# New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes

Date: September 7, 2022

Location: City Council Chamber, 1300 Perdido Street

Called to order: 1:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Jennie West, Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie

Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Anne Redd

Commissioners absent: Jason King, Rashida Ferdinand, Greg Hackenberg

## I. Minutes of the August 3, 2022, meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo

Love, Jennifer Greene

Opposed: Comments:

## II. Temporary suspension of the HDLC Rules, Policies and Procedures Section II.G.4

Motion: Approve the temporary suspension.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

# III. Landmark Nomination of 2445 First Street

Motion: Nominate 2445 First St as a Landmark.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second:

Result: Motion failed due to lack of second.

In favor: Opposed: Comments:

### IV. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda

By: Heather Szapary Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

### V. Old Business Work Applications

#### A. 502 Frenchmen St

Application: Appeal of ARC recommendation for denial of new rooftop penthouse addition as part of a renovation of an existing Significant rated three-story, mixed-use building.

Motion: Deny the request to appeal the ARC recommendation for denial of the new rooftop penthouse addition because the existing roof form is directly related to the historic use and typology of the building and the proposed addition would eliminate this historic condition, would negatively impact the significance and visual integrity of the building, would be highly visible from multiple points in the surrounding public right of way, and because the HDLC Guidelines specifically prohibit rooftop additions on Significant rated buildings.

By: Donna Wakeman Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

### VI. New Business Work Applications

#### A. 5500 Dauphine St

Application: Installation of visually prominent roof-mounted solar panels with visible conduit on an existing Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the request for installation of visually prominent roof-mounted solar collectors as per the proposed updated panel layout diagram with the proviso that all roof and wall-mounted visible conduit installed without a CofA is removed and that all necessary exterior conduit be installed such that it is minimally visible from all surrounding streets.

By: Anne Redd

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

#### B. 3056 Royal St

Application: Installation of visually prominent roof-mounted skylights at a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for the installation of skylights at the proposed locations provided that the skylights are set back 10'0" from the front wall of the building with details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Comments:

#### C. 542 Vallette St

Application: Installation of visually prominent roof-mounted solar equipment at a Non-Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for the installation of roof-mounted solar equipment with details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Heather Szapary Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

#### D. 1030 France St

Application: Installation of standing seam metal roofing and removal of ridge tiles at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for the removal of existing decorative ridge tiles and the installation of a standing seam metal roof.

By: Annie Clark Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

E. Application: Review of Miratec Smooth Select composite building trim for Staff-level approval at new construction projects.

Motion: Approve the request to allow for Staff level approval of Miratec Smooth Select composite building trim at new construction projects where smooth finish Hardie trim would otherwise be permitted.

By: Lee Bressler Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

### F. <u>2650 Canal St</u>

Application: Renovation to a Landmark, three-story, commercial building including replacement of stone panels.

Motion: Defer application to next meeting to allow for a representative to attend.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

## G. 709 Mazant St

Application: Removal of louvered shutters and installation of board and batten shutters at Non-Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the application for the installation of the board and batten shutters with the proviso that louvered shutters be installed in visually prominent locations and board and batten shutters be installed in locations not determined to be visually prominent from the public right of way. HDLC Staff will determine visibility.

By: Less Bressler Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

#### VII. Old Business Demolition Applications

## A. 6320 S Robertson St

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

### VIII. New Business Demolition Applications

## A. 1917 Soniat St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the exterior wall structure of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building to create additional property line separation distance.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so the applicant can have additional time to work with HDLC Staff on a revised partial demolition proposal that maintains more of the existing historic roof and exterior wall building fabric.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed

Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

## B. 5919 Freret St

Application: Demolition (through elevation) of a Contributing rated, 1-1/2 story, single-family, raised-basement residential building to create new habitable square footage.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that additional information related to the building damage can be submitted to Staff for review.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed:

### Comments:

#### C. <u>5430-32 Laurel St</u>

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building for a camelback addition.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

#### D. 5434-36 Laurel St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof of a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building for a camelback addition.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Ayo Love Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

### E. 223 Jane Pl

Application: Demolition of a Contributing but altered, two-story, mixed-use building to grade.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade with all salvageable materials being salvaged.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Stephine Bruno

**Result: Passed** 

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

## F. 2619 Calhoun St

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition to grade.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo

Love, Jennifer Greene

Opposed: Comments:

## G. 717 Peniston St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building for a camelback addition.

Motion: Suspend the rules to allow for more time to achieve a quorum.

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

Motion: Suspend the rules to allow for consideration of the application.

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Annie Clarke Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer

Greene, Anne Redd

Opposed: Comments:

## H. 530 S Scott St

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the existing roof structure of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Defer the application to allow the applicant to attend the next meeting.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo

Love, Jennifer Greene

Opposed: Comments:

#### IX. New Business Retention Applications

#### A. 1237 State St

Application: Retention of unpainted louvered shutters on a designated Landmark, two-story, single-family residential building in deviation of Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Allow the retention for 2 years, at such time the shutters need to be repainted with opaque paint.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Anne Redd Result: Failed

In favor: Stephanie Bruno, Lee Bressler, Donna Wakeman, Anne Redd Opposed: Annie Clark, Heather Szapary, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene

Comments:

Motion: Deny the retention.

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Annie Clark Result: Passed

In favor: Heather Szapary, Jennifer Greene, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Donna Wakeman, Ayo Love,

Jennie West, Lee Bressler Opposed: Anne Redd

Comments:

## B. <u>5025-27 Chartres St</u>

Application: Retention of installation of inappropriate wood-grained Hardie weatherboards on existing Contributing rated one-story, two-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness. Motion: Approve the request for retention of inappropriate wood-grained Hardie weatherboards installed at the left and right sides of the building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness with the proviso that the next time the weatherboards are requested for repair or replacement, they must be replaced with new wood or smooth finish Hardie weatherboards.

By: Heather Szapary Second: Lee Bressler Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo

Love, Jennifer Greene

Opposed: Comments:

## C. 2119-21 Chippewa St

Application: Retention of inappropriate windows and trim, inappropriate door and transom, inappropriate handrail, and non-constructed portions at a Non-Contributing, two-story, two-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the retention of the inappropriate windows with the proviso that exterior muntins be installed at visually prominent locations, approve the retention of the as constructed transom at recessed entry, deny the retention of the door at the recessed entry and replace it with a door similar to the approved drawings, and deny the retention of the non-constructed door opening and brick stair at the front façade with both to be constructed. The Commission noted that the opening at the front façade could be a blind opening or fixed shutters in front of a door.

By: Lee Bressler

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo

Love, Jennifer Greene

Opposed: Comments:

#### i. Retention of Demolition Applications under previous Fine Ordinance

a. 2220 Broadway St \*\*Application Withdrawn – This Item Was Not Heard\*\*

Application: Retention of demolition of more than 50% of the exterior walls of a Contributing rated, two-story, multi-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion:

By:

Second: Result: In Favor:

Opposed:

Comments:

## ii. Retention of Demolition Applications under new Fine Ordinance, Effective August 1, 2022

#### a. 8430 Apple St

Application: Retention of demolition of more than 50% of the wall structure and more than 25% of the historic materials on the primary façade of a Contributing rated, two-story commercial building in deviation of a building permit.

Motion: Grant the retention with a \$10,000 fine.

By: Lee Bressler Second: Annie Clark Result: Passed

In Favor: Jennie West, Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie

Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene

Opposed: Comments:

## b. <u>1218-24 Valmont St</u>, <u>5320 Perrier St</u>

Application: Retention of demolition to grade of portion of an existing Contributing rated two-story, single-family residential building required to be retained in deviation of a Certificate of

Appropriateness.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so the applicant may submit additional information and documentation irrefutably clarifying the timeline of demolition at the site. This documentation should include time-stamped photos and dated letters, as well as rain delay calendars from the site, per the Commission's request.

By: Stephanie Bruno Second: Ayo Love

Result:

In Favor: Jennie West, Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno, Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene

Opposed: Comments:

# X. Ratification of Architectural Committee and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, August 3, 2022, Meeting.

Motion: Approve the ratification of the ARC and Staff Actions since the Wednesday, August 3, 2022,

meeting.

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennie West, Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Lee Bressler, Heather Szapary, Stephanie Bruno,

Ayo Love, Jennifer Greene

Opposed: Comments: