

New Orleans Historic District Landmarks Commission Meeting Minutes

Date: July 18, 2013

Location: City Council Chamber, 1300 Perdido Street

Called to order: 9:30 a.m.

Adjourned: 1:50 p.m.

Commissioners present Sonny Shields, Calvin Alexander, Marlene Jaffe, Jason Stopa, Stephen Peychaud, Ed deMontluzin, John Deveney

Commissioners arriving after beginning of the meeting: Alonzo Knox

Commissioners absent: Jesse LeBlanc, Damon Burns, Tim Armstrong, Karen Coaxum, Greg Hackenberg.

I. Minutes of 6/13/13 Meeting

Motion: Approve the Minutes.

By: Sonny Shields

Seconded: Stephen Peychaud

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, Alonzo Knox arrived.

II. Consent Agenda

Motion: Approve the Consent Agenda.

By: Stephen Peychaud

Seconded: Ed deMontluzin

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

III. Old Business Retention Applications (from June 13, 2013 meeting)

A. 1455-57 N. Villere Street

Application: Retention of inappropriately sized front doors and inappropriate vinyl siding.

Motion: Defer application.

By: Stephen Peychaud

Seconded: Ed deMontluzin

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:
Comments:

B. 2824-2826 St. Claude Avenue

Application: Retention of addition to building connecting it to adjacent building, inappropriate metal gates, addition of door and two windows at rear gable, two highly visible skylights, demolition of rear shed and construction of rear porch, mural at rear gable, and "treehouse" structure at rear yard.

Motion: Approve the retention of the addition connecting the two buildings, as well as the demolition of the rear lean-to addition and construction of rear porch, provided the work is modified in accordance with ARC recommendations; denial of the retention of the skylights, gates, and "treehouse".

By: John Deveney
Seconded: Alonzo Knox
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

C. 901 2nd Street

Application: Retention of inappropriately sized, 9/9, single hung, vinyl windows with internal muntins installed in deviation of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Motion: Deny retention of windows at the front elevation and allow retention of the windows at the side elevations provided wood screens are installed.

By: Ed deMontluzin
Seconded: Calvin Alexander
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

D. 1033 Port Street

Application: Retention of removal of 6/6 wood windows and installation of 1/1 vinyl windows.

Motion: Allow retention provided wood screens are installed.

By: Ed de Montluzin
Seconded: Stephen Peychaud
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

E. 1344 Camp Street

Application: This item was withdrawn.

F. 1521 Annunciation Street

Application: This item was withdrawn.

IV. New Business Landmark Nominations

A. Xavier University Preparatory School Campus

- 5116 Magazine Street
- 5201 Constance Street/818 Dufossat Street
- 5102 Constance Street

Motion: Defer matter to August meeting.

By: Stephen Peychaud

Seconded: Alonzo Knox

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

V. Old Business Work Applications

A. 813-15 Spain Street

Application: Appeal of Staff recommendation regarding installation of inappropriate storm doors at one window and two door openings on front elevation.

Motion: Approve the installation of the Phantom Screen doors as a test case in order to evaluate the appropriateness of this product for use in local historic districts.

By: John Deveney

Seconded: Calvin Alexander

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

The Commission then voted to suspend the rules and reconsider Item III. A.

A. 1455-57 N. Villere Street

Application: Retention of inappropriately sized front doors and inappropriate vinyl siding.

Motion: Deny doors and allow one year to replace them and allow retention of vinyl siding on the side elevation.

By: Stephen Peychaud

Seconded: Ed deMontluzin

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

At this time, John Deveney left the meeting.

VI. New Business Work Applications

A. 1400 Camp Street

Application: Installation of modular classroom buildings. (COMMISSION REVIEW ONLY)

Motion: The Commission requested that ISL perform the items outlined by the Neighborhood Association including the following:

- that the existing unsightly barbed wire-topped, chain linked fence facing Magazine and Terpsichore Streets be removed and replaced with fencing that meets HDLC guidelines.
- that American holly trees with eight foot minimum height be planted at 15 foot intervals inside the Magazine St. fence line so as to soften the view from street level of the modulars.
- that rainwater run-off from the modular buildings' roofs be retained onsite. (There is currently a severe problem with dirt running off the ISL property, covering sidewalks and clogging storm drains. We do not want this problem exacerbated by the modular classroom project)."

The Commission requested that the ISL comply with the recommendations by the end of the 2013 calendar year.

B. 3313-15 Laurel Street

Application: Replace existing wood windows at side elevations with new vinyl windows.

Motion: Defer matter to the August meeting.

By: Alonzo Knox

Seconded: Stephen Peychaud

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

C. 722 8th Street

Application: Appeal of Staff recommendation regarding installation of inappropriate storm shutters.

Motion: Defer matter to August meeting. Applicant shall furnish the HDLC staff with the FEMA regulations regarding storm shutters.

By: Alonzo Knox

Seconded: Stephen Peychaud.

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

D. 3123 Chippewa Street

Application: Appeal of Staff recommendation regarding installation of horizontal board fence instead of vegetation screen past front façade of building.

Motion: Approve application with a fence height of 5'-0" feet.

By: Stephen Peychaud

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 418-20 Homer Street

Application: Elevate existing building 2'-1" to a total finish floor height of 5'-0".

Motion: Approve application with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Alonzo Knox
Seconded: Sonny Shields
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

F. 3202 Magazine Street

Application: This item was withdrawn.

G. 518-20 Slidell Street

Application: Appeal of ARC recommendations regarding construction of one story addition and side porch.

Motion: Deny application and approve proposal with ARC recommendations and the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Alonzo Knox
Seconded: Stephen Peychaud
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

VI. New Business Work Applications – Solar Panels

A. 3816 Urquhart Street

Application: Installation of solar panels on a highly visible roof without a CofA.

Motion: Allow installation of black on black panels.

By: Stephen Peychaud
Seconded: Calvin Alexander
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

B. 710 Lizardi Street

Application: Installation of solar panels on highly visible roof.

Motion: Defer matter until after Special Meeting on HDLC Solar Panel Guidelines.

By: Calvin Alexander
Seconded: Stephen Peychaud
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

C. 418 Tricou

Application: Installation of solar panels on highly visible roof.

Motion: Defer matter until after Special Meeting on HDLC Solar Panel Guidelines.

By: Calvin Alexander
Seconded: Marlene Jaffe
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

D. 1418 Louisa Street

Application: Installation of solar panels on highly visible roof.

Motion: Defer matter until after Special Meeting on HDLC Solar Panel Guidelines.

By: Ed de Montluzin

Seconded: Stephen Peychaud

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

E. 5700 Burgundy Street

Application: Installation of solar panels on highly visible roof.

Motion: Allow installation provided the panels are installed 18' - 20' from the front wall of the building and are black on black panels with full coverage.

By: Calvin Alexander

Seconded: Stephen Peychaud

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

F. 2723 St. Thomas Street

Application: This item was withdrawn

G. 1347 Moss Street

Application: Installation of solar panels on a designated landmark.

Motion: Conceptual approval with the details to be worked out at the Staff level.

By: Alonzo Knox

Seconded: Marlene Jaffe

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

H. 900 Louisa Street

Application: Installation of solar panels on highly visible roof.

Motion: Defer matter until after Special Meeting on HDLC Solar Panel Guidelines.

By: Stephen Peychaud

Seconded: Alonzo Knox

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous

Opposed:

Comments:

VIII. Old Business Demolition Application

A. 2647 St. Ann Street

Application: Demolition of building.

Motion: Defer matter to August Meeting.

By: Stephen Peychaud

Seconded: Sonny Shields

Result: Passed

In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

IX. New Business Demolition Application

A. 2200 Dumaine Street

Application: Demolition of building
Motion: Defer action on this application for 30-days to allow time for the development of fencing and landscaping plans for the proposed parking lot.
By: Alonzo Knox
Seconded: Marlene Jaffe
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

X. New Business Retention Applications

A. 1035 Marigny Street

Application: Retention of change in roof form at a secondary building from flat to gable end and installation of solar panels less than 10'-0" from the front façade of the building.
Motion: Approve application.
By: Alonzo Knox
Seconded: Marlene Jaffe
Result: Passed
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

B. 1130 Thalia Street

Application: Retention of patio cover installed without a CofA.
Motion: Defer matter to August Meeting
By: Sonny Shields
Seconded: Stephen Peychaud
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

C. 805-07 Mandeville Street

Application: Retention of partial demolition of existing shed and construction of split level deck without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
Motion: Defer matter to August meeting.
By: Alonzo Knox
Seconded: Stephen Peychaud
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:

- D. 1008 Race Street
Application: Retention of removal of existing Chinese cap vents without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
Motion: Defer matter to August meeting.
By: Stephen Peychaud
Seconded: Alonzo Knox
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:
- D. 1130 Thalia Street
Application: Retention of patio cover installed without a CofA.
Motion: Defer matter to August Meeting.
By: Sonny Shields
Seconded: Stephen Peychaud
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:
- E. 509 6th Street
Application: Retention of metal bermuda shutters and metal storm door installed at front elevation and surface mounted, metal louvered shutters at side elevation.
Motion: Approve the retention of the shutters at the side elevations as installed and deny the retention of the storm door and Bermuda shutter at the front elevation.
By: Stephen Peychaud
Seconded: Alonzo Knox
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments:
- F. 3610 St. Claude Avenue
Application: Retention of inappropriate, pre-fabricated carport installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
Motion: Allow retention for a period of six months provided it is relocated on the property to a less visible location.
By: Stephen Peychaud
Seconded: Alonzo Knox
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments
- G. 1214 Piety Street
Application: Retention of inappropriate gate installed without a Certificate of Appropriateness.
Motion: Defer matter for thirty days.
By: Stephen Peychaud
Seconded: Alonzo Knox
In favor: Unanimous
Opposed:
Comments

At this time, due to the loss of quorum and the need to vacate the City Council Chamber, The Commission meeting was adjourned. The Commission instructed the Staff to place the unaddressed July items first on the August agenda.