

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Architectural Review Committee
Meeting Minutes

Date: August 15th, 2023

Location: Economic Development Conference Room, 1340 Poydras Street, Suite 1800

Called to order: 12:30 p.m.

Members present: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob

Members arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Members absent:

I. AGENDA

1. Minutes of the July 18th, 2023, meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

2. 1216 Bienville St.

Application: Rereview of the renovation of a Landmark, two-story commercial building due to previous approvals expiring.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level. The ARC reiterated the recommendation from the previous meeting that the material on the underside of the balcony should match the existing material on the soffit of the second-floor overhang. The ARC also stated that there should be a recess just deep enough that it creates a shadow line, where previously existing windows were located on the first floor of the building. Faux-shuttered openings with casings would also be an appropriate way to show the location of the previously existing openings. The ARC recommended using wood handrails and replacing the metal gallery columns with wood posts, based on the historic photo.

By: John Klingman

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

3. 1001 Pleasant St.

Application: Renovation and second-floor rear deck addition at a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC recommended conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Beth Jacob

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments: Thomas Martin spoke on this application.

4. 1009 Pleasant St.

Application: Renovation and addition at a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer this application for additional review. The ARC stated that the new addition overwhelmed the existing building, especially in width, and that the massing and style was not congruent with the existing building. The existing octagonal massing should be retained but could be turned into a two-story element for more square footage. The ARC recommended exploring an addition that is further to the rear of the building that creates an L-shaped extension off the existing service wing. The ARC stated that the current parking, as proposed does not meet Zoning and requires 18' from the front of the porch towards the rear property line.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

Comments: Christy Parker spoke on this application.

5. ACRE

Application: Review of new ACRE brand composite building trim, siding and decking for consideration of Staff-level approval where consistent with the HDLC Guidelines for alternative materials.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval of the request for Staff-level review and approval of smooth-finish ACRE brand composite trim, siding and decking, where the HDLC Design Guidelines currently allow for installation of similar alternative materials. The ARC agreed the product appears to have several advantages in terms of material properties, dimensional stability, moisture resistance, and low vulnerability to insects such as termites. The products also appear to have dimensions and profiles like comparable wood elements and can be painted to match the appearance of wood, as required by the HDLC Design Guidelines. The ARC requested Staff contact SHPO for their input on this new material and to track approvals granted for installation of the product for the purpose of case studies and additional evaluation to better understand its long-term performance in our local climate.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Beth Jacob

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

6. 1100 Elysian Fields Ave.

Application: New construction of a 350 SF one-story accessory trash storage structure at the Frenchmen Street side parking lot of a Non-Contributing rated, one-story, commercial building.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer the application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- The proposed metal deck roofing material is atypical and may be too industrial to be appropriate for use in the district. The ARC also noted the detail where the roof meets the wall is awkward and appears to lack proper flashing.
- The ARC requested the applicant reconsider the location of the accessory structure on the site, such as rotating it 90 degrees and pushing it to the corner of Frenchmen and St. Claude with the rear wall aligning with the current Walgreen's building wall. The ARC noted this would better "bookend" the overall site, may be easier to accommodate turning radiuses for deliveries and trash collection, and would ensure the roll-up doors are non-visible elements from St. Claude.
- The proposed area of concrete between the new accessory rear wall and perimeter fencing should be eliminated and replaced with an additional planted area for landscaping that can further help to visually screen the wall from the street.
- Please provide a front elevation drawing of the proposed accessory for the next review.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

7. 1220-1222 Columbus St.

Application: New construction of a 2,028 SF two-story, single family residential building, and new construction of 880 SF, two-story accessory structure on a vacant lot.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

The ARC agreed that:

- Parking setback requirement needs to be met.
- The sidelights at the setback entry door should be removed.
- The front porch depth should be 5 feet.
- All windows to be 2 over 2.
- A standing seam metal roof is approvable.
- The porch will have a stucco covered CMU wall and wood decking.
- A ½ light in the entry doors is more appropriate.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

8. 636 Pauline St.

Application: Demolition of rear shed addition and new construction of 550 SF addition at a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that corner boards should be added where the existing and new addition meet and that the existing wood drop siding at the front façade should be maintained.

By: John Klingman

Second: Tracie Ashe

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

9. 930 Brooklyn Ave.

Application: New construction of 644 SF rear addition at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that:

- Reduce the width of the side addition to 7'2" to not overwhelm the existing single shotgun building.
- Side addition entry should not have side lites or transom.
- Side addition roof should be pulled in at the eave without an overhang.
- Standard size 3'x6' windows should be used rather than the proposed smaller windows.
- Parking strips should be used at driveway rather than concrete pad.
- No brackets should be installed at the front façade porch.

By: Amanda Rivera

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

10. 446 Pelican Ave.

Application: Revisions to a previously approved canopy at a Contributing rated, one-story, commercial building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. The ARC agreed that the downspouts should run down the columns or rain chains could be used to shed water.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: John Klingman

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

11. 239 Atlantic Ave.

Application: New construction of camelback addition at rear of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to defer your application for additional review. The ARC agreed that:

- The exterior stair at the rear façade of the camelback addition should be incorporated into the interior plan of the building.
- The camelback roof type should be hipped rather than the proposed. An attached awning and/or balcony could be utilized at the rear of the camelback.
- First floor, floor to ceiling height at camelback should be reduced from 11'0" rather than the proposed 12'0".
- Camelback windows should be a standard 3'x6' size.
- Brackets should be removed from the rear façade of the camelback.
- The addition should be stepped in 6" at either side elevation to delineate the existing from the new.

By: Cynthia Dubberley

Second: Amanda Rivera

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

12. 4810 Saint Charles Ave.

Application: Revisions to previously approved restoration of the primary façade at Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: The ARC voted to recommend conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at Staff level, provided that details and dimensions match those within the historic photo of the home.

By: John Klingman

Second: Cynthia Dubberley

Result: Passed

In favor: John Klingman, Amanda Rivera, Cynthia Dubberley, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob

Opposed:

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.