

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Meeting Minutes

Date: August 3, 2022

Location: City Council Chamber, 1300 Perdido Street

Called to order: 1:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Commissioners absent: Rashida Ferdinand, Anne Redd, Donna Wakeman

I. **Minutes of the July 6, 2022, meeting**

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary

Opposed:

Comments:

II. **Review of Minutes of the Joint VCC and HDLC Commissioner Training held on July 13th, 2022**

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

III. **Consent Agenda**

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda

By: Jennifer Greene

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

IV. **Retention Items from July 6th Meeting**

A. 1118 Desire St

Application: Retention of inappropriate front facade door and sidelites and inappropriate windows at front facade and side elevations at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building, without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of inappropriate flush-mounted vinyl windows at the side elevations with the proviso that when changed in the future, the windows will be reviewed and approved by the HDLC. Approve the front façade window with the proviso that trim be installed to mimic an original ganged window appearance. Denial of retention of the inappropriate leaded-glass front door, an HDLC-approved door should be installed at a height to match the original opening and trim. Upon replacement, all non-glass material at the front façade should be replaced with glass.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Jennie West

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 2218 Rousseau St

Application: Retention of metal panels installed at existing chain-link fence and construction of accessory structure at Non-Contributing, commercial building, without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Grant the retention of the metal panels installed at the chain-link fence. Grant retention of the accessory structure with the proviso that the structure will be moved further back on the site, with permits.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 2913 Amelia St

Application: Retention of demolition to grade of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building, in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of demolition to grade in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness and to levy a fine of \$6,000 for the unpermitted demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Jesse LeBlanc

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 1455-57 N Villere St

Application: Retention of the installation of internal-muntin, flush-mount, vinyl windows, and two front doors at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building, in deviation of Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Grant the retention of the doors and windows with the proviso that when the windows are replaced, they are replaced with HDLC approved windows.

By: Ayo Love

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 2309-11 Second St

Application: Retention of construction of rear addition not per approved drawings at a nominated Landmark, one-story, single-family residential building, in deviation of Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Defer the application until the next Commission meeting to provide the chance for the applicant to work with HDLC Staff to determine the best way to bring the rear addition into compliance with the HDLC Guidelines.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno

Opposed:

Comments:

F. 7839 St Charles Ave

Application: Retention of installation of HVAC units and wood platform at Contributing rated, one-story, commercial building, without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny the application for retention of the HVAC units and wood platform in the current location and encouraged the applicant to work with staff to relocate the HVAC units and wood platform so that they comply with the Guidelines.

By: Jesse LeBlanc

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno

Opposed:

Comments:

G. 1903 Dauphine St

Application: Retention of removal of three (3) masonry chimneys from roof of a Significant rated, 1-1/2-story, single-family residential building, without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny the application for retention of removal of three (3) masonry chimneys and to require the reconstruction of three (3) new masonry chimneys to match the previously existing condition due to this work not originally being approved or permitted, the Significant rating of the building, because the chimneys still remain at the interior of the building, and because the chimneys were important exterior architectural features that should have been maintained and preserved rather than removed.

By: Jesse LeBlanc

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

H. 1738 N Rampart St

Application: Retention of façade demolition at Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of excess façade demolition in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness and to levy a fine of \$6,000 for the unpermitted demolition.

By: Jesse LeBlanc

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

V. Old Business Work Applications

A. 5000-02 Dauphine St ****Incomplete Application – This Item Was Not Heard****

Application: Request to remove existing slate roof and ridge tiles for the installation of new standing seam metal roofing at existing Contributing rated, one-story, single-family, residential building.

Motion:

By:

Second:

Result:

In favor:

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 1421 Josephine St

Application: Installation of roof-mounted solar panels at a Significant rated, two-story, single-family, residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for roof-mounted solar equipment layout as presented in proposal three (3), including arrangements located on the right-side roof slope of the main building core. Grant approval of the roof-mounted solar equipment layout as presented in proposal one (1).

By: Jessie LeBlanc

Second: Stephine Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: : Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

VI. New Business Work Applications

A. 502 Frenchmen St

Application: Appeal of ARC recommendation for denial of new rooftop penthouse addition as part of a renovation of a Significant rated, three-story, mixed-use building.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting, as per the applicant request.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 1620 Dumaine St

Application: Appeal ARC recommendations for new construction of a 7,072 SF, two-story, commercial building on a vacant lot.

Motion: Approve the appeal of the ARC recommendations.

By: Ayo Love

Second: Jason King

Result: Failed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Jason King, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love

Opposed: Greg Hackenberg, Annie Clark, Jesse LeBlanc

Comments: Commissioners expressed their concerns about setting a precedent on setbacks from the front property line.

Motion: Deny the appeal of the ARC recommendations.

By: Jesse LeBlanc

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Failed

In favor: Jesse LeBlanc, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Greg Hackenberg, Annie Clark, Stephanie Bruno

Opposed: Jason King, Lee Bressler, Ayo Love

Comments:

Motion: Deny the appeal of the ARC recommendation to move the left massing closer to the property line.

Approve the appeal of the ARC recommendation regarding the hyphen cladding and approve the use of scored stucco in lieu of weatherboards.

By: Jesse LeBlanc

Second: Ayo Love

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 538-40 Philip St

Application: Remove two (2) chimneys at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family, residential building.

Motion: Grant approval of the removal of the rear chimney and deny the removal of the front chimney.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 2646-52 Canal St ****APPLICATION WITHDRAWN – ITEM NOT HEARD****

Application: Renovation to a designated Landmark, three-story, commercial building including replacement of stone panels.

Motion:

By:

Second:

Result:

In favor:

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 4521 St Charles Ave

Application: Request to install new inappropriate asphalt roof shingles at Contributing rated, three-story school building.

Motion: Grant the request to install the CertainTeed Belmont shingles with the proviso that the when the shingles are replaced, the new shingles are on the HDLC list of approved roof brands and colors.

By: Jesse LeBlanc

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

- F. Application: Review of new GAF Timberline solar shingle product for Staff-level approval where consistent with the HDLC Guidelines for solar panels.
Motion: Approve the request to allow for Staff level review of new proposed GAF solar shingle products where consistent with the HDLC Guidelines for roof-mounted solar collectors with the proviso that junction boxes are not installed at the roof ridge per the updated GAF detail.
By: Jesse LeBlanc
Second: Heather Szapary
Result: Passed
In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark
Opposed:
Comments:

VII. Old Business Demolition Applications

- A. 527 Valmont St
Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building for a renovation and camelback addition.
Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.
By: Stephanie Bruno
Second: Jason King
Result: Passed
In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark
Opposed:
Comments:

VIII. New Business Demolition Applications

- A. 1015 Evelina St
Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building to grade.
Motion: Deny full demolition to grade. Approval of partial demolition of rear three (3) room addition and inappropriate front porch.
By: Heather Szapary
Second: Jason King
Result: Passed
In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark
Opposed:
Comments:
- B. 9028-30 Hickory St
Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure of a Non-Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building for a renovation and camelback addition.
Motion: Approve the partial demolition.
By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 1820-22 Hollygrove St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure of a Non-Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building for a renovation and camelback addition.

Motion: Approve the partial demolition.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 8830-34 Hickory St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure of a Non-Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building for a renovation and camelback addition.

Motion: Approve the partial demolition.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 1909-11 Eagle St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure of a Non-Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building for a renovation and camelback addition.

Motion: Approve the partial demolition.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

F. 1821-23 Hamilton St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure of a Non-Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building for a renovation and camelback addition.

Motion: Approve the partial demolition.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

G. 3600-3602 St Charles Ave

Application: Demolition of Non-Contributing, two-story, commercial building to grade.

Motion: Approve the demolition to grade with the proviso that the demolition permit will not be issued until the redevelopment plans have been approved by the HDLC.

By: Jennifer Greene

Second: Jesse LeBlanc

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

H. 1023 Cambronne St

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Defer the application until the next Commission meeting at the request of the applicant.

By: Jennifer Greene

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

I. 4134 Annunciation St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the exterior walls of an existing Contributing rated one-story, single-family residential building for a renovation and camelback addition.

Motion: Approve the application for partial exterior wall demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

J. 6320 S Robertson St

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting due the applicant not attending the meeting.

By: Jesse LeBlanc

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

K. 434 Pine St

Application: Demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade and more than 50% of the roof of a Contributing (but altered) one-story, single-family residential building for a renovation and second-floor addition.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof and façade demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

IX. Old Business Retention Applications

X. 2033 Burgundy St

Application: Retention of installation of new GAF Timberline solar shingles on a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of new GAF Timberline Solar Shingles installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness as installed with the proviso that all the junction boxes at the roof ridge are removed per the updated GAF detail.

By: Jesse LeBlanc

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

XI. New Business Retention Applications

A. 938-40 Congress St

Application: Retention of new window left side elevation, door opening and inappropriate doors at rear façade at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approval of retention of left-side elevation window with the proviso that the window height be increased to meet the header height of existing windows. Approval of retention of rear door opening and inappropriate glass doors.

By: Jessie LeBlanc

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 2365 Annunciation St

Application: Retention of demolition of more than 50% of the wall structure and removal of chimney at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building in deviation of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the retention of partial demolition with a \$6,000 fine. Approve the retention of the removal of the historic chimney.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather

Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark
Opposed:
Comments:

C. 8831-33 Birch St

Application: Retention of partial demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building, without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Grant the retention of partial demolition with a \$6,000 fine.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Ayo Love, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 3036 Marais St

Application: Retention of inappropriate brackets at front porch of a Non-Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Denial of retention of inappropriate brackets at front porch.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 3027-29 Royal St

Application: Retention of inappropriate horizontal board fence installed at a Significant rated, one-story, single-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of inappropriate horizontal board fencing with the proviso that the metal posts will be cut down in height such that they are not taller than the fencing and boxed out with wood to appear like typical wood fence posts within 90 days. The Commission also approved the retention of the posts on the outside of the fence contingent upon approval from the neighbor. Otherwise, the posts must be relocated to the interior side of the yard.

By: Jesse LeBlanc

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

F. 527 Valmont St

Application: Retention of demolition of Non-Contributing rated, one-story, rear accessory structure to grade without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of demolition to grade of Non-Contributing rated rear accessory building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Heather Szapary,

Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark
Opposed:
Comments:

G. 2600 N Rampart St

Application: Retention of replacement and modification of rear second-floor balcony at a Contributing rated, two-story, two-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of the rear balcony modification with the proviso that the inappropriate deck-style handrails are replaced with appropriate wood handrails and newel posts and that all exterior wood and Hardie elements are painted with opaque paint.

By: Jesse LeBlanc

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

H. 5725-27 Royal St

Application: Retention of re-framed window opening locations at right side of building without a Certificate of Appropriateness and appeal of ARC recommendations for renovation and rear addition to existing Contributing rated one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for retention of re-framed windows at the right side of the building due to these being the original window sizes and locations and recommended the applicant adjust the proposed interior layout instead. The Commission voted to deny the request to remove the existing front elevation windows for replacement with floor-to-ceiling windows as this was not an original or documented historic condition and denied the request to appeal the ARC recommended corner board at the junction between the existing historic building and new rear addition. The Commission also voted to ratify the ARC recommendation for conceptual approval of the proposed window changes at the left side of the building and the 400 SF rear addition with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments:

XII. **Ratification of Architectural Committee and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, July 6, 2022 Meeting.**

Motion: Approve the ratification of the ARC and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, July 6, 2022 meeting.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Lee Bressler, Jennifer Greene, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King, Jesse LeBlanc, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark

Opposed:

Comments: