

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Meeting Minutes

Date: May 4, 2022

Location: City Council Chamber, 1300 Perdido Street

Called to order: 1:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Commissioners absent: Emilie Bahr, Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Donna Wakeman

I. Minutes of the April 6, 2022 meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

II. Landmark Nomination of 2525 First Street

Motion: Nominate 2525 First Street as a Landmark.

First: Jason King

Second: Heather Szapary

Second: Jennie West

III. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda.

By: Anne Redd

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments: Jennie West recused herself from this item.

IV. Old Business Work Applications

A. 614 Egan St

Application: Installation of visually prominent roof-mounted solar panels at a one-story, single-family residential building with a back-up battery.

Motion: Deny the application due to the visual prominence of the proposed location for solar panels.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

V. New Business Work Applications

A. 1300 Independence St

Application: Installation of visually prominent roof-mounted solar panels at a one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for visible roof-mounted solar collector equipment. The Commission noted that the overall number of panels should be reduced and relocated to the right-side roof slope, 10' back from the front wall.

By: Jennie West

Second: Annie Clark

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 5000-02 Dauphine St

Application: Remove existing shingle roof and install metal roof.

Motion: Defer this application for 30 days until a formal inspection has been completed by an HDLC inspector and/or a licensed roofing professional.

By: Rashida Ferdinand

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 534-36 Verret St

Application: Demolition of four (4) existing chimneys at a contributing one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for chimney demolition.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 2815 St. Claude Ave

Application: Request to remove three (3) masonry chimneys and to install new standing seam metal roof at an existing significant rated one-story, single-family raised basement residential building.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting to allow for an interior/exterior HDLC inspection of the chimneys including staff and a representative from the Commission.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

VI. New Business Demolition Applications

A. 1917 Soniat St

Application: Demolition of existing contributing one-story, two-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that the Commission may review the submitted engineer's report and to allow time for the applicant to consider alternatives to full demolition, such as a more limited partial demolition or renovation of the existing historic building.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments: Anicka Marshall spoke regarding the application.

B. 4526 Lasalle St

Application: Demolition of existing contributing one-story, single-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 1230 Webster St

Application: Demolition to grade (or) partial demolition of more than 50% of the roof and more than 50% of the exterior walls of an existing contributing two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition to grade and partial roof and exterior wall demolition based on the building's contributing rating, because its architecture and history remain intact and it continues to contribute its original style, type, massing, roof form, siting, and footprint to the tout ensemble of the surrounding historic district. HDLC Staff also recommends the building be stabilized to prevent further deterioration and that the applicant submit a revised application to renovate and rehabilitate the existing building so that repair and restoration work can continue as quickly as possible.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 4170-19 St. Ann St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the existing roof to construct a camelback addition at a contributing one-story single-family residential building.

Motion: Defer the application to give the applicant time to explore more options for the proposed

camelback addition.

By: Jason King

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 9017-19 Green St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the existing roof structure at a non-contributing, one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

F. 8623-25 Apple St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the existing roof structure at a non-contributing, one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Anne Redd

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

G. 1913-15 Eagle St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the existing roof structure at a non-contributing, one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

H. 1923-25 Eagle St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the existing roof structure at a non-contributing, one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Jennie West

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo

Love, Greg Hackenberg
Opposed:
Comments:

I. 1438 Euterpe St

Application: Demolition of an existing contributing but heavily altered two-story single family residential building for permeable neighborhood green space.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.

By: Anne Redd

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

J. 7314 Zimple St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof and more than 25% of the primary facade of an existing non-contributing one-story, single-family residential building for a renovation and full second-floor addition.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that HDLC Staff can further investigate the history of the existing building.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

In favor:

Opposed:

Comments:

K. 4201-03 Magazine St

Application: Demolition of more than 25% of the primary façade of an existing two-story, mixed-use building.

Motion: Approve the application for partial façade demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

L. 3921 Chestnut St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the exterior walls and more than 50% of the roof of existing contributing one-story, single-family residential building for a renovation and camelback addition.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof and exterior wall demolition. Please submit one set of stamped, final detailed drawings.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

VII. Old Business Retention Applications

A. 4433-35 Willow St

Application: Retention of demolition of existing contributing one-story, two-family residential building to grade without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of demolition without a Certificate of Appropriateness and levy a fine of \$10,000 for the unpermitted demolition because the entire structure was demolished without approval.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 2033-35 Burgundy St

Application: Request to retain new GAF Timberline solar shingles installed on contributing one-story, two-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Defer action on this application for 90 days to allow the applicant additional time to coordinate with GAF and HDLC Staff to confirm the proposed solar panels can be modified per the ARC recommendation regarding removal of the junction boxes. Additionally, the Commission requested more information on color availability, cost of this system vs. conventional solar panels and wind load performance, etc.

By: Jennie West

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Anne Redd, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments: Thomas Neyhart spoke regarding the application.

VIII. New Business Retention Applications

A. 464-66 Flood St

Application: Retention for the removal of historic 9/6 windows and installation of inappropriate new 6/6 windows with uneven sashes and addition of apron.

Motion: Deny the application for retention of all inappropriate windows and apron trim and allow for the retention of only rear windows that are not visible from the street view.

By: Rashida Ferdinand

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Annie Clark, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

In favor:

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 3304-06 St. Claude Ave

Application: Retention of visible roof-mounted HVAC equipment and associated conduit, installation of security roll-down door, and construction of rear canopy without an HDLC Certificate of Appropriateness at a contributing mixed-use building.

Motion: Partially deny the application for retention. The HDLC NO Commission noted the following:

- The existing depth of the rear canopy should be reduced. The canopy should end at the center/middle posts.

- The roll down security door should be replaced with an HDLC approvable security door.

- The HVAC condenser units can remain in the existing location.

- All associated HVAC conduit should be covered by rigid conduit coverings and painted to match the existing siding.

By: Jennie West

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 925-27 Atlantic Ave

Application: Retention of the removal of existing windows and installation of inappropriate windows, the installation of inappropriate doors, retention of inappropriate parking pad, and the installation of inappropriate handrails without an HDLC Certificate of Appropriateness at a contributing one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Partially deny the retention request. The HDLC NO Commission provided the following proviso for retention:

- Replace three (3) exterior doors with HDLC approved doors.

- Replace wood balustrade at front porches with HDLC approved wood balustrade.

- Retention of inappropriate vinyl windows. At such time that windows need to be replaced, the HDLC shall review and approve appropriate replacement windows.

- Retention of inappropriate parking pad.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Jennie West

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 2409-11 Burgundy St

Application: Retention of installation of inappropriate stucco parge coating at five (5) masonry chimneys on an existing contributing one-story, two-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of five (5) parge coated masonry chimneys with the proviso that a traditional 3-coat stucco is applied at all five chimneys using the approved lime based specification in a smooth finish with the original masonry corbelling details to remain visible to the greatest extent possible.

By: Jennie West

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 933 State St

Application: Retention of facade demolition in excess of 25% at an existing contributing, one-story, single-family raised-basement residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of partial façade demolition without a Certificate of Appropriateness and to levy a fine of \$3,000 for the unpermitted work.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments:

IX. Ratification of Architectural Committee and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, April 6, 2022 Meeting.

Motion: Ratify the actions of the Architectural Review Committee and staff since April 6, 2022.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Rashida Ferdinand, Heather Szapary, Jason King, Stephanie Bruno, Jennie West, Ayo Love, Greg Hackenberg

Opposed:

Comments: