensions, soffit bead board, and no new brackets.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

15. 4600 St Claude Ave

Application: Installation of a decorative steel fence at commercial venue.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC noted it would support a variance from the Department of Zoning allowing an increase in maximum allowable height of the fencing.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

16. 712 Independence St

Application: Modifications to the front facade and construction of rear addition to an existing two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the walls of the addition should be inset 4" to 6" to differentiate the two buildings. The roof ridge of the addition should also be lowered where it meets the roof of the existing building.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments:

17. 1808-10 N Rampart St

Application: Renovation of existing contributing one-story, two-family residential building including installation of new right side entry alcove.

Motion: Recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed the proposed modification is appropriate because it is an expansion of an existing alcove entry and is located sufficiently far enough back on the building, despite the openness of the adjacent parking lot. The ARC also agreed that the header height of the alcove opening should align with the adjacent window header heights on the elevation.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley, Beth Jacob, Amanda Rivera

Opposed:

Comments: