

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Meeting Minutes

Date: October 4, 2022

Location: City Council Chamber, 1300 Perdido Street

Called to order: 1:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Jennie West, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Commissioners absent: Anne Redd, Jennifer Greene

I. Minutes of the September 7, 2022, meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

II. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

III. Old Business Work Applications

A. 2646-52 Canal St, 2649-55 Cleveland Ave, 118-26 S Broad St

Application: Renovation of a designated Landmark, three-story, commercial building including replacement of stone panels

Motion: Deny the application for the replacement of existing marble panels with a new material.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

IV. New Business Work Applications

A. 1244 Magazine St

Application: Relocation of existing mechanical equipment to visually prominent location with screening at a Contributing rated, two-story, commercial building.

Motion: Approve the application for the installation of visually prominent mechanical equipment with details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 603 Flood St

Application: Request to partially enclose existing open side hall as part of new rear addition to existing Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for the enclosure of the open side hall as it would negatively impact the architectural integrity and significance of the building.

By: Rashida Ferdinand

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Comments:

C. 3820 Dauphine St

Application: Remove existing slate roof and decorative ridge tiles and install a standing seam metal roof at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for the removal of existing slate and installation of standing seam metal with the proviso that existing slate could be removed for the installation of single roofing and reinstallation of existing ridge tiles.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

V. Old Business Demolition Applications

A. 5919 Freret St

Application: Demolition (through elevation) of a Contributing rated, 1-1/2 story, single-family raised basement residential building to create new habitable square footage.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the following meeting.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: None

Result: Motion failed due to lack of a second

Motion: Deny the application for demolition (through elevation) based on the radical amount of historic building fabric proposed for removal, because the proposed changes will negatively impact the historic building's perceived scale, massing, and type, because the HDLC Guidelines discourage the elevation of buildings originally constructed with raised basements, and because the HDLC demolition definition was updated to include this specific type of request as inappropriate.

By: Jason King

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Ayo Love, Annie Clark, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments: Heather Szapary was not present for this vote

VI. New Business Demolition Applications

A. 3234 De Soto St

Application: Demolition of a Contributing historic addition at rear of a two-story, single-family, residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition of an existing rear one-story addition to grade.

By: Jason King

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 3807 Perrier St

Application: Demolition and obscuration of more than 25% of the primary facade of a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that the owner can attend the meeting and so the applicant can consider alternative proposals which maintain more of the existing historic building fabric at the primary façade. If updated drawings are provided showing less than 25% demolition at the façade, this application will not need to return for additional HDLC review and approval at a public meeting.

By: Jason King

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 2127 Pine St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building for a second-floor addition.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting, per the applicant request, to allow for additional time for the applicant to consider alternative proposals which maintain more of the existing historic building roof fabric. If updated drawings are provided showing less than 50% demolition at the existing roof, this application will not need to return for additional HDLC review and approval at a public meeting.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 7619 Hurst St

Application: Demolition of Non-Contributing, one-story, single-family residential building at rear of property to grade.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Annie Clark

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

VII. Old Business Retention Applications

A. 1218-24 Valmont St, 5320 Perrier St

Application: Retention of demolition to grade of portion of a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building required to be retained in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of demolition in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness and to levy a fine of \$10,000 for the unpermitted work.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

VIII. New Business Retention Applications

A. 722 Josephine St

Application: Retention of removal of existing wood windows and installation of flush-mounted vinyl windows at front facade and inappropriate shutters at Contributing rated, one-story, single-family, residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for retention of inappropriate windows, shutters, and trim at front façade with six (6) month period to replace to match existing condition.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 926 Brooklyn Ave

Application: Retention of inappropriate stained-glass gable window and inappropriate gable vent at a Contributing rated, single-family, camelback residential building.

Motion: Deny the retention application for the existing gable vent and approve the application for retention of the stained glass at the front façade gable window.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

i. Retention of Demolition Applications under previous Fine Ordinance

a. 548 Fourth St

Application: Retention of demolition, through reconstruction, of a Contributing rated, 1-1/2 story, single-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Grant the retention of the demolition to grade, with a \$10,000 fine for deviation from the issued Certificate of Appropriateness.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

ii. Retention of Demolition Applications under new Fine Ordinance, Effective August 1, 2022

a. 1125 N Robertson St

Application: Retention of demolition of over 50% of the wall structure of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Grant the retention of the partial demolition.

By: Ayo Love

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

b. 709 Milan St

Application: Retention of demolition of more than 50% of the exterior walls of an existing Contributing rated two-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that the applicant may have additional time to work with HDLC Staff to verify the date of demolition.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Annie Cambria

Result: Passed

In Favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

IX. Ratification of Architectural Committee and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, September 7, 2022, Meeting.

Motion: Approve the ratification of the ARC and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, September 7, 2022, meeting.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments: