

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: February 14th, 2023

Location: Economic Development Conference Room, 1340 Poydras Street, Suite 1800

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Members present: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent: Tracie Ashe, Cynthia Dubberley

I. AGENDA

1. Minutes of the January 17th, 2023, meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

2. 502 Frenchmen St.

Application: Renovation of a Significant rated, three-story, mixed use building including demolition of the roof structure and construction of new rear addition.

Motion: The ARC agreed the removal of the previously proposed rooftop penthouse was a positive development, however, they expressed concern the proposal still entails the demolition of most of the existing Significant rated building's historic roof structure. The ARC also agreed that:

- While the current roof may have been modified in the past and may pose challenges for contemporary waterproofing and usable interior square footage, the form of the roof is still intact, is visible, and continues to read visually as a historic roof from several points in the surrounding public right of way, particularly from Esplanade Avenue.
- The proposed parapet modifications for the increase in third-floor floor-to-ceiling height may also be partially visible from Esplanade Avenue.
- A section drawing or additional photos demonstrating the constraints at the third floor and additional 3-D perspective views to better illustrate the proposed rear addition and its visibility from Esplanade Avenue should be provided for the next review.

- The ARC also agreed a site visit would be helpful to better understand the current condition of the roof and the visibility of the roof and proposed rear addition from Esplanade Avenue.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed.

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments: Allen Johnson spoke against this application.

3. 522 Montegut St.

Application: Construction of a 2,000 SF roof-top addition at a Contributing rated, four-story, mixed-use building.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer the application for additional review. The ARC granted conceptual approval of the massing and location of the roof top addition. The ARC agreed that stylistically the addition should transition away from a traditional box with punched openings to a contemporary approach with the introduction of glass and other materials.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed.

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

3. 1206 Magazine St.

Application: New construction of 3890 SF two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer the application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- The front porch stairs should align with the front door.
- Dimensions should be taken on the neighboring two story property for accurate exterior massing.
- The floor-to-floor height should be noted and appropriate for the block face.
- Exterior staircases are not approvable on new construction.
- The gable on the front hipped roof should be removed.
- The rear terrace should be less visible and concealed with parapet wall that reads as roofing.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed.

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

4. 1022 Erato St.

Application: New construction of a 3,005 SF three-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- A roof pitch of 7:12 would be preferential and could be achieved by lowering exterior walls.

- A window should be added to the right side or the second story of the building.
- One over one windows should be used.
- A single step and landing should be added to the base of the front entry staircase with the column terminating at deck location.

By: John Klingman

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

5. 1133 N Villere St.

Application: Renovation and camelback addition of existing building and new construction of a 980 SF second primary structure at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that a gable at the camelback addition would visually balance the 3-story addition.

By: John Klingman

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

6. 5337 Chartres St.

Application: New construction of 553 SF garage structure at a Contributing rated, single-family, one-story residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- The garage details should match those of the house, e.g., enclosed eaves.
- A simpler garage door design should be chosen.
- The structure should move back from Andry to avoid the necessity of a CZO variance.
- Parking Strips are to be used instead of a parking pad for reasons of stormwater management.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

7. 634 Lesseps St.

Application: Renovation and installation of second story balcony and awning at a Non-Contributing rated two-story commercial warehouse and installation of a storefront at the rear facade of adjacent Contributing rated, one-story, shotgun commercial building.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer the application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- Exploring different options for the balcony shape, depth, and roofing configurations could provide a solution to the proposed low horizontal roof.
- Detail balcony stair in such a way that is not treated as just an egress. Providing screening at that location might be appropriate.

By: John Klingman

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

8. 1030 Kentucky St.

Application: Detail review of proposed brackets at front façade of Non-Contributing rated, two-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the proposed brackets should be installed at the second story balcony only.

By: John Klingman

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

9. 527 Elysian Fields Ave.

Application: Detail review of previously approved installation of historic gallery and review of other exterior changes based on SHPO feedback since previous approval of renovation of an existing Contributing rated two-story commercial building.

Motion: The ARC noted the gallery post locations in the depth of the sidewalk will need to be separately reviewed and approved by the Department of Public Works. If the locations and spacing of the posts need to be adjusted in the future due to sub-surface conditions, these changes must return for additional ARC review.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

10. 2921-2923 St Thomas St.

Application: Renovation and construction of 826 SF rear addition at a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC stated that a vertical trim should be added between the historic portion of the building and the new addition at the side elevations. The ARC stated that the new windows on the front façade should

more closely resemble the sister house to the left, as well as the header height of the new windows at the side elevations.

By: John Klingman

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

11. 3213 Laurel St.

Application: New construction of a 2,209 SF two-story, single-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

The ARC stated the parking pad should be changed to strips.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

12. 523 Washington Ave.

Application: New construction of a 4,464 SF two-story, two-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer this application for additional review. The ARC stated that the site plan and overall height of the design was moving in the right direction and recommended making the roof pitches steeper, so the new building is more contextual in the neighborhood. The ARC recommended that the overall design lean more towards contemporary in style or more into the Spanish revival style, as it is currently in-between styles.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

13. 820 Eighth St.

Application: this application was withdrawn.

14. 841 Teche St.

Application: Remove existing street-facing windows and shutters and enclose wall at a Contributing rated, one-story church building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend denial of the application for the installation of new pilasters and removal of existing window openings. Because a portion of the work has already been completed, you will need to seek retention of the work from the HDLC NO Commission.

By: John Klingman

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

15. 1463 Henriette Delille St.

Application: New construction of a 2,122 SF, two-story, two-family residential building on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- Parking strips should be used in lieu of a solid concrete pad.
- The stairs at the rear deck should be rotated so that the building can sit further back on the site and have a larger more usable front porch.

By: John Klingman

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

16. 1101 Elysian Fields Ave.

Application: Installation of new roof-mounted mechanical screening to reduce visibility of roof-mounted HVAC equipment installed without a permit at existing Non-Contributing rated one-story commercial building.

Motion: The ARC agreed Option 1 showing paired units screened together was preferred. The ARC also noted the applicant should verify the existing building structure can support the proposed screening and that the proposed roof plan reflects all code and equipment requirements for service and access. The applicant should also discuss the proposal with the Department of Safety and Permits to verify it is compliant with all wind and mechanical codes based on its attachment to the existing equipment.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

17. 1421 Josephine St.

Application: this application was withdrawn.

18. 3014 St Claude Ave.

Application: Renovation and construction of 888 SF rear addition at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that a vertical trim piece should be added to delineate the existing and new at the addition.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

19. 1041 N Rampart St.

Application: Renovation of a Contributing rated, two-story, mixed-use building including new gallery at front façade.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer the application for additional review.

The ARC agreed that:

- The metal materiality of the handrail may not be appropriate.
- Transoms added to front façade entries would help delineate doorways.
- Door locations should be in the same bay on the first and second floor.
- The columns look thin and might be more appropriate at 10"x6".
- The column alignment at the two upper gables seems odd and should be further explored. We recommend that you identify similar building façade treatments for direction as to appropriate placement.
- The bump out addition on the Ursuline Street side of the building should be retained in massing and fenestration.
- The shed roof and historic millwork of the small porch on the Ursuline Street side of the building should be retained.
- Further exploratory interior demolition should be done to find evidence of possible scarring from older architectural elements.
- Sanborn, Fire Insurance, and photo databases should be searched for evidence of prior building conditions.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

20. 5718 St Charles Ave.

Application: Construction of new 335 SF rear accessory garage structure at a Significant rated, two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

They also agreed that a drawing set that includes detail sheets for the highly articulated façade of the structure should be submitted to Staff for review.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Beth Jacob
Result: Passed
In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob
Opposed:
Comments:

21. 1227 Esplanade Ave.

Application: this application was withdrawn.

22. 1225 Kerlerec St.

Application: Renovation and second-story addition to a rear accessory building at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- The age of the existing one-story accessory building should be verified.
- The dormers should be removed for a more simplified room form.
- The mix of materiality may be problematic.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

23. 1729 Prytania St.

Application: Installation of new decorative security gates and metal awning at a Non-Contributing rated, two-story commercial building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- The horizontal metal portion in the gate should be removed and the vertical members be continuous.
- Poly Carbonate transparent material is appropriate for the awing roofing material.

By: John Klingman

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments:

24. 2604 Chartres St.

Application: incomplete application.

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.