

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Meeting Minutes

Date: February 2, 2022

Location: Zoom Teleconference

Called to order: 1:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria

Commissioners absent: Jesse Leblanc, Emilie Bahr

I. Minutes of the January 5, 2022 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

II. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

III. Old Business Work Applications

A. 840 Piety St

Application: Installation of new decorative stone at base of one-story commercial building.

Motion: Approve the application with Staff recommendations and details to be worked out at Staff level.

By: Jennie West

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

IV. **New Business Work Applications**

A. 5718 St Charles Ave

Application: Appeal of ARC recommendation for new two-story porte-cochere side addition and request to remove one masonry chimney at an existing significant rated two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the appeal of the ARC recommendations for the two-story porte-cochere addition and to deny the request to remove the existing masonry chimney.

By: Jennie West

Second: Jennifer Green

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 621 Opelousas Ave

Application: Removal of existing slate roof and installation of architectural shingle roof at two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application with details to be worked out at Staff level.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 709 Mazant St

Application: Installation of visually prominent roof-mounted solar equipment at two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application with details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Jennie West

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 714-16 First St

Application: Remove 4 historic chimneys above the roofline at a contributing, two-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Defer to the end of the meeting, to allow the applicant to join the discussion.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

Motion (made at end of meeting): Approve the application to remove all four of the chimneys from above

the roofline.

By: Calvin Alexander

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 1423 Burgundy St

Application: Request to remove existing terra cotta tile roof for installation of new architectural grade asphalt/fiberglass roof shingles on existing contributing two-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that the applicant may consult with additional roof contractors regarding the feasibility of replacing only the camelback tile roof and repairing the lower portion of roof with salvaged tiles. If documentation from these roof contractors can sufficiently demonstrate there are not enough reusable tiles to accommodate the retention of tile at the lower roof, Staff may approve the request to remove all portions of tile roofing for replacement with asphalt shingles with the existing ridge tiles and finials to be salvaged and reinstalled.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

F. 723 Montegut St

Application: Modifications to existing slate roof for the installation of an architectural shingle roof at a one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application with details to be worked out at Staff level.

By: Jennie West

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

V. Old Business Demolition Applications

A. 1925-27 Fern St

Application: Demolition of existing contributing one-story, two-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition to grade.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

VI. New Business Demolition Applications

A. 1201 N Dupre

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof to construct a second story at a contributing, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Defer the application to allow the applicant time to work with the staff to find a more appropriate amount of demolition for the new addition.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 1025 Henry Clay Ave

Application: Demolition of existing contributing (but altered) one-story, single-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade with the proviso that all reusable building materials and architectural elements be carefully removed and salvaged for donation or reuse.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 3620 Chestnut St

Application: Demolition of an existing non-contributing one-story commercial building to grade.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Anne Redd

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 4839 Laurel St

Application: Demolition of more than 25% of the primary façade of an existing contributing one-story, single-family residential building for a renovation and second-floor addition.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that the applicant has time to complete limited exploratory demolition at the building façade to determine if there is evidence of the historic door/window openings at this location.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 7918 Spruce St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the existing roof structure for a camelback addition at one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the partial roof demolition.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

VII. New Business Retention Applications

A. 1436 Louisa St

Application: Retention of inappropriately installed windows, window trim, door, and uncapped fence without an HDLC Certificate of Appropriateness at one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve retention of the inappropriate vinyl windows at right-side elevation contingent on replacing the front door and front facade window, modifying window trim, and capping the existing vertical board wood fence. Future windows must be reviewed and approved by HDLC.

By: Jennie West

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 1230 Webster St

Application: Retention of façade demolition of existing contributing two-story, single-family residential building in excess of approved building plans.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of façade demolition without a Certificate of Appropriateness and levy a fine of \$10,000 for the unpermitted demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 5215 Burgundy St

Application: Retention of inappropriate metal panel fencing installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting with the proviso that the applicant may work with Staff on a plan to limitedly replace the metal panel fencing at the Burgundy Street elevation with appropriate new wood fencing to mitigate the overall visibility and with the remainder of metal panel fencing at the rear permitted to be retained.

By: Calvin Alexander

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather

Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria
Opposed:
Comments:

D. 840 Josephine St

Application: Retention of inappropriate green roof shingles installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention with the proviso that the next time the roof is replaced, an HDLC-approved shingle color must be used.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

VIII. Guidelines Update

Motion: Approve the changes to the HDLC guidelines for metal roofing and ridge tiles as proposed.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments:

IX. Ratification of Architectural Committee and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, January 5, 2022 Meeting.

Motion: Ratify the actions of the ARC and staff since the Wednesday, January 5th meeting.

By: Calvin Alexander

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Ayo Love, Anne Redd, Heather Szapary, Donna Wakeman, Jennie West, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Annie Cambria

Opposed:

Comments: