New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes

Date: August 2nd, 2023

Location: City Council chamber, 1300 Perdido Street

Called to order: 1:30 p.m.

Commissioners present: Jennie Cannon West, Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim

Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Commissioners absent: Lee Bressler, Ross Karson

I. Roll Call

II. Minutes of the June 7th, 2023, meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Anne Redd

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Opposed:

III. Election of Officers

Chair

Motion: Elect Jennie Cannon West

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Anne Redd Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Opposed:

Vice-Chair

Motion: Elect Jason King By: Jennifer Greene Second: Annie Clark Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jennie

Cannon West Opposed:

IV. Appointment of ARC Members

Motion: Ratify appointment of John Klingman, Tracie Ashe, Beth Jacob, Cynthia Dubberley, and Amanda

Rivera

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Shawanda Poree

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King Opposed:

V. CLG Review of 1661 Canal St.

Motion: Recommend 1661 Canal Street for listing on the National Register of Historic Places.

By: Jason King Second: Annie Clark Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Opposed:

VI. Landmark Nomination of 1623 Pine Street

Motion: By: Second:

Result: no motion was taken.

In favor: Opposed:

Comments: Susan Johnson spoke in favor of this nomination.

VII. Landmark Nomination of 820 N White Street

Motion: Nominate 820 N White St for designation as a local historic landmark.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Annie Clark Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Opposed:

Comments: Sandra Stokes, Benny Harrell, and Allen Johnson spoke in favor of this nomination.

VIII. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the Consent agenda.

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Opposed:

IX. New Business Work Applications

A. 502 Frenchmen St.

Application: Appeal of ARC denial of request for demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure to accommodate new third-floor roof forms and construction of new rear addition at an existing Significant rated three-story, mixed-use building.

Motion: Defer action on this application so the applicant could have additional time to reconsider the proposed third-floor roof alterations and to provide updated drawings reflecting a significant reduction in the overall amount of roof demolition for additional ARC review.

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King

Opposed:

Comments: Chandler Patten and Charles Ward spoke in favor of this application. Susan Johnson, Perry Dolce, Allen Johnson, and Sandra Stokes spoke against it.

B. 1221 Carondelet St.

Application: Installation of visually prominent roof-mounted solar panels at a Landmark, single-family, residential building.

Motion: Grant conceptual approval of Option 2, with the proviso that the panels are set back an addition 5′-0″ or two panel widths from the front wall of the building.

By: Jason King

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King Opposed:

C. 3643 Camp St.

Application: Appeal ARC deferral of the construction of a two-story addition and renovation of Landmark, two-story, residential building.

Motion: At that time the Commission voted to:

Defer the application of the appeal of the ARC deferral, so that the applicant can continue to work with the ARC to find an approvable solution to a proposed addition. The committee found the following to be problematic and these items should be addressed in revision:

- Scale of the proposed addition
- The similarity of detail to the original building
- Materiality
- Awkwardness of the deck
- Visible mechanical equipment

By: Tim Lupin

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King Opposed:

D. 1627 Philip St.

Application: Demolition of a Non-Contributing rated, two-story, multi-family residential building for new construction of a 4,750 SF 2-1/2-story single-family residential building.

Motion: Grant conceptual approval with the final details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Anne Redd

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King Opposed:

E. 2710 Chestnut St.

Application: Demolition of a Non-Contributing rated one-story, single-family residential building for new construction of a 1,875 SF two-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Grant conceptual approval with the final details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Anne Redd Second: Jason King Result: Passed In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King Opposed:

Comments: Nicole Webre spoke in favor of this application.

F. <u>1518 Terpsichore St.</u>

Application: Demolition of a Non-Contributing rated, 1376 SQFT accessory structure to grade and retention of the partial demolition of an accessory building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of demolition without a Certificate of Appropriateness and to levy a fine of \$3,000 for the unpermitted demolition.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King Opposed:

X. New Business Demolitions Applications

A. 3600-3602 Saint Charles Ave.

Application: Demolition of Non-Contributing rated, two-story, commercial building to grade.

Motion: Approve the application for demolition.

By: Tim Lupin Second: Anne Redd Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King Opposed:

B. <u>7716-7718 Colapissa St.</u>

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, two-family, raised-basement residential building to grade.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition.

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King Opposed:

Comments: Nathan Lott spoke on this application. Kenneth Gowland spoke in favor of it.

C. <u>3012-3014 Lowerline St.</u>

 $Application: Demolition \ of \ a \ Contributing \ rated, two-family, \ raised-basement \ residential \ building \ to \ grade.$

Motion: Deny the application for demolition.

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

Opposed:

Comments: Kenneth Gowland and Scott Whittaker spoke in favor of this application.

D. <u>3016-3018 Lowerline St.</u>

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, two-family, raised-basement residential building to grade.

Motion: Deny the application for demolition.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King Opposed:

Comments: Kenneth Gowland and Scott Whittaker spoke in favor of this application.

E. 634 Bartholomew St.

Application: Demolition of a Non-Contributing rated, one-story, commercial building to grade.

Motion: Approve the demolition to grade with the proviso that redevelopment plans be submitted prior to the issuance of a demolition permit.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King Opposed:

F. 4523 S Liberty St.

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the roof structure on a Non-Contributing rated, single-family building.

Motion: Approve the application for 100% roof demolition.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

Opposed:

G. 1829 Leonidas St.

Application: Demolition of a Contributing rated, one-story, religious building to grade.

Motion: Defer action on this application until the next Commission meeting so that further research can be done on the building history.

By: Jason King

Second: Shawanda Poree

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King Opposed:

Comments: John Linnes spoke on this application.

H. 918-920 Saint Roch Ave.

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of the existing roof structure of a Non-Contributing rated, one-story rear accessory building to alter the roof form for increased slope and drainage.

Motion: Approve the application for partial roof demolition.

By: Annie Clark

Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King

Opposed:

3020 De Soto St.

Application: Demolition of more than 50% of existing roof structure for construction of a new addition at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building.

Motion: Approve your application for partial roof demolition.

By: Shawanda Poree Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason

King Opposed:

XI. Old Business Retention Applications

A. 425 Eliza St.

Application: Retention of removal of existing side elevation windows, installation of inappropriate flush-mounted vinyl windows, inappropriate siding infill between piers at raised basement area, removal of front façade doors, sidelites, and transoms, and installation of inappropriate doors, sidelites, and transoms at a Contributing rated, raised basement, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve retention of several items and deny retention of others. Please refer to the list below for specific retention items.

- Approve retention of siding infill in between piers at the basement level.
- Deny retention of the first two (2) 9/6 vinyl windows at each side elevation (a total of four (4) windows) and approve the retention of three (3) vinyl windows and the removal of one (1) existing window.
- Approve the retention of existing casement windows at the basement level and the installation of inappropriate vinyl replacement windows with the proviso that 7' vertical board wood fencing be installed at each of the side elevation alleys.
- Approve the retention of the removal of the existing doors and sidelites and the installation of new doors and sidelites with the proviso that new transoms and associated trim be installed to match the previous transom condition.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Shawanda Poree

Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King Opposed:

B. 5200 Saint Charles Ave.

Application: Retention of highly visible inappropriate conduit at a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the retention of the conduit size, material, and configuration, provided the excess wires are removed from beneath and the conduit is properly primed with a PVC-compatible primer and painted to match the house.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King Opposed:

New Business Retention Applications

A. 7613 Hampson St.

XII.

Application: Retention of the demolition of more than 25% of the primary facade at a Contributing rated, two-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of demolition without a Certificate of Appropriateness and to levy a fine of \$3,000 for the unpermitted demolition.

By: Tim Lupin Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In favor: Annie Clark, Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Opposed:

Comments: Annie Clark excused herself before this motion. Susan Johnson spoke against this application.

B. 530 Pelican Ave.

Application: Retention of demolition of more than 25% of the front facade of a Contributing rated, one-story church building.

Motion: Approve the retention of the wall demolition and levy no fine.

By: Shawanda Poree Second: Tim Lupin Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Opposed:

J. 1013-1015 Touro St.

Application: Retention of installation of rear deck at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of the rear deck with the proviso that the existing guardrails are replaced with something more appropriate and compatible with the existing historic building, such as new parapet walls, for example.

By: Tim Lupin

Second: Shawanda Poree

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Opposed:

K. 1239 Congress St.

Application: Retention of removal of louvered shutters at a Contributing rated, one-story, single-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the retention of the removed louvered shutters at side elevations.

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Jason King Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Opposed:

L. 805 Jackson Ave.

Application: Retention of the installation of an inappropriate roof at a Contributing rated, one-story, two-family residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of the installation of an inappropriate roofing material.

By: Jennifer Greene Second: Anne Redd Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Opposed:

M. 518 Verret St.

Application: Retention of the removal of English-V ridge tiles and installation of inappropriate door and sidelites at a Contributing rated, raised basement, residential building without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Approve the retention of the removed English-V ridge tiles, approve the retention of the sidelites, and deny the retention of the inappropriate door.

By: Shawanda Poree Second: Greg Hackenberg

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Opposed:

XIII. Ratification of Architectural Review Committee and Staff Actions since the June 7th, 2023, Meeting.

Motion: Approve the ratification of the ARC and Staff Actions since the June 7th, 2023, meeting.

By: Greg Hackenberg Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Opposed:

XIV. HDLC Reports and Communications

A. <u>Update to the HDLC Rules, Policies, and Procedures regarding Quorum Requirements</u>

Motion: Verify that all commissioners and public understand the new understanding of the quorum requirements.

By: Anne Redd

Second: Jennifer Greene

Result: Passed

In favor: Jennifer Greene, Anne Redd, Shawanda Poree, Tim Lupin, Greg Hackenberg, Jason King

Opposed:

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.