

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission
Meeting Minutes

Date: March 1st, 2023

Location: City Council chamber, 1300 Perdido Street

Called to order: 1:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Jennie Cannon West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Stephanie Bruno

Commissioners absent: Lee Bressler, Ayo Love

I. Roll Call

II. Minutes of the March 1st, 2023, meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Jennie Cannon West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

III. Establish Illegal Demolition Fine Sub-Committee

By: Anne Redd

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Jennie Cannon West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

IV. Landmark Nomination of 1812 Moss St.

Motion: Establish 1812 Moss St. as a historic landmark

By:

Second:

Result: Failed

In favor:

Opposed:

Comments: Susan Johnson defended her nomination, Ron Loesel spoke in favor of it, Meg Allison and Robert Lynch spoke against it

V. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the consent agenda.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Annie Clark

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

VI. New Business Work Applications

A. 502 Frenchmen St.

Application: Appeal of ARC recommendation for denial of renovation of a Significant rated, three-story, mixed use building including demolition of the roof structure and construction of new rear addition.

Motion: Deny the request to appeal the ARC recommendation for denial because the existing roof form is still intact, is visible, and continues to read visually as a historic roof from several points in the surrounding public right of way. Additionally, the proposed amount of roof demolition is not considered appropriate based on the HDLC Guidelines and the Significant rating of the building.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments: Susan Johnson, Jefferey Seymour, Ann Cox Strub, Perry Bolse, Allen Johnson, and Nathan Lott spoke against this application.

B. 2127 Esplanade Ave.

Application: Appeal ARC recommendations for material details of the renovation of a Significant rated, 1-1/2 story, residential building.

Motion: Deny the appeal of the ARC recommendations.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Annie Clark

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments: Jennie Cannon West recused herself. Susan Johnson and Ron Loesel spoke against this application.

VII. Old Business Demolition Applications

A. 420 S Galvez St.

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, raised, two-story, two-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition to grade.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed: Lily McNee and Michael Merideth spoke in favor of this application; Susan Johnson spoke against it.

B. 2516 Upperline St.

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building to grade.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Lee Bressler

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jennie Cannon West

Opposed: Jason King

Comments: Mamina Turesano and Rob Cypher spoke in favor of this application; Ron Loesel spoke against it.

C. 6028 Benjamin St.

Application: Demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade on a Contributing rated, two-story, two-family residential building.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Annie Clark

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Jennie Cannon West

Opposed: Anne Redd

D. 4 Newcomb Blvd.

Application: Demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade and more than 50% of the roof structure of a Contributing rated, two-story, raised basement, single family building.

Motion: Approve the application for Demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade and more than 50% of the roof of a Contributing two-story, raised basement, single family building.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

E. 7224 Dominican St.

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the exterior wall structure at a Non-Contributing rated, three-story, education building.

Motion: Approve the application for Demolition of more than 50% of the exterior wall structure at a Non-Contributing, three-story, education building.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

VIII. New Business Demolition Applications

A. 1453 N Robertson St.

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family building to grade.

Motion: Grant approval of the demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family building to grade.

By: Jason King

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jennie Cannon West

Opposed: Stephanie Bruno

Comments: Lawrence H. Ketchens spoke in favor of this application.

- B. 431 Henry Clay Ave.
Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure and more than 50% of exterior wall structure of a Contributing rated, one-story, single family residential building.
Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting.
By: Stephanie Bruno
Second: Donna Wakeman
Result: Passed
In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd
Opposed:
- C. 8714 Jeanette St.
Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure and 50% exterior wall structure of a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.
Motion: No objection, provided that the setback is two original rooms from the front of the building. Work with staff to determine appropriate setback.
By: Annie Clark
Second: Greg Hackenberg
Result: Passed
In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd
Opposed:
- D. 2030 Octavia St.
Application: Demolition through elevation of a Contributing rated, one and a half story, two-family residential building.
Motion: Grant conceptual approval.
By: Stephanie Bruno
Second: Jason King
Result: Passed
In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd
Opposed:

IX. Old Business Retention Applications

- A. 1437 St Andrew St.
Application: Retention of tile cladding on front stairs on a Contributing rated, raised basement, multi-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
Motion: Allow the retention.
By: Stephanie Bruno
Second: Donna Wakeman
Result: At the time the Commission was unable to reach a majority decision, resulting in no action being taken on this application. The Commission's lack of action is considered a de facto denial, which can be appealed to the City Council.
In favor: Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Jason King, Anne Redd
Opposed: Jennifer Greene, Annie Clark, Heather Szapary, Jennie Cannon West
Comments: Greg Hackenberg recused himself. Lily McNee spoke in favor of this application.
- B. 1201 St Mary St.
Application: Retention of the demolition of three chimneys and removal of ridge tiles at a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the retention of the removal of three (3) chimneys with the proviso that ridge tiles should be reinstalled under 23-02978-HDLC.

By: Anne Redd

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

C. 1317 Ursulines Ave.

Application: This item was withdrawn.

X. New Business Retention Applications

A. 721 Seventh St.

Application: Retention of inappropriate windows and HVAC platforms at a Non-Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny the retention of the HVAC platforms.

Approve the retention of the inappropriate vinyl windows, except for the first two windows on the left elevation (1 on the first floor and 1 on the second floor), the first three windows on the right elevation (1 on the first floor and 2 on the second floor), and the four upper windows towards the rear of the right elevation (2 on the second floor and 2 on the third floor). These windows will need to be replaced with HDLC staff approved windows.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Heather Szapary

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

B. 3141 Laurel St.

Application: This application was withdrawn.

C. 4131 N Rampart St.

Application: Retention of removal of existing ridge caps and installation of inappropriate R-panel roof at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Grant retention of the installation of the inappropriate R-panel roofing with the proviso that the blue finish be refinished with a neutral color. The HDLC approves colors in neutral finishes (tans, grays, browns) or natural metallic finishes (bronze, silver, copper). The HDLC does not approve black, white, or non-neutral finishes.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

D. 2231 St Claude Ave.

Application: Retention of visually prominent roof-mounted HVAC units installed at a Non-Contributing rated, one-story commercial building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of visually prominent roof-mounted HVAC units with the proviso that the Certificate of Appropriateness for retention will not be issued until the applicant has verified the equipment as installed meets all Zoning and Safety and Permits requirements.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jennie Cannon West

Opposed:

Comments: Jason King temporarily absent. Ron Loesel spoke in favor of this application.

E. 2724 St Claude Ave.

Application: Retention of demolition of non-original rear lean-to, removal of one (1) masonry chimney, installation of new standing seam metal roofing and construction of new 655 SF rear addition at a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the request for retention of demolition of non-original rear lean-to for construction of new 655 SF rear addition, removal of masonry chimney, and removal of roof ridge tiles for installation of new standing seam metal roofing.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Stephanie Bruno

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

F. 4914-16 N Rampart St.

Application: Retention of installation of inappropriate vinyl windows and wood window trim at a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building installed in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the request for retention of inappropriate window units with the proviso that the surrounding wood trim and sills must be correctly replaced and that simple wood window screens be installed at the left and right-side windows to obscure their view from the street. The Commission also noted that applied exterior muntin grids would also be sufficient, in lieu of new wood screens. The Commission included an additional 90 days to complete this work, so the violation corrections should be completed at the property within 9 months after the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

G. 3069 Royal St.

Application: Retention of visually prominent conduit and accessory structure at rear yard installed at a Non-Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny retention of the visually prominent conduit and the rear yard accessory structure.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jennie Cannon West

Opposed: Jason King

H. 1003 Independence St.

Application: Retention of demolition of two (2) chimneys at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family

residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of two (2) demolished chimneys.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

I. 833 Jourdan Ave.

Application: Retention of the installation of inappropriate windows at a Contributing rated, two-story, two-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the retention of the installation of inappropriate windows at the side elevations.

Deny the retention of the installation of inappropriate windows at the primary façade.

By: Greg Hackenberg

Second: Jason King

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

J. 2509-2511 Dauphine St.

Application: This application was withdrawn.

K. 2123 Soniat St.

Application: Retention of partial roof, façade, and exterior wall demolition at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of partial roof, façade, and exterior wall demolition without a Certificate of Appropriateness and to levy a fine of \$5,000 for the unpermitted demolition.

By: Stephanie Bruno

Second:

Result: Failed due to lack of a second

Motion: Approve the application for retention of partial roof, façade, and exterior wall demolition without a Certificate of Appropriateness and to levy a fine of \$20,000 for the unpermitted demolition.

By: Heather Szapary

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd, Jennie Cannon West

Opposed: Stephanie Bruno

Comments:

L. 1024 St Anthony St.

Application: Retention of removal of one (1) masonry chimney and installation of inappropriate front entry door, transom, windows, and windowsills installed at right side elevation of a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the request to retain the removal of one masonry chimney and voted to deny the request to retain the removal and replacement of the front entry door trim, front entry door, oval-light transom, and two windows installed at the right-side elevation without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

By: Donna Wakeman

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King,

Heather Szapary, Anne Redd
Opposed:

M. 1837 State St.

Application: Retention of the demolition of more than the approved scope of work at a Contributing rated, 1-1/2 story, single-family residential building in deviation of a Certificate of appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the retention of the demolition of more than the approved scope of work in deviation of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

By: Anne Redd

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments: Adrienne Casbarian spoke in favor of this application; Susan Johnson spoke against it.

N. 610 David St.

Application: Retention of demolition through the collapse of a Contributing one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve the retention of the collapsed building and levy a fine of \$22,500 for the unpermitted demolition.

By: Jason King

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

Comments: Susan Johnson spoke against this application.

XI. Ratification of Architectural Review Committee and Staff Actions since the March 1st, 2023, Meeting.

Motion: Approve the ratification of the ARC and Staff Actions since the March 1st, 2023, meeting.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Donna Wakeman

Result: Passed

In favor: Greg Hackenberg, Donna Wakeman, Stephanie Bruno, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Jason King, Heather Szapary, Anne Redd

Opposed:

XII. HDLC REPORTS AND COMMUNICATIONS

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.