

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes

Date: December 12, 2013

Location: City Council Chamber, 1300 Perdido Street,

Called to order: 1:00 p.m.

Adjourned: 4:15 p.m.

Commissioners present: Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Stephen Peychaud, John Deveney, Jason Stopa, Matthew Lindsay, Heather Szapary, Alonzo Knox, Jesse LeBlanc

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting:

Commissioners absent: Karen Coaxum

I. Minutes

A. November 14, 2013 Meeting

Motion: Approve the minutes.

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Ed de Montluzin

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

II. Consent Agenda

A. 407 Tricou St: Justin Kearns, applicant/owner; Construction of a new single family residential building.

B. 2304-2306 Carondelet St: Dave Davis, applicant; Mcdonald Living Trust Rory, owner; Construction of two-story, single family residence on vacant lot.

C. 2619-2621 St Thomas St: LLC Terrell Fabacher Architects, applicant; Firstbank Assets, LLC, owner; Construct two-story, single-family residence on existing vacant lot.

D. 2623-2625 St Thomas St: LLC Terrell Fabacher Architects, applicant; Firstbank Assets, LLC, owner; Construct two-story, single-family residence on existing vacant lot.

E. 2627-2629 St Thomas St: LLC Terrell Fabacher Architects, applicant; Firstbank Assets, LLC, owner; Construct two-story, single-family residence on existing vacant lot.

- F. 2330-2332 St Thomas St: Revitalize Development, LLC, applicant; Housing Initiative Galilee, Galilee Housing Initiative & Community, owner; Reconstruction of building.
- G. 1200 Bartholomew St: Brad Spencer, applicant; 1200 Bartholomew, LLC, owner; New construction of a single-story, single family residential building.
- H. 1121 1St St: Bill Plunkett, applicant; William M Jr Plunkett, owner; Construct new 630 sf accessory building.
- I. 729 Lizardi St: Willie Gant, applicant/owner; Reconstruction of a single family residential building.
- J. 1511 Basin Street: Rick Fifield, applicant; Betty R Fortin, owner; Construction of 3,780 sq. ft. covered parking garage.

Motion: Suspend the rules.
By: Stephen Peychaud
Seconded: Jason Stopa
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

Motion: Remove Item II. J from the Consent Agenda.
By: Stephen Peychaud
Seconded: Jason Stopa
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

Motion: Reinstate the Rules.
By: Stephen Peychaud
Seconded: Jason Stopa
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda.
By: Calvin Alexander
Seconded: Greg Hackenberg
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

The Commission then took up item II J.

J. 1511 Basin Street

Application: Construction of 3,780 sq.ft. covered parking garage.

Motion: Defer application for sixty days to allow time for the neighborhood association to review the proposal.

By: Stephen Peychaud

Seconded: John Deveney

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

III. Old Business Work Applications

A. 1400 Camp Street

Application: Replace all existing wood windows with aluminum clad windows. *Review Only*

Motion: Recommend against the replacement of the original wood windows with aluminum clad windows.

By: John Deveney

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments: The Coliseum Square Association appeared and stated their opposition to the removal of the wood windows.

B. 1312-14 Gov Nicholls Street

Application: Reconstruction of two buildings.

Motion: Conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Stephen Paychaud

Seconded: Jason Stopa

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Stephen Peychaud, John Deveney, Jason Stopa, Matthew Lindsay, Heather Szapary

Opposed: Alonzo Knox

Comments:

C. 1316-18 Gov Nicholls Street

Application: Reconstruction of two buildings.

Motion: Conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Stephen Paychaud

Seconded: Jason Stopa

Result: Passed

In favor: Ed deMontluzin, Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Greg Hackenberg, Stephen Peychaud, John Deveney, Jason Stopa, Matthew Lindsay, Heather Szapary

Opposed: Alonzo Knox

Comments:

At this time, John Deveney left the meeting.

IV. New Business Work Applications

A. 1329 Jackson Avenue

Application: Appeal of ARC recommendation regarding removal of window to install new door with transom.

Motion: Defer application thirty days to allow the applicant the opportunity to meet with the Fire Marshall.

By: Alonzo Knox

Seconded: Jason Stopa

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 531-33 Belleville Street

Application: Replace ten existing, 6/6, double-hung, wood windows at side elevations with 6/6 vinyl windows.

Motion: Deny Application

By: Heather Szapary

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 2733 Esplanade Avenue

Application: Replacement of wood windows with aluminum windows. *Review Only*

Motion: Recommend against the replacement of the original wood windows with vinyl windows.

By: Alonzo Knox

Seconded: Stephen Peychaud

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 3131-33 Dauphine Street

Application: Appeal of staff recommendation regarding the installation of batten shutters.

Motion: Deny application

By: Jason Stopa

Seconded: Stephen Peychaud

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 1601 Basin Street

Application: This item was withdrawn

V. Old Business Demolition Applications

A. 1824 Sophie Wright Place

Application: Demolition of building.

Motion: Deny Application

By: Alonzo Knox

Seconded: Jason Stopa

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments: The Coliseum Square Association stated their opposition to the demolition.

Motion: Require owner to stabilize the overhang.

By: Marlene Jaffe

Seconded: Stephen Peychaud

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

VI. New Business Demolition Applications

A. 2816 Burgundy Street

Application: Demolition of structure and construction of new building.

Motion: Allow the demolition and conceptual approval of the new construction with the details to be worked out at the staff level.

By: Alonzo Knox

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 1534 Piety Street

Application: Demolition of an existing building.

Motion: Deny Application

By: Jason Stopa

Seconded: Stephen Peychaud

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

VII. Old Business Retention Applications

A. 1239 Desire Street

Application: Retention of removal of ridge tiles and retention of inappropriate batten shutters. Work done without a CofA.

Motion: Deny application.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Jasin Stopa

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

B. 1401 LaHarpe Street

Application: Retention of wood grained Hardi Plank installed in deviation of the Certificate of Appropriateness, Retention of two storm doors at front elevation and turned wood posts and railings at rear of structure installed without a CofA.

Motion: Approve the application for retention of the wood-grained Hardiplank siding, but deny retention of the storm doors at the front elevation and the inappropriate turned columns at the rear of the property. The Commission gave you ninety (90) days to correct the violations.

By: Stephen Peychaud

Seconded: Ed deMontluzin

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

VIII. New Business Retention Applications

A. 933 N. Villere Street

Application: Retention of an inappropriate metal security door.

Motion: Deny Retention and allow six months to make the corrections.

By: Stephen Peychaud

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

B. 3620 Canal Street

Application: Retention of pergola constructed without a Cof A.

Motion: Deny retention and allow six months for corrections to be made.

By: Alonzo Knox

Seconded: Stephen Peychaud

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 6324 Dauphine Street

Application: Retention of inappropriate z style shutters.

Motion: Deny retention.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:

D. 1450 Marais Street

Application: Retention of 4/4 windows installed at side elevations in deviation of CofA.
Motion: Approve the application for retention of the 4/4 windows, but deny retention of the inappropriate window trim. The Commission granted you ninety (90) days to correct the violations.

By: Stephen Peychaud
Seconded: Alonzo Knox
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

E. 3016 Laurel Street

Application: Retention of work done without Certificate of Appropriateness, including construction of camelback addition with inappropriate roof line and inappropriate windows on front facade, removal of 6/6 wood windows and installation of 1/1 vinyl windows at left side elevation, resizing of existing window opening, and installation of new window openings with 1/1 vinyl windows at right side elevation.

Motion: Approve retention of the camelback addition and installation of 1/1 vinyl windows, provided the following corrective work is completed in addition to the work previously agreed to:

- The roof of the camelback is hipped, as recommended by ARC.
- The two (2) windows on the front elevation of the camel back addition are replaced with appropriate windows, as determined by the Staff. The Commission voted to overrule the ARC recommendation to modify the size of the window, and allow retention of the existing window opening.
- The aprons are removed from the window trim at the new windows, and the appropriate window sill is installed.
- An appropriate 7'-0" privacy gate is installed at the left side of the building to mitigate the view of the windows.

By: Greg Hackenberg
Seconded: Alonzo Knox
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

F. 1436 N Villere Street

Application: Retention of roof mounted AC unit installed without CofA; Retention of removal of ridge tiles, ½ round gutters, downspouts and shutters.

Motion: Allow retention of the AC unit in its current location, but voted to deny retention of the inappropriate doors. The Commission also voted that ridge tiles and half-round gutters and downspouts must be re-installed. The Commission granted six (6) months to correct the violations.

By: Stephen Peychaud
Seconded: Jason Stopa
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:

G. 5121 Douglas Street

Application: This item was withdrawn.

H. 1527 Orleans Avenue

Application: Retention of vinyl siding and modification of existing openings to accommodate vinyl windows, all performed without a CofA.

Motion: Allow retention of the vinyl siding, but denied retention of the removal of wood windows, modification of window openings, and installation of vinyl windows. The Commission granted three (3) months to correct the violations.

By: Alonzo Knox

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments

I. 926 N. Robertson Street

Application: Retention of surface mounted windows and removal of ½ round gutters.

Motion: Defer matter to January meeting.

By: Stephen Peychaud

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments

IX. HDLC Reports and Communications

A. Adoption of 2014 Meeting Dates and Deadlines

By: Jason Stopa

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments

There being no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned.