New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes

Date: March 9, 2022

Location: Zoom Teleconference

Called to order: 1:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Jesse Leblanc Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno

Commissioners absent: Ayo Love

I. Minutes of the February 2, 2022 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes. By: Lee Bressler Second: Calvin Alexander Result: Passed In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

II. Landmark Nomination of 2514-2416 Second Street

Motion: Nominate the property as a local landmark By: Donna Wakeman Second: Calvin Alexander Second: Heather Szapary Result: Passed

III. Landmark Nomination of 2501- 2505 Banks Street

Motion: Nominate the property as a local landmark By: Calvin Alexander Second: Annie Cambria Second: Jennifer Greene Result: Passed

IV. Consent Agenda

- A. Motion: Suspend the rules and remove Item K from the consent agenda and place it on the regular agenda.
 By: Greg Hackenberg
 Second: Anne Redd
 Result: Passed
 In Favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed:
 Comments:
- B. Motion: Suspend the rules and move item J to the regular agenda. By: Anne Redd

Second: Calvin Alexander Result: Passed In Favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

C. Motion: Approve the consent agenda.
By: Heather Szapary
Second: Calvin Alexander
Result: Passed
In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman,
Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West
Opposed:
Comments:

V. Regular Agenda

A. 2230 Magazine St

Motion: Defer the application back to the ARC. By: Jennie West Second: Greg Hackenberg Result: Passed In Favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

B. <u>3229 St. Thomas St</u>

Motion: Grant conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level. By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Jason King Result: Passed In Favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

VI. New Business Work Applications

A. 502 Frenchmen St

Application: Appeal of ARC denial for renovation of significant-rated, three-story, mixed-use structure including construction of a new rooftop penthouse and rear addition and restoration of gallery. Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting, as per your request. By: Donna Wakeman Second: Jennie West Result: Passed In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed:

Comments:

B. 725 St Ferdinand St

Application: Installation of new roof-mounted solar collectors on significant-rated commercial building. Motion: Approve the application for installation of new roof-mounted solar collectors on the right-side roof slopes of the existing commercial building as per the submitted panel layout diagram and panel specifications.

By: Donna Wakeman Second: Jason King Result: Passed In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

C. 5442 Burgundy St

Application: Removal of existing ridge tiles for the installation of a standing seam metal roof at a contributing-rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for the removal of ridge tiles.

By: Calvin Alexander

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

D. 1300 Independence St

Application: Installation of visually prominent roof-mounted solar collectors at a one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application due to the visual prominence of the proposed location for solar panels. By: Jennie West

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

E. 901 Poland Ave

Application: Modifications to existing slate roofing and installation of architectural shingle roofing at a contributing one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting to provide the chance for the applicant to establish a date and time for an inspection to assess the current condition of the slate roofing.

By: Calvin Alexander

Second:

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed:

Comments:

IV. Old Business Demolition Applications

A. 4839 Laurel St

Application: Demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade of an existing contributing one-story, single-family residential building for a renovation and second-floor addition. Motion: Approve the application for partial facade demolition as per the revised "Current Proposed Façade Elevation" presented at the meeting. By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Jason King Result: Passed In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

V. New Business Demolition Applications

A. <u>3817 Annunciation St</u>

Application: Demolition of non-contributing one-story, two-family residential building to grade. Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade with the proviso that all reusable building details and elements be carefully removed, retained, and donated to a local architectural salvage for reuse. By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

B. 2530 Bayou Rd

Application: Demolition of contributing one-story, commercial building to grade. Motion: To approve the application for demolition to grade. By: Emilie Bahr Second: Calvin Alexander Result: Passed In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

C. 628 N Olympia St

Application: Demolition of 100% of existing multi-gable roof at single family residential building to reconstruct at a steeper, singular pitch.

Motion: This item was withdrawn.

D. 2505 Leonidas St

Application: Demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade of contributing two-story, two-family residential building. Motion: Approve the application for partial front façade demolition. By: Lee Bressler Second: Donna Wakeman Result: Passed In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments: E. 7327 S Claiborne Ave

Application: Demolition of 100% of the existing roof structure for a second-floor addition at a contributing one-story, single-family residential building. Motion: Approve the application. By: Lee Bressler Second: Stephanie Bruno Result: Failed In favor: Stephanie Bruno, Lee Bressler, Anne Redd Opposed: Emilie Bahr, Calvin Alexander, Donna Wakeman, Annie Cambria, Greg Hackenberg, Jennie West, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Jason King Comments:

F. 2000 Valmont St

Application: Demolition of contributing two-story, two-family residential building to grade. Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that you may have time to schedule an HDLC interior and exterior inspection of the building. By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

G. 5317 Loyola Ave

Application: Demolition of contributing two-story, two-family residential building to grade. Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting. By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

H. <u>1215 Exposition Blvd</u>

Application: Demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade and more than 50% of the roof of contributing (but altered) two-story, single-family residential building for modification of the facade and second-story addition. Motion: Deny demolition. By: Emilie Bahr Second: Donna Wakeman Result: Passed In favor: Opposed: Stephanie Bruno Comments:

I. <u>1492 Moss St</u>

Application: Renovation of three- story convent with a three-story rear addition. Partial demolition including two rear accessory structures, one of which is contributing.

Motion: Approve the application to allow the demolition of the non-contributing accessory structure and deny the application to demolish the Contributing rated accessory structure.

By: Jason King

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed:

Comments:

J. 4101 Constance St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof of contributing one-story, two-family residential building for a camelback addition.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed:

Comments:

K. 1004 Eleonore St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure and more than 25% of the primary façade of contributing one-story, single-family residential building for a camelback addition and re-introduction of exterior front porch.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof and façade demolition as indicated in Option B and to deny the application for partial roof and façade demolition based on Option A.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

L. 1021 Felicity St

Application: Demolition of a contributing two-story commercial building to grade.
Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.
By: Greg Hackenberg
Second: Calvin Alexander
Result: Passed
In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West
Opposed:
Comments:

VI. New Business Retention Applications

A. 923 St Roch Ave

Application: Retention of visually obtrusive HVAC mini-split equipment and conduit installed at right side of contributing two-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Motion: Deny the application for retention of visually obtrusive wall mounted HVAC mini-split equipment and conduit installed at the right side of the building because the HDLC Guidelines do not permit the installation of visually prominent equipment or conduit lines and because the equipment and conduit as-installed are located too close to the front building wall and are highly visible from several vantage points in the surrounding public right of way.

By: Donna Wakeman Second: Jennie West Result: Passed In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

VIII. Guidelines Updates

Motion: Approve the revisions to Section 5-5 and Section 5-8 of the HDLC Design Guidelines for Roofing as proposed. By: Calvin Alexander Second: Heather Szapary Result: Passed In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

IX. Rules, Policies, and Procedures Update

Motion: Approve the changes to Section II. B1 of the HDLC Rules, Policies and Procedures regarding ARC membership as proposed. By: Donna Wakeman Second: Jason King Result: Passed In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments:

X. Ratification of Architectural Committee and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, February 2, 2022 Meeting.

Motion: Ratify the actions of the ARC and staff since the Wednesday, February 2nd meeting. By: Calvin Alexander Second: Jason King Result: Passed In favor: Calvin Alexander, Lee Bressler, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman, Emilie Bahr, Heather Szapary, Annie Cambria, Stephanie Bruno, Jennifer Greene, Jennie West Opposed: Comments: